EDITORIAL POLICY AND MANUSCRIPT SPECIFICATIONS

1. The *Journal of Public Administration* is a quarterly journal issued on behalf of the South African Association of Public Administration and Management (SAAPAM).

2. The purpose of the *Journal* is to further the understanding of the theory and practice of Public Administration and Management by publishing articles of interest to practitioners and scholars in English.

3. The *Journal* publishes peer-reviewed articles, review articles, case studies, exemplar profiles, viewpoints and research results from practitioners of all grades and professions, academics and other specialists on the broad spectrum of administrative concerns regarding local, provincial, national, and international affairs.

4. All manuscripts are circulated anonymously to specialist referees for evaluation. Reports from referees may be made available to authors but the names of the referees will be withheld. On the basis of the referees `reports, content and other deficiencies, the Editor reserves the right to make minor alterations or to reject any manuscript.

5. Copyright of articles published in the *Journal* vests in SAAPAM and may not be published or reproduced in any form without the prior consent of the Chief Editor.

6. Warning: infringement of copyright exposes offenders to criminal proceedings that could result in civil actions and/or a fine/imprisonment and a criminal record. Therefore, authors are advised to acknowledge the origin of any content in an article or other contribution obtained from another source.

7. Reprints of articles can be obtained from the Editor on the payment of a prescribed Fee.

8. Opinions expressed in the *Journal* are, however, those of the individual authors, and are not necessarily subscribed to by the Editor, Editorial Committee or the Editorial Board.

9. Authors are required to pay a fee of R500-00 per page for any article or research results printed in the *Journal*. Payment is due on receiving confirmation from the Editor that a contribution is to be published in a particular issue of the Journal. Authors should consult their respective faculties or employer to establish the responsibility for the payment. An article will only be published once payment has been received. Payment should be made directly to the *Journal of Public Administration*, but proof of payment must also be submitted to the Editor to avoid any possible delay in the publication of a contribution.

10. Except in special cases where prior permission has been obtained, articles should not exceed 5000 words. Prospective contributors are specifically requested to ensure that the language and technical aspects of their contributions are of high standard. THREE identical copies of manuscript, typed in 1.5 line spacing, 12pt Times New Roman should be submitted. A disk should also be submitted. Each manuscript should be accompanied by an English abstract of up to 200 words. Since manuscripts are circulated anonymously for evaluation, the name and affiliation of the author(s) should appear on the separate page. If the manuscript is accepted, a computer disk with the text, preferably in MS Word or WordPerfect must be sent to the Editor, unless the Chief Editor grants special permission in exceptional instances.

11. All manuscripts must be accompanied by a covering letter in which the author(s) state(s) that the manuscript has not been submitted or will not be submitted or published or is not being published elsewhere in any form unless rejected by the Editor of the *Journal of Public Administration*.
South African Association of Public Administration and Management (SAAPAM)
Registration Number 039-162 NPO

MEMBERSHIP APPLICATION

Membership categories and annual subscription fees payable before/on 30 April:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Pro Rata Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Member</td>
<td>R350-00</td>
<td>R30-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Member</td>
<td>R150-00</td>
<td>R15-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Member (5-9 Members)</td>
<td>R1 000-00</td>
<td>R85-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Member (11+ Members)</td>
<td>R5 000-00</td>
<td>R425-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Member</td>
<td>R400-00</td>
<td>R35-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Member</td>
<td>US $100-00</td>
<td>US $10-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Corporate Member (5-9 Members)</td>
<td>US $550-00</td>
<td>US $50-00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Institutional Member (11+ Members)</td>
<td>US $2 750-00</td>
<td>US $250-00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please complete the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First names</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postal Address</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cellular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specific areas of interest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Administration and Management Theory</th>
<th>Public Administration and Management History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy Analysis and Management</td>
<td>Organisational Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Management</td>
<td>Project Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
<td>Financial Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Management</td>
<td>International Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergovernmental Relations</td>
<td>Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>Development Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others (please specify)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Signature of Application ___________________________ Date ____________

Subscription deposited directly in Standard Bank Cheque Account Number 012580015, Hatfield Branch Code Number 01-15-45-15. Completed application and proof of payment faxed to +27 12 382 9042 or mailed to SAAPAM, PO Box 14257, Hatfield 0028, South Africa. For additional information please contact Mr Vukosi Mathonsi at (012) 382 9769 or SAAPAM@tut.ac.za.

Membership Number (for official use only)
WHEN LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE MATTER? 693
K. Phago

MODERN SCIENCE FOR GOVERNANCE IN THE DEMOCRATIC SOUTH AFRICA: ATTEMPTS TO BREATH LIFE IN THE ELEPHANT’S CARCASS 697
N. Nkuna & M.P. Sebola

IN SEARCH OF AN ANALYTICAL EVALUATION FRAMEWORK TO MEET THE NEEDS OF GOVERNANCE 715
C.J. Auriacombe

LONGITUDINAL ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA’S PERFORMANCE ON THE MO IBRAHIM INDEX OF AFRICAN GOVERNANCE 730
M.O. Dassah

ROLE OF LEADERSHIP IN CREATING COMMITMENT IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE 751
M.J. Mafunisa

EMPOWERING WOMEN COUNCILLORS THROUGH A LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME 764
Z. Mpehle & M. Kanjere

NETWORK GOVERNANCE FOR SERVICE DELIVERY: LESSONS FROM SOUTH AFRICA AND UGANDA 774
B.C. Mubangizi, Z.F. Nhlabathi & R. Namara

THE IMPACT OF MENTORING ON LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOUR 796
J. Weimers, C. Gwandure & T. Mayekiso

MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEMS FOR ENHANCING GOVERNANCE AND GOVERNMENT LEGITIMACY IN SOUTH AFRICA 811
I.G. Govender
CAPACITY BUILDING FOR EFFECTIVE LOCAL GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE
Z. Gqamane & J.D. Taylor

PERCEPTIONS OF ORGANISATIONAL INCENTIVE SCHEMES AND CONTINUANCE COMMITMENT IN TALENT MANAGEMENT AMONG FINAL YEAR UNIVERSITY STUDENTS
S. Mlilo, C. Gwandure & T. Mayekiso

SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT: ASSESSING THE NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY
E. Draai & O. Oshoniyi

STAFF RETENTION IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS: A CASE OF SELECTED SOUTH AFRICAN UNIVERSITIES
R.S. Masango & M. Mpofu
The question of leadership and governance are broad and often intricate to fathom with precision and certainty. This is especially true in a public sphere where there are many actors who offer antithetic interests to the society. For example, an establishment of the Organisation of African Unity (OAU), which later evolved to become the African Union (AU) has been attempting to pontificate the epistle of Africa and its people to translate their leadership and governance errands into refulgent prospects. This has been happening for decades with the resultant decolonisation agenda and subsequently with South Africa obtaining freedom from the shackles of its apartheid system. These systems (colonisation and apartheid) did not only dehumanise people, but treated them as if they did not exist in all the societal spheres, including in government.

Africa’s leadership and governance credentials and track record when judged on the basis of the human rights dispensation of the modern global society are found wanting. However, Adebayo Adedeji (1975) reckons that Africa is not expected to have ‘self-pity’ but is required to be ‘masters of their own houses’ in terms of their future development. Five years later after his assertions, when Adedeji (1980) delivered a lecture in Canada, he questioned whether Africa is a ‘permanent underdog’ in this divided world and inequitable or unjust economy? An obvious observation on the conditions of living for Africans in Africa should confirm that 34 years later, Adedeji’s questions remain valid and relevant, especially to the sub-Saharan countries. In essence, it means that Africans have not been able to address their development challenges for over five decades since their liberation during the 1960s. This raises fundamental and basic questions such as:

Whether Africans are able to look at each other in the eye and indicate their commitment and honest contributions in changing the plight of Africans as demonstrated by the daily struggles in the continent such as lack of basic services?

Do we, as Africans, have functional and accountable institutions that are able to convincingly report back to relevant constituencies on the use of public resources?

What happens between election periods when governing political parties are entrusted to serve the needs of the African populations?

Can we now rely on international relations (such as India, Brazil, China, Russia and others) to believe that Africa’s development would turn out to be a successful project?

While these questions are not meant to be exhaustive, they are illustrative of the
issues embedded in addressing the leadership and governance discourse (Phago, 2013). These leadership and governance issues require Africans to excogitate in order to fast-track their development realities. In his paper on *Africa’s Renewal*, Paul Zeleza (2012) reminds us that:

> It is easy to get swept away by the recent euphoria about Africa’s economic growth and prospects, as it is to dismiss them and maintain that nothing has changed since the ‘lost decades’ of structural adjustment. Africa suffers from excessive mood swings, blinkered pessimism and blind optimism. This is to suggest that neither Afro-pessimism nor Afro-optimism capture the complex, contradictory, and changing realities of Africa, the intricate connections, constraints and possibilities of the interwoven past, present and future. This is a good moment as any in modern African history in which to see Africa’s economic glass and development potential as simultaneously half full and half empty.

While Zeleza’s assertions above are compelling, they are disturbing to a pan-Africanist who wishes that Africa’s refulgent agenda should be maintained and taken serious by those entrusted with leadership and governance responsibilities. Perhaps, Africa today is more divided than it was during the colonial period when the divisions were a norm and expectation than they are currently. This special issue of the Journal of Public Administration focuses on the theme ‘Leadership and Governance’. It is, however, not intended to deal with the topic of leadership and governance in the African context. The discussion above regarding the puzzle of leadership and governance within the African context is meant to demonstrate their (leadership and governance) applications, hence the use of Africa as an example in this editorial.

The discussion of leadership and governance from a Public Administration perspective is therefore a pursuit to consider whether these issues (leadership and governance) matter and how they should be handled within public institutions. Authors, in responding to the call of this special edition to deal with leadership and governance matters have demonstrated the diverse nature of these issues. This is reflected by the kind of articles received which consider either issues of ‘leadership and governance’ or ‘leadership’ or ‘governance’ separate from each other within a particular case study or discussion focus. In launching the discourse, Sebola and Nkuna engage on the matter of using analytical frameworks for governance which is informed by rational science in the practice of public administration. These authors conclude that the question of governance could be better understood through interactions and not attempting to divide it into parts to analyse. Auriacombe’s article addresses the question of whether improved governance outcomes can be achieved by a way of developing a new evaluation paradigm and innovative methods and techniques that could focus the evaluation efforts of government more clearly. She further concludes with a suggested move towards the development of a classification system to meet the needs of democratic society to improve good governance.
Dassah’s article goes into details regarding how South Africa’s performance on the Mo Ibrahim Index of African governance should be interpreted. This author observes a declining performance in three pillars and seven indicators, with some minimal improvement in three indicators for South Africa governance of its public institutions. He recommends that the government needs to focus its efforts and interventions on consistently improving performance on these areas if issues of governance are to be enhanced. Mafunisa raises issues on the role of leadership in creating commitment for the public servants. He argues that those in leadership positions in public institutions have a responsibility to ensure that those joining the employee of government are committed to the issues of service provisioning. This author concludes that the manifestations of unethical behaviour by political and administrative leadership not only reduce the morale of many committed junior public servants but also negatively influence others in engaging themselves in similar practices.

Mpehle and Kanjere have undertaken an empirical study to consider the effectiveness of the leadership programmes within the Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality which has been used to empower women councillors with the relevant skills. These authors indicate that, despite some recorded minimal successes, challenges of funding for the sustainability of these kinds of programmes abound. The discussions of the Kwanologa games in Kwa-Zulu/Natal and Uganda’s Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project (NECDP) by Mubangizi, Nhlabathi and Namara provide indications of how multi-level governance systems face challenges of co-ordination and alignment of scarce resources. These authors highlight that in a decentralised system, network governance can contribute to service delivery amidst resource-poor units of local government – especially if there is strong and effective collaboration across the different spheres of government, the private sector, and civil society.

An investigation on the impact of mentoring on leadership behaviour by Weimers, Gwandure and Mayekiso provides an empirical analysis for employees in leadership positions. These are those who have undergone a formal organisational mentorship programme compared with those employees in leadership positions who did not receive organisational mentorship. While these two groups differed significantly on leadership behaviours it is found that mentorship had a positive impact on some aspects of leadership behaviour. Further, Govender’s article considers a discourse on the monitoring and evaluation systems for enhancing governance and government legitimacy. In essence, this author argues for an advancement of corporate governance principles in government and state entities in order to enhance public accountability as well as upholding the expected ethical standards.

Gqamane and Taylor look into the capacity building for effective local government leadership and governance. The argument of these authors is an attempt to understand the capacity skills interventions for municipal councillors and
municipal officials. Their survey further reveals that the professional relationship between certain councillors and the bureaucracy is somewhat strained and remedial intervention is required to restore mutual trust. Organisational incentive schemes and continuance commitment in talent management among final year university students is investigated by Mlilo, Gwandure and Mayekiso. Perceptions of participants regarding organisational incentive schemes and continuance commitment were assessed using the short-term incentive questionnaire, long-term incentive questionnaire, the investment in employee development questionnaire, the employee share incentive questionnaire and the continuance commitment questionnaire. In this article, these authors note a multiple regression analysis showed a significant relationship between the predictor variables and continuance commitment.

Draai and Oshoniyi undertook an empirical study on the scarce and critical skills for local government in the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality. This article considers an assessment of perceptions of skills development held by project managers and artisans in the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering at the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality during 2012. The findings indicate that a shortage of critical skills hampers effective strategic leadership for efficient service delivery. Finally, an article by Masango and Mpofu considers a question of staff retention within the higher education sector. A content analysis is used to identify mechanisms for staff retention in the universities which further highlights the pros and cons of high employee turnover in this higher education sector. A possible implication to leadership in this discussion is that one of the functions of management is to lead the organisation in pursuing its vision and mission in such a way that the set goals could be achieved. Hence management should exercise leadership within this higher education landscape.

REFERENCES


MODERN SCIENCE FOR GOVERNANCE IN THE DEMOCRATIC SOUTH AFRICA: ATTEMPTS TO BREATH LIFE IN THE ELEPHANT’S CARCASS

N. Nkuna
M.P. Sebola
Department of Public Administration
University of Limpopo

ABSTRACT

This article puts forward a conceptual argument that in as much as modern science in its positivist form is necessary for governance in the post-apartheid South Africa, ensuring proper governance requires analysis that is beyond the realm of modern scientific rationality. Modern science is a systematic enterprise that builds and organises knowledge in the form of testable explanations and predictions about the universe. It is through modern science that problems are broken apart for proper rational analysis. Of course, in public administration practice such problems are huge to an extent that they can be metaphorically likened to an elephant. If indeed such problems are an elephant, does it mean that we have to divide that elephant in pieces in order to understand each part separately with a view of understanding the whole elephant? The same fallacy in dividing an elephant into two halves does not result in having two small elephants. The article concludes that modern science has of course presented a breakthrough in the development of humankind. Consciously so, the utilising of modern science for governance within public administration practice proves to have limitations. Therefore trans-disciplinarity that will eventually shift the ontological stance remains an option.

INTRODUCTION

Science is a systematic enterprise that builds and organises knowledge in the form of testable explanations and predictions about the universe. That has over the time being regarded as a panacea for human problems. It is through modern science that problems are broken down for proper rational analysis. This makes complex tasks and subjects more manageable (Senge, 1990), but at the end a hidden enormous price is paid. Attempts are made to see the big picture by trying to reassemble the fragments in our minds, to list and organise all the pieces, but the task is futile – similar to trying to reassemble fragments of a broken mirror to see a true reflection. Thus, after a while we give up trying to see the whole together. Of course in public administration practice such problems are huge to an
extent that they can be metaphorically referred to as an elephant. If indeed such problems are an elephant, does it mean that we have to divide such elephant in pieces in order to understand each part separately with a view of understanding the whole elephant? At the end, attempts are made to bring the pieces together with a view of understanding the dismembered whole. The same fallacy of dividing an elephant into two halves does not result in having two small elephants. Modern science has of course presented a breakthrough in the development of humankind over the time. Consciously so, utilising modern science for governance within public administration practice proves to have limitations. It is such limitations which Senge (1990) refers to as the big price humankind end-up paying due to dynamic interactions that manifests through governance in public administration practice. This article provide a conceptual argument that in as much as modern science in its positivist ontology is necessary for governance in the post-apartheid South Africa, ensuring proper governance require analysis that is beyond the realm of modern rationality. That is done by first outlining the scientific notion in public administration practice and exposes various strands that are reining the existing analytical frameworks. A synopsis of the simplistic mechanisation of public administration practice through the cause-effect systems and theoretical framework is made as the premise for putting governance in perspective. The article concludes that modern science in governance requires contextualisation within a plural multiple trans-disciplinarity, than attempting to breathe life in an elephant’s carcass.

**SCIENTIFIC NOTION IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

With the emergence of modern science, the worlds of fact and value became further divorced as technical knowledge began to proliferate (Fideler, 1998). Science limited itself to the functional question of the “how” of which it has consciously ignored the question of meaning. Hence there has been an on-going debate over the years to the effect whether Public Administration is a science or not (Daneke, 1990; Botes, Brynard, Fourie & Roux, 1996; Overman, 1996). The word Science derived from Latin *scientia*, meaning “knowledge” also refers to a systematic enterprise that builds and organises knowledge in the form of testable explanations and predictions about the universe. An older and closely related meaning still in use today is found for example in Aristotle, whereby “science” refers to the body of reliable knowledge itself, of the type that can be logically and rationally explained objectively. The rubric of science has dominated several other major areas of disciplined study and knowledge as it exists today (Daneke, 1990; Overman, 1996). Public administration practice is characterised by periodic changes in dominant conceptualisations of what government does, of the roles of public administration, and appropriate styles of inquiry (Kirlin, 1996). An area where public administration practice needs a better conceptualisation of its roles is precisely in the contributions to government and make to the creation, nurturing,
and restructuring of complex functional systems. Such conceptualisations will fit into governance state in public administration practice. The effort to create a science of public administration practice has often led to the formulation of universal laws or, more commonly, to the assertion that such universal laws could be formulated for public administration (Dahl, 1947). In an attempt to make the science of public administration analogous to the natural sciences, the laws or putative laws are stripped of normative values, of the distortions caused by the incorrigible individual psyche, and of the presumably irrelevant effects of the cultural environment. Yet the task of public administration practice is to share in governing wisely through the constitutional order that the framers of the Constitution intended as an expression of the will of the people who alone are sovereign (Wamsley & Wolf, 1996). In as much as the debate about the scientific nature of public administration as both practice and theory has been raging over the century, in the post-apartheid South Africa; signs of the manifestation of such conundrum within the practice are visible. The neoliberal aspects veering towards New Public Management (NPM) within the Constitutional dispensation reflect such antinodes. However such can be attributed to the nature of various scientific strands within the development of public administration overtime that offers a simplistic analogy in the field with a view of unveiling the best way to do the job.

**VARIOUS STRANDS IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

The fact is that there are now many theories of Public Administration, but one necessity is to learn what is involved in the policies and techniques that public administrators must provide themselves with so as to meet the changing and expanding demands of society and its attempt to adjust to complexity and protect and promote the human element in human institutions (Dimock & Dimock, 1969). There are many ways to study the phenomena of public administration practice (Kumar, 2002), especially if it has to be scientific within the context of governance that involves interactions among a variety of systems. White (1999) refers to those many ways as fundamentally story telling or a narration. Any type of knowledge, even scientific knowledge and that of governance, that is known about public administration practice is basically a story grounded in language and discourse and expressed in narrative form through conversations. Farmer (2010) refers to such as looking at public administration practice through multiple lenses or epistemic pluralism with epistemic being the knowing while pluralism being a strategy of more than one way. Kumar (2002) identified such as approaches being traditional approaches, new approaches, scientific approaches, mechanistic behaviour approach, and ecological approach. On the other hand Fox and Miller (1995) refer to such as theoretical endeavours being sought from other subject fields being political science, philosophy, economics, organisation theory, sociology, social psychology, and any other related sciences that can assist; with traditional approaches comprising of historical approach, legal approach, and institutional
approach. New approaches are classified as behaviourally, systems approach, and structural-functional approach. Scientific approaches comprises of comparative methods, new techniques and case methods. The existence of the various strands within public administration provides a conundrum for the phenomena to be addressed within the realm of traditional rational science.

**RATIONALITY IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

More of the work in the discipline of Public Administration is derived from what is now called scientific management or management theory. It is also referred to as a classic model of public administration (Bourgon, 2007). Much of Public Administration theory embodies the rationalisation spirit that the Enlightenment celebrated: the calculating or instrumental rationality that Weber describes and the purposive-rational rationalisation that Habermas depicts (Farmer, 1995; Fox & Miller, 1995). This rationalising is manifested in an attempt to develop Public Administration discipline along scientific and technological lines. Public administration has developed throughout various stages informed by various paradigmatic shifts, but a scientific thought and experiment have always had a strong influence on administrative theory and practice (Overman, 1996). Based on the ideas of Newton and Maxwell or Darwin and Linnaeus, modern science developed and refined not just specific theories of gravity and electricity or evolution and classification, but large scale ways of thinking upon which inquiries are based in many other disciplines, including the social, political and administrative sciences (Daneke, 1990; Overman, 1996; Dooley, 1997). To define Public Administration, Woodrow Wilson relied on the exclusivity of politics and administration, the indivisible administrator, and the objectivity of law (Overman, 1996; Svara, 2001). Dobuzinskis (1997) confers that for Woodrow Wilson to proclaim that politics and administration belong to different spheres, he applied to Public Administration the positivist dogma, that facts must be separated from values. Yet those values remain the basic guideline factor in the practice of public administration.

The French philosopher, Auguste Comte (1798-1857), developed positivism as a secular religion for humanity and planted the seeds of mainstream social science (White, 1999). He rejected theological and meta-physical explanations of human behaviour in favour of scientific ones. He believed that human behaviour obeyed the laws just as rigorous as Newton’s laws of motion. More than a few Public Administration writers, such as Herbert Simon followed the lead of positivists to have sought to focus the attention of the field of public administration practice on relatively narrow and well defined empirical questions, which seem readily amenable to scientific investigation, rather than a broad and enduring questions of political philosophy, which are difficult or even impossible to reduce to empirically testable hypothesis (Spicer, 2001). The positivist tradition fosters an engineering mentality toward the use of knowledge in administrative and policy settings (White, 1999). Whereas this is appropriate for solving simple, well-structured
problems, it fails to explain the logic of how formal knowledge of administration or public policy is used to solve complex, ill structured problems. Dunn (1981) in White (1999) refers to a well-structured problem as having few decision makers or stakeholders, a limited number of alternatives, a well-defined problem, and agreed upon values to direct action. In contrast, an ill-structured problem has many decision makers, numerous possible alternatives, competing definitions of the problem, and conflicting values to guide decision making. The effective solutions of ill-structured problems involve a type of knowledge and action that is not captured in the positivist conception of science. Administrative management, sometimes called “classical administration”, owed too much scientific management and progressivism, and drew heavily from Henri Fayol and other theorists (Wamsley & Wolf, 1996). In public administration practice context, Bourgon (2007) contends that the public service as we know it today, owes much to the Public Administration theory that developed and prevailed during the beginning of the twentieth century including, respect of the rule of law; a commitment to serving the public good; and an expectation that public servants will exhibit integrity, probity and impartiality in serving the public trust. That has remained the frame of reference in the practice of public administration as it currently prevails in South Africa, although there are other pathologies that can be linked to the level of capacity.

**SIMPLISTIC MECHANISATION IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

The simplistic mechanisation of public administration practice is derived from the mechanistic behaviour approaches that emphasises a machine-like behaviour of public administrators or civil servants (Svara, 2001; Kumar, 2002). It is based on the discoveries of Sir Isaac Newton (Overman, 1996; Heylighen, Cilliers & Gershenson, 2007), which is of the belief that the universe is completely deterministic (Heylighen et al, 2007; Habtemichael & Cloete, 2010). Such was the result of scientific management movement and observance of bureaucratic rules and procedures. Scientific Management theorists like F.W. Taylor and others, were aspiring to develop a one best way to do the job (Hanekom & Thornhill, 1996; Fox & Miller, 1995). To design and implement management methods, F.W. Taylor relied on fixed time and space, the primacy of physical reality, and simple causal relationship (Kiel, 1994; Overman, 1996; Morcol & Wachhaus, 2009). Max Weber developed a rational bureaucratic image of specialisation, clear lines of authority, and rule based procedures which mirrored the ideals of logical empiricism in the scientific community. Weber envisioned a sociology that would combine a concern for objectivity with an understanding of the meaning of human action for those involved - a combination extremely difficult to achieve (Fox & Miller, 1995; Dooley, 1997; Denhardt, 2008). Scientific Management had aimed largely at organising work at the shop-floor level, administrative management sought to develop principles for the organisation as a whole (Wamsley & Wolf, 1996; Dooley, 1997). It was concerned with developing universal principles and methods that can
be applicable to each and every organisation or institution. This was seen through an attempt to develop principles of administration by theorists that followed such as Gulick and Urwick with their POSDCORB acronym and Herbert Simon with his proverbs of administration. POSDCORB is standing for the functions of the chief executive, being planning, organising, staffing, directing, coordinating, reporting and budgeting (Coetzee, 1988). Theories developed through scientific management were rationalistic and mechanistic. The central concern was to achieve the best performance of physical activities (Stacey, Griffin & Shaw, 2000). The main focus was on the actions of the parts in that each part of the process needed to be mastered with a view of understanding the whole system. The theorists ignore interaction of the parts as understanding the behaviour of such parts does not mean understanding a system of public administration practice as a whole. All these theorists were within the ambit of modern scientific discourse which is based on the notion of causal links. Those theories are based on a hypothesis of "if then" (Cilliers, 1998) with assumptions that there are basically on linear relationship of systems. The question however remains as to whether such rational contention can be of assistance within the context of governance in public administration practice?

While referring to development of social intervention programmes in South Africa, Mouton (2009) refers to such as simplistic in that programmes are defined as simple when it is possible and usually quite easy to capture the programme theory, using the logic model in a single linear-causal path which often involves some variation on five categories, namely, inputs, processes, outputs, outcomes, and impact. The conceptualisation of structures and basic management in public administration practice as it is in South Africa reflect such an approach. For example the Weberian bureaucratic structure forms the basis for developing a meaningful organisational arrangement within the public service. Public administration continues to have some elements of mechanistic approach dictated through classic models. Clear functional demarcations are put in place to ensure performance of activities as mandated through relevant legislation and related policy directives. The day to day activities within public administration practice still require mechanistic aspects for purposes of efficiency. Such mechanistic approaches in their modern context remain the basis of the theoretical framework of Public Administration. But by itself the mechanistic approach lacks much of addressing the complex phenomena of public administration practice as a whole within the governance notion networks.

The Human Relations School associated with Mayo (Fenwick, 1995) did however surfaced in assuming that the social group, and in particular the interpersonal relations of the workgroup, are just as important as the actual organisation of the job in determining output and performance. The well-known Hawthorne studies in the United States in the 1920’s and 1930’s appeared to demonstrate that solidarity of the workgroup at the Western Electric Company, and the benign interest shown in the group by researchers, had a greater impact than physical conditions.
or economic incentives had on output. Such assumptions of Human Relations School run counter to that of Scientific Management as it emphasises the group than individualistic approach. The Hawthorne studies experiment underscored a fundamental truth, obscured for some time by scientific management theories, namely, that employees of an organisation constituted its basis, and that upon their attitudes, behaviour, and morale within their primary groups ultimately depended on industrial effectiveness and productivity (Kumar, 2002). Such came to realise the existence of internal and non-rational elements of human behaviour in a work environment. Interrelations between workers and groups may exist beyond the provisions of the organisational structure. Public administration practice consists of human beings who have interrelations; however such interrelations are recognised within the linear perspective of modern science with limitations in that they fall short as there are feedback loops that are unpredictable as sought by modern science.

**SYSTEMISATION OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

For purposes of linking the science notion for governance within public administration practice, it is of essence to briefly highlight on the systemisation of the field. The simplistic notion of public administration practice was also challenged by the Systems Thinking Theorists (Kiel, 1994; Heylighen et al, 2007) which is traceable to the thinking of the German biologist, Von Bertalanfy in the 1920s (Stacey, 1996; Dooley, 1997; Heylighen et al, 2007) who put forward the idea that organisms, as well as human organisations and societies are open systems (Stacey, 1996) in that they consist of a number of component sub-systems that are interrelated and interdependent on each other just like in public administration practice. They are open because they are connected by feedback links to their environments, or supra-systems of which they are part of. Business and other human endeavour are also systems that are bound by invisible fabrics of interrelated actions, which often take years to fully play out their effects on each other (Senge, 1990). However, Morgan (2005) on the other hand, refers to systems thinking as a way of mentally framing what we see in the world. It is a way of thinking that looks at the ‘whole’ first with its fit and relationship to its environment as a primary concern. Attention to the constituent elements or parts of the system is secondary. Systems thinking is more an orientation or a perspective than it is a formula or prescription in that it can be used to help people understand how systems work and how people can deal with them more effectively. It is a way of exploring real life rather than representing it and encourages people to look for patterns of interaction and underlying structures that shape the emergent patterns of systems behaviour. A corollary to this approach is the idea that structures matter much more than individual events in terms of determining outcomes.

A number of theorists from various disciplines began to think and write about the unification of science in their quest for a body of concepts lending unity or
organisation to studies undertaken in various disciplines through the development of the concept of “system”, which has since then become a basic conceptual asset of general systems theory (Kumar, 2002). Systems thinking theories were developed through various paths being General Systems Theory, Cybernetics and Systems Dynamics.

General Systems Theory describes among others, human organisations within a broad framework of systems thinking (Kumar, 2002) in that context is an assembly of interdependent parts which may be referred to as sub-systems, whose interaction determines its survival (Zimmerman, Lindberg & Plsek, 2009). The central concept of the theory is that of homeostasis in that systems have a strong tendency to move toward a state of order and stability, or adapted equilibrium (Stacey et al, 2000). They do this if they have permeable boundaries that are open to interactions with other systems and display the property of equifinality in order to reach homeostasis from a number of differing starting points along a number of differing paths. The systems’ history and context is not an issue as what is important is its current state of relationship with other systems and clearly defined boundaries which according to Cilliers et al (2000), such boundaries are not there. Public administrators instead assume the role of controlling the system towards the point of equilibrium with disregard of the point of system bifurcations (Kiel, 1994; Stacey, 1996; Cilliers, 1998) and create new structures. Administrative processes, tools and approaches as systems are assumed to be in the state of being marshalled towards a common predetermined objective; which is not always the case in open systems like that of public administration practice.

Cybernetics was defined in 1948 by Nobert Wiener as the science of communication and control in the animal and the machine, demonstrates that purposefulness can be accounted for by formal models in which corrective feedback loops have been built (Dobuzinskis, 1992). It is the interdisciplinary study of the structure of regulatory systems closely related to control theory and systems theory (Heylighen et al, 2007). Cybernetics as an approach seeks to control an organisation by using feedback without understanding the feedback structure of the organisation itself (Stacey, 1996). It sees effective regulators as those that cause the system to be largely self-regulating, automatically handling the disturbance which the environment bombards it with. Cybernetic systems are self-regulating, goal-directed systems adapting to their environment (Stacey et al, 2000). The system comes with build-in checks and controls. Once set in place it can operate automatically as long as all parts are performing properly.

The other pathway is that of dynamics which simply refer to how a system changes overtime with classical dynamics being establishment of laws of motion through time for physical bodies; thermodynamics establishes laws of heat dissipation overtime; population dynamics establishes the patterns of change in population overtime; economic dynamics attempts to establish and explain patterns of economic development overtime; psychodynamics tries to explain
the human behaviour patterns overtime that are generated by contradiction and tension, for example by the need to be part of a group and yet be a free individual, by the feeling of love and hate for the same person (Stacey, 1996). Mathematical models of a system are constructed, consisting of recursive, non-linear equations that specify how the system changes states overtime (Stacey et al, 2000; Haynes, 2007). Systems dynamics theory recognises amplification, feedback and non-linear responses. The system moves from being self-regulating to self-influencing or either self-sustaining to self-destructive. Instead of thinking of a system moving towards an equilibrium state, it is thought of as following a small number of typical patterns or archetypes (Stacey et al, 2000). Those patterns need to be recognised and identify leverage points at which action have to be taken to change them so as to stay in control.

The synopsis of various systems thinking pathways in Public Administration as provided above inform most of the rigour in public administration practice as it stands in South Africa. Although there are upcoming scholars that have a complexity thinking views based on a postmodernist ontology of Public Administration theory, the state of affairs is still dominated by rational linear view provided by modern science in that public administration practice can be reduced to a recipe order. The problem with the “modern science” of Descartes and Newton is not simply their use of prediction and control, but is that they set up a science in which prediction and control become ends in themselves (Robbins, 2005) by adopting a reductionist approach. However it becomes eminent when governance kicks in that those sub-systems or bits are assembled together with a view of having the whole that the system ceased to exist holistically. Those sub-systems divided through scientific reductionist approach do not sum up to the whole as each part is the whole on its own.

**GOVERNANCE IN PERSPECTIVE**

Even though the concept of governance has come to be used more commonly in the discussion of public administration practice, the meaning of the term is not always clear (Peters & Pierre, 1998). Governance might now be fashionable, but the concept is as old as human history (Weiss, 2000). The concept has entered the literature of Public Administration in the late 1980s (Thornhill, 2006). Governance is thus an indication of a significant new development in the practice of public administration, and by implication also in the discipline. The field has come to acknowledge the presence of private sector phenomena like stakeholder interests; shareholders; risks; and client preferences. The conception of governance as it has developed from Europe has several constituent elements (Peters & Pierre, 1998). The emergence of governance in the western European context must be viewed against the historical nature of the public administration practice and state-society relationships there. Yet in South Africa that can be based on policy pronouncement made after the Constitution of 1996. Theoretical work on governance reflects the
interest of the social science community in a shifting pattern in styles of governing (Stoker, 1998) with the traditional use of the word in its everyday language as a synonym for government. In the growing work on governance there is a redirection in its use and import. It rather refers much to the process of interaction within the ambit of conditions ordered by the rule in the society.

Understanding it widely, governance include ways in which political, economic, and administrative power and authority should be experienced (Farmer, 2005). Its scope is larger than is available in a truncated field like political science, economics, or the administrative specialisations like public administration, business administration, hotel administration, sports administration, and travel administration. As the English poet, John Donne (1572-1631) put it “No man is an island, entire of itself”. Argentinean author Jorge Luis Borges echoed that “…..everything touches everything”. The vantage point for physics professor and networks theorist Alberto-Laslo Barabasi (2002) is that “…..nothing happens in isolation” and that conclusively means that society is a network of relationships within which we interact (Gummesson, 2007). In the South African context such a rule emanates from the constitutional provisions while another strain on the traditional conception arises from changes in relationships between government and private sector (Peters & Pierre, 1998). Thus Stoker (1998) sums it that governance is ultimately concerned with creating conditions for ordered rule and collective action. The academic literature on governance is eclectic and relatively disjointed with its theoretical roots from various disciplines. Just like public administration practice, the contribution of governance perspective to theory is not at the level of causal analysis nor does it offer a new normative theory. Stoker (1998) presents propositions that can present aspects of governance and considered to be complementary rather than contradictory or in competition. Such propositions are associated with certain dilemma or critical issue. Such propositions and associated dilemma are presented in the form of a table below:

**Table 1: Governance propositions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposition</th>
<th>Dilemma or critical issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Governance involves a set of institutions and actors that are drawn from but also beyond government</td>
<td>There is a divorce between the complex reality of decision making associated with governance and the normative codes used to explain and justify government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance identifies the blurring of boundaries and responsibilities for tackling social and economic issues</td>
<td>The blurring of responsibilities can lead to blame avoidance or scapegoating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance is about autonomous self-governing networks of actors</td>
<td>The emergence of self-governing networks raises difficulties over accountability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Governance identifies the power dependence involved in the relationships between institutions involved in collective action

Power dependence exacerbates the problem of unintended consequences for government

Governance recognises the capacity to get things done which does not rest the power of government to command or use its authority.

Even where governments operate in a flexible way to steer collective action governance failure may occur

Source: (Adapted from Stoker, 1998)

Government organisations remain part of networks in these emerging models of governance, but they are conceptualised as dependent on other actors to the same extent that those actors are dependent on government. Governance is the act of governing in that it relates to decisions that define expectations, grant power, or verify performance. It consists of either a separate process or part of management or leadership processes. These processes and systems in the context of public administration are typically administered by a government or its agencies. In the case of a business or of a non-profit organisation, governance relates to consistent management, cohesive policies, guidance, processes and decision-rights for a given area of responsibility. For example, managing at a corporate level might involve evolving policies on privacy, on internal investment, and on the use of data. To distinguish the term governance from government; “governance” is what a “government” does. It might be a geo-political government, a corporate government, a socio-political government, or any number of different kinds of government, but governance is the exercise of management power and policy.

BREATHING LIFE IN THE CARCAS

Modern science by its nature is reductionist (Cilliers, 1998). Its rationality to have a meaningful role in governance in South Africa, it needs to be understood from the context of what it can do and what it cannot do for public administration practice. In this sense it is interesting to note that Goethe, whose scientific contributions have been unjustly overshadowed because of his colossal achievements in literature and the arts, felt upset with what he believed to be the limitations of Newtonian physics (Seamon, 1998; Naydler, 2000). For Goethe, science is as much an inner path of spiritual development as it is a discipline aimed at accumulating knowledge of the physical world. It involves not only a rigorous training of human faculties of observation and thinking, but also of other human faculties which can attune to the spiritual dimension that underlies and interpenetrates the physical faculties such as feeling, imagination and intuition. Goethean’s contribution to science remain what Max-Neef (2007) regarded as a route that was not navigated in terms of knowledge interrogation. Instead the Newtonian and Galileo remain the mostly navigated terrains. The realisation that a phenomenon confronted is always richer than the abstractions used to explain them is central to a Goethean approach (Holdrege, 2005). Science, as Goethe
conceived and practiced it, has as its highest goal the arousal of the feeling of wonder through contemplative looking, in which the scientist would come to see God in nature and nature in God (Naydler, 2000). Goethe emphasised that perhaps the greatest danger in the transition from seeing to interpreting is the tendency of the mind to impose an intellectual structure that is not really present in the thing itself: How difficult it is to refrain from replacing the thing with its sign, to keep the object alive before us instead of killing it with the word (Seamon, 1998). The synthesis drawn here is that scientifically the phenomenon of public administration practice is studied in pieces yet it is the interaction of pieces that put governance in action. Metaphorically it is like joining the puzzle on the pieces of an elephant with a view that on completion the elephant would stand up and walk. Therefore governance and its bureaucracy cannot be dealt with adequately without going outside a monolithic discipline or field as well as adventuring in the turfs of a range of foreign specialities (Farmer, 2005). Governance need to be understood widely to include ways in which political, economic, and administrative power and authority should be experienced. Therefore the scope required is larger than is available in a truncated field like political science, economics, or administrative specialisations like public administration, business administration, hotel administration, and sports administration.

PLURAL MULTIPLE TRANS-DISCIPLINARITY AS A SOLUTION

Science is a systematic enterprise and is organised into disciplines like that of Public Administration (Neuman, 1996). In as much as Public Administration theory is in quandary for over a century, due to it having a focus and locus qualify it to be a discipline. Yet Max-Neef (2005) put it that if we go through a list of some of the main problématiques that are defining the new century, such as water, forced migrations, poverty, environmental crises, violence, terrorism, neo-imperialism, destruction of social fabric, we must conclude that none of them can be adequately tackled from the sphere of specific individual disciplines. Thus, the new generation of public administration practice will need a different spirit, perhaps a combination of communitarianism, institutionalism, and energism but in any case, one that successfully fosters mutual effort. As Farmer (2005) posits that it is impossible to reflect adequately on politics or bureaucracy without thinking about economics; it is also not possible to reflect adequately on economics without thinking about politics and bureaucracy. The ideal scope include also subjects like philosophy, sociology, social work, literature, arts, and other turfs related to the biological, psychological, the social, and the spiritual. Looking out from within a narrow specialisation distorts what is seen and makes virtually impossible to present a larger picture that is needed. Pieters (2010) however concerted that inter-disciplinary or trans-disciplinary research is becoming more common and their importance is increasingly being recognised. However, in practice many of these efforts tend to end up in more or less isolated activities around a common theme. Successful
forms of cross-domain interactions may be feasible as long as the stakeholders that team up around a certain research theme share a common vocabulary. That is what this article metaphorically referred to as the elephant. Public Administration theory is by its nature eclectic as reflected earlier in that it source knowledge from a variety of disciplines. It is when methods and techniques from other disciplines complement the discourse and practice in the field that it becomes operational. However, the need for application of those methods and techniques from other disciplines will be determined by the nature and level of application within the practice of public administration. Such can be more clarified through the synopsis of discipline level ranging from disciplinarity, multi-disciplinarity, pluri-disciplinarity, inter-disciplinarity to trans-disciplinarity provided for in the ensuing paragraphs:

Disciplinarity - is about mono-discipline, which represents specialisation in isolation (Max-Neef, 2005), for example biology. Such can be handled without a need for knowledge about physics or psychology. They are perceived as logically connected horizontally and not vertical and it privileges the discipline to be an isolated area of specialisation. Yet Public Administration has for over a century been struggling to be logically connected horizontally to these other sciences due its eclectic nature. Max Weber’s bureaucratic cage serves as a meaningful example of ideal specialisation (Farmer, 2005). This is exacerbated by a continuous need for public administration to be holistic than fragmented. Paradoxically the society that public administration purported to serve in the 21st century is somewhat postmodern in nature (Nkuna & Sebola, 2012). The local narrated nature of problems that public administration practice sought to address is authentic if locally defined.

Multi-disciplinary - is a simultaneous or sequence of more than one area of knowledge, without making any connections between them (Max-Neef, 2005). Multidisciplinary teams of researchers are common and frequent nowadays wherein members carry out analyses separately, as seen from the perspective of individual disciplines, the final result being a series of reports pasted together, without any integrating synthesis. Of course public administration also within itself has a number of perspectives that features in analysing it (Farmer, 1995). The independency of those disciplines create syllogism that at the end each one have partially dealt with the holistic problem that public administration sought to achieve.

Pluri-disciplinarity - implies cooperation between disciplines, without coordination (Max-Neef, 2005). It normally happens between compatible areas of knowledge, on a common hierarchical level. The study of each one of them reinforces the understanding of the others. The notion of Public Administration being an eclectic discipline found itself having to have combinations from other disciplines.

Inter-disciplinarity - is organised at two hierarchical levels. It thus connotes coordination of a lower level from a higher one (Max-Neef, 2005). “...a sense of purpose is introduced when the common axiomatics of a group of related disciplines
is defined at the next higher hierarchical level”. So, what is meant by hierarchical level? Disciplines are considered hierarchical ranging from empirical level to pragmatic level, and normative level to value level. Empirical level constitute of disciplines that deal with the understanding of physical laws of nature and the principles that drive life and society, while pragmatic level are disciplines that goes beyond understanding the phenomena to practicing what is acquired; for example engineering, architecture, agriculture and medicine. Normative level includes disciplines that deal with how things are supposedly to be; such as planning, politics, design of social systems and environmental design while value level is occupied by disciplines that are value laden like ethics, philosophy, and theology. Public administration practice features on all of these levels hence the need for application throughout the inter-disciplinarity and eventually trans-disciplinarity.

Trans-disciplinarity - is the result of coordination between all levels of disciplines that can be described in different ways (Max-Neef, 2005). The first level of disciplines asks and answers the question; so, what exists? Through physics one can learn about quanta, through astronomy one can learn about the magnitude of the universe and the birth of stars. Same with biology one can learn about the composition of organisms that defy entropy as open systems; however sociology and economics attempt to describe and explain the behaviour of rational human beings, which is not always successful. The organising language of this level is logic based on linear relationships that are within cause-effect ontological base. The pragmatic level is of technological disciplines that seek to ask and answer the question (Max-Neef, 2005); so what are we capable of doing? This kind of questioning is based on what is learned from the empirical level of analysis. Here we know how to build bridges, how to travel to Mars and how to navigate in the high seas. What this level does not tell is whether capacities acquired can be implemented. The organising language of this level is cybernetics that accentuates only the mechanical properties of nature and society through complicating complex interactions that remain core to governance within public administration practice.

The normative level asks and answers a question on so what is it we want to do? In democratic societies, like that of South Africa, the answers are normally put to vote (Max-Neef, 2005). The application of environmental impact assessments that originated as a consequence of the environmental movement may serve as an example as well as the putting into office of a government regime. In these level people have capacity of directly influencing what they want to happen in their milieu. The organising language of this level is planning. The value level, being the highest on the hierarchy asks and answers; so what should we do? Or rather, how should we do what we want to do? This level goes beyond the present and the immediate. It aims at generations yet to come, at the planet as a whole, at an economy as if people matter. As the levels transcend, rational science reaches its limits (Nkuna & Sebola, 2012) and that is the point interactions become complex and the state of sophisticated governance is in play. Therefore, to ensure
governance, public administration practice in South Africa requires engaging modern science to the level of being able to contextualise its limits accordingly with a view of transcending beyond or towards un-navigated terrains from the view of multi-disciplinarity, pluri-disciplinarity, inter-disciplinarity to trans-disciplinarity.

CONCLUSION

The article engaged the matter of using analytical frameworks for governance informed by rational science in the practice of public administration in South Africa. The argument espoused is that rational science adopts a reductionist approach that reduces elements of the phenomena of public administration practice into manageable parts for analysis. Governance is better understood through interactions; therefore attempting to divide it into parts to analyse it is as good as cutting elephant into parts with a view of understanding the whole elephant. That remains a folly if one had to deal with systems that are by nature defined by interactions. The route recommended is that of plural inter-disciplinarity that each discipline will locate its space within the levels with magnitude and level of analysis required. That eventually calls for an ontological position that is beyond rationality as disciplinarity assume various levels from mono-discipline to multi- and trans-disciplinarity. Contextualisation within the range of multiple interactions remains a matter that need serious attention as each phenomenon is not in isolation. Therefore that will be beyond what rational science can provide for governance in public administration practice like that of South Africa.

LIST OF REFERENCES


IN SEARCH OF AN ANALYTICAL EVALUATION FRAMEWORK TO MEET THE NEEDS OF GOVERNANCE

C.J. Auriacombe
Department of Public Management and Governance
University of Johannesburg

ABSTRACT

This article provides the rationale for the importance of evaluation as a research tool for the public sector to be accountable for improving better democratic governance outcomes in terms of its policies, interventions, projects and programmes. The article covers the historical background of evaluation and introduces a classification of democracy models and the type of evaluation needed. It explains the relationship between the needs of democratic societies with different evaluation paradigms as well as the different methods and values of evaluation approaches. It explains the development of a classification system to meet the needs of democratic society to improve good governance. The article addresses the question of whether improved governance outcomes can be achieved by way of developing a new evaluation paradigm and innovative methods and techniques that could focus the evaluation efforts of government more clearly. To meet the complexities of governance, it is necessary to develop enhanced evaluation designs that will be responsive to the changing needs of stakeholders. This is especially true for system change reform and comprehensive community initiatives which many evaluators are now attempting to implement.

INTRODUCTION AND RATIONALE

According to Mark, Greene and Shaw (in Rabie and Cloete, 2009:77) “evaluation or [the] determination of the relative worth of something must be undertaken in order to compare alternatives before choices amongst them”. They (in Rabie and Cloete, 2009:77) also state that: “Informal evaluations inform daily decisions on how good or bad, desirable or undesirable something is. Formal evaluations involve the same kind of judgement, but are more systematic and rigorous than their informal counterparts, with appropriate controls for the validity and reliability of the findings and conclusions”. It is important that people in the public sector “know the benefits of their work on the intended recipients” (Palama, 2010:4).

Palama (2010:4) emphasises the importance of Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) as a mechanism for public servants to measure the effectiveness of the service
delivery to improve and “ensure good governance” and stated that: “They need to be able to understand not only the inputs, activities and outputs of their work, but also how effective they have been in improving the life and circumstances of South Africans. They need to understand the outcomes, both intended and unintended, and the impact of their work on the people of the country” (Palama 2010:4). Palama (2010:4) also argued that: “Accountability and transparency are essential features of democratic governments and the application of M&E principles enables the country to measure progress of the actual work that it undertakes and the results of government’s policy implementation” (see also Cloete and Auriacombe, 2007). Webb and Auriacombe (2006:588) add that: “Researchers, academics and consultants are required, in many different contexts, to engage in research and provide decision-makers in society and government with valid results” to improve better good governance outcomes through evaluation research (cf. Auriacombe, 2007:18 and Auriacombe, 2000).

Rabie and Cloete (2009:77) state that public policy analysis and general social science are the two main disciplines that influence evaluation research. Policy analysis characterised “a shift from opinion-driven policy choices, to evidence-influenced and -based policy-making that explicitly takes normative decision drivers to resolve societal problems...while...the social research field brought greater research efficiency, effectiveness and sophistication to the field” (Rabie and Cloete, 2009:77).

Hartslief and Auriacombe (2009:866) argue that “there is a growing requirement for a combination of both qualitative and quantitative research in public administration” and this phenomenon is also evident in evaluation research. Auriacombe (1999:135) also states that the apparent success of governance “seems to be that it reflects the social need for new initiatives based upon the realisation of growing social interdependencies” that underscores the importance of developing tools to promote the measurement of good governance outcomes. Furthermore, the quantitative qualitative paradigm debate in evaluation research to improve good governance outcomes is not only prominent and persistent but also characterised by enormous diversity. This has resulted in a great deal of controversy amongst scholars regarding the meaning of the concept ‘programme evaluation’. Evaluation research is many things to many people. Patton (2008:31-32) states: “All this ferment means that evaluation has become a many-splendored thing – a rich tapestry of models, methods, issues, approaches, variations, definitions, jargon, concepts, theories and practices. And therein lays the rub. How does one sort through the many competing and contradictory messages about how to conduct evaluations?”

Various attempts have been made to classify evaluation methods. Although these attempts were aimed at simplifying the confusing array of available methods they tend to further confuse our understanding of the evaluation field. The aim of this preface is to try and make sense of the different methods of doing evaluation
by presenting them in such a way that you could understand the main differences between, firstly, the logic of the methods (studying the phenomenon from an ‘insider’ perspective (inductive) or from an ‘outsider’ perspective (deductive); secondly, the evaluator’s ontology (the evaluator’s beliefs of how the truth (reality) should be seen); his/her epistemology (the belief of the evaluator of how the truth should be studied); thirdly, their methodologies (or theories of how the evaluation should proceed and the methods used to do the evaluation); and lastly the axiology or the role of values in an inquiry (Auriacombe, 2009:160 and Auriacombe, 2005:80).

However in light of the changing nature of democracy the question arises whether current evaluation methods mostly relying on quantitative data, could still be regarded as sufficient to guide the development of policy-making and programme development. Differently stated, can evaluation paradigms currently used by public administrations meet the keystone challenge of building a partnership between government and civil society to achieve the goals set by the World Summit? Are we not trying to open the new doors supposedly leading to a democratic society with a set of ancient keys from the previous era?

The different methods and value of the different evaluation paradigms will be presented in a table format and discussed in an effort to simplify the choices for the researcher who is going to do evaluation research for the first time (Schurink & Schurink 2009). However, in order to gain a better understanding of what evaluation is all about it is necessary to look into the historical background of evaluation research (cf. Auriacombe, 2009:161).

**HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF EVALUATION**

Evaluative thinking in human affairs is as old as mankind itself. Throughout the ages there has been a strong belief that the social sciences and humanities have an important role to play in changing and bettering human conditions. (http://ec.europa.eu/research/evaluations/pdf/archive/fp6-evidence_base/evaluation_studies_and_reports/evaluation_studies_and_reports_2005/social_sciences_and_humanities_in_the_7th_fp.pdf#view=fit&pagemode=none). Although evaluation methods have been used for ages, it was not until the end of the 1950s that evaluation as method became more formal and systematic and social research became part of the evaluation processes. These processes were mainly aimed at assessing the workings of government with a common goal of improving society. As Carole Weiss (1977) observed, evaluation was expected to bring order to the untidy world of government, to improve good governance.

The 1960’s vision of the experimenting society, emphasising rational decision making and randomised experiments focused on bias control and validity, represented one of the most important methodological breakthroughs in applied research¹ and evaluation. The assumption made by this movement led by Donald

---

¹ Research focusing on practical problems and improvement of the human condition.
T Campbell was that humankind could be moved towards the ‘good life’ by implementing social reforms underpinned by experimental research and evaluation (Donaldson, Christie & Mark, 2009:3). To improve better governance outcomes, this type of evaluation emphasised the importance of quantifiable outcomes of the research rather than the process.

As the method of evaluation grew worldwide, it became increasingly professionalised and quantified. In an effort to make evaluation research more rigorous and accountable, the criteria judging the validity, representativeness, reliability and objectivity used by traditional research were adopted by researchers in the evaluation field (Patton, 2008).

However, this expectation failed to account for the complexity of programme development, the difficulty of implementing interventions, and the long-term nature of the change process. “In the end, these types of evaluations have turned out to be more descriptive of the feasibility of implementing the programmes than testing of the effectiveness of the approach” (Auspos & Kubisch, 2004:7). Community-based programmes dealing with human beings did not lend themselves easily to this laboratory type of evaluation. The main reason for this being, that “the criteria necessary to conduct these evaluations limit their usefulness to primarily, single intervention programmes in fairly controlled environments. The natural science research model is therefore ill-equipped to help us understand complex, comprehensive, and collaborative community initiatives” (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 1998). Due to this mismatch between experimental theory and programme reality the experimenting society did not stand the test of time. Thirty years down the road evaluation studies reveal minor improvements in service delivery, despite the billions of dollars spent (Patton, 2008). The result is that public skepticism has grown to such an extent that it is widely believed that “nothing works” (Rossi, Lipsey & Freeman 2004). In an effort to counteract failed programmes citizens placed an even higher demand on accountable intervention programmes. The resultant movement led the way for performance monitoring and more rigorous evaluation of service delivery programmes (Rossi, Lipsey & Freeman, 2004).

The new vision for accountable governance seems to require broadening Campbel’s vision from ‘experimenting’ to an ‘evidence based society’ (Donaldson, Christie & Mark 2009: 3). This new movement towards an evidence based society was seen as the new ‘magic bullet’. Expectations were that evaluations would produce conclusive information about the effectiveness of the initiatives. This resulted in donors demanding that in order to get programme funds every practitioner should become an evaluator doing applied research. Consequently, applied research dominated the evaluation scene over the past thirty years.

This turn towards applied research unfortunately impacted heavily on the funds available for basic or pure research.\(^2\) Funding for basic research (research focusing on a better or fuller understanding of a subject or phenomenon instead of on a specific practical application of the results.)
for knowledge’s sake) has largely been supplemented by donor-driven applied research. This meant that even scientists at leading research institutes and universities no longer did qualitative, process-oriented and theory based research that could perhaps have provided better answers to community and societal problems (Auriacombe, 2009:158). Even worse, this meant that social scientists now had to invest their intellectual capital in the kind of research that would have a payoff in political circles. The absolute demand for evidence based research among politicians was enforced to such an extent that the saying was used: “In God we trust – all others must have credible evidence” (Donaldson, Christie & Mark, 2009:5).

As a result of this the original mission of programme evaluation in the human services fields namely to assist in improving the quality of social programmes, changed to that of proving whether a programme or initiative works. “In our opinion, this has created an imbalance in human service evaluation work—with a heavy emphasis on proving that programmes work through the use of quantitative, impact designs, and not enough attention to more naturalistic, qualitative designs aimed at improving programmes” (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 1998:6). It should be noted that although the demand for accountable intervention programmes was placed on the foreground, behind the scenes there were and still are heavy debates about what counts as evidence, applied research and evaluation. These heated debates or paradigm wars have potentially far-reaching implications for applied research and evaluation. These heated debates or paradigm wars have potentially far-reaching implications for applied research and evaluation. These heated debates or paradigm wars have potentially far-reaching implications for applied research and evaluation. These heated debates or paradigm wars have potentially far-reaching implications for applied research and evaluation. These heated debates or paradigm wars have potentially far-reaching implications for applied research and evaluation.

The quantitative-qualitative paradigm debate in evaluation research has been both prominent and persistent (Patton, 2008). Currently evaluators tend to still lean strongly on quantitative research methods (Patton, 2007:427). The scientific method is based on a hypothetico-deductive methodology working from an outsider perspective (stating general hypotheses) to specific variables proving or refuting the hypotheses. This means that researchers/evaluators test hypotheses about the impact of a social initiative using statistical analysis techniques.
contrast qualitative researchers reject the outsider method of the natural sciences that begins with hypotheses and theories and believe that human behaviour can only be studied by means of an inductive, insider perspective focusing on the life world of individuals and ending with assumptions and theoretical concepts. “The hypothetico-deductive, natural science model is designed to explain what happened and show causal relationships between certain outcomes and the “treatments” or services aimed at producing these outcomes. If designed and conducted effectively, the experimental or quasi-experimental design can provide important information about the particular impacts of the social program being studied. Did the academic enrichment program lead to improved grades for students? Or increased attendance? Ultimately, was it effective? However, many of the criteria necessary to conduct these evaluations limit their usefulness to primarily single intervention programs in fairly controlled environments. The natural science research model is therefore ill equipped to help us understand complex, comprehensive, and collaborative community initiatives” (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 1998:6).

For this qualitative research is needed to understand the richness and complexity of contemporary human-services programs — especially system change reform and comprehensive community initiatives which many evaluators are now trying to implement (W.K. Kellog Foundation 1998). Whatever the outcomes of this debate, the fact is that as the very first sentence in the preamble of Agenda 21 states the world is still confronted with “a perpetuation of disparities between and within nations, a worsening of poverty, hunger, ill health and illiteracy, and the continuing deterioration of the ecosystems on which we depend for our well-being” (http://habitat.igc.org/agenda21/a21-01.htm). Therefore, judging from the wide scale misery in the world today the magic bullet has not yet been found. Yet the belief is still there that applied research and evaluation of programmes could help us meet the Agenda 21 aims set for the fulfillment of basic needs, improved living standards, better protected and managed ecosystems and a safer, more prosperous future for all (http://habitat.igc.org/agenda21/a21-01.htm).

Yet, despite all the failures it is believed that this dream of solving the world’s problems can still be realised, as noted in the abstract of this article, provided that we move towards the development of a new evaluation paradigm and innovative methods and techniques that could focus our evaluation efforts more clearly. To meet the complexities it is necessary to develop enhanced evaluation designs that will be responsive to the changing needs of stakeholders. This is especially true for system change reform and comprehensive community initiatives which many evaluators are now attempting to implement.

A CLASSIFICATION OF DEMOCRACY MODELS AND THE TYPE OF EVALUATION NEEDED

Given the diversity and complexity of contemporary evaluation, it is hardly surprising that this field of study has many unresolved issues relating to important
aspects such as conceptualisation, methodology, validity, ethics, participation, empowerment, value judgement, social justice, advocacy, policy and intervention (Fetterman, 2004). These issues are interrelated and need to be considered carefully before undertaking an evaluation project.

In the age of the audit society, where ordinary citizens hold government accountable for their decisions, evaluations have become an integrated part of information management systems. In this regard, Strathern (2000) refers to the concept of an “audit culture”. A number of authors have already discussed the possible contribution of evaluation towards the development of a more democratic society (Chelimsky, 2006; Greene, 2006; House and Howe, 1999; MacDonald, 1976 and 1978; McTaggart, 1991; Ryan, 2004 in Schurink and Schurink, 2009) and today it is widely accepted among scholars that evaluation has some part to play in modern society.

The questions posed in the introductory section of this article turns out to be difficult ones to answer since the answer largely depends on the context in which the democracy is embedded (Hanberger 2006) and by implication the particular democracy model followed by a government. Hanberger (2006) points out that there are basically three models of democracy each requiring a different type of evaluation approach. The three evaluation models are: elitist democracy (EDE), participative democracy (PDE) and deliberative democracy (DDE). As is clear from Table 1 below that these notions of democracy differ as to whether democracy is made for, by, or with the people (Schurink & Schurink, 2009 and Auriacombe, 2009).

**TABLE 1: CHARACTERISTICS OF DEMOCRATIC EVALUATION ORIENTATIONS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Democratic orientation</th>
<th>Intended use/ function</th>
<th>Evaluation focus</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
<th>Deliberation</th>
<th>Evaluators roles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EDE: For the people</td>
<td>Elite learning</td>
<td>Intended outputs</td>
<td>Policy and programme makers</td>
<td>Not important</td>
<td>Not important</td>
<td>Expert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rational feedback</td>
<td>Goal achievement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Programme accountability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDE: By the people</td>
<td>Self-learning</td>
<td>People’s own needs</td>
<td>Programme implementers</td>
<td>Very important</td>
<td>Important</td>
<td>Advocate Facilitator Coach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-determination</td>
<td>Goal development</td>
<td>Self-governed citizens/ clients</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Empowerment</td>
<td>Steps forward</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In an elitist democracy, evaluation mainly serves a rational feedback function with the emphasis on accountability of decision-makers, operating within a clear mandate given by the majority of citizens. Evaluation in a participative democracy mostly fulfills an empowerment and self-determination function while the function of evaluation in a deliberative democracy in the words of Hanberger (2006:24) is mostly used “to justify decisions and to attain conclusions that are binding, that is, to serve the function of justification” (Gutmann & Thompson, 2004). “This function is mostly associated with deliberative democracy, and thus promoting legitimacy to collective action when many actors and institutions are involved” (Gutmann & Thompson, 2004). DDE is constructed on the principles of free reasoning, general accessibility and on justifying and legitimatising public decisions, policies/programmes and action. Only in DDE and PDE are citizens given a role in public policy and evaluation.

As indicated in Table 1 above, the responsibility of evaluators differs in relation to the three models. The expected role for the EDE evaluator is that of an expert who has to provide the public with information in a top down fashion. The PDE evaluator adopts the role of advocate, facilitator and coach in order to enable self-learning, empowerment, self-governance and participation. Here the focus is on developing the involved citizens’ own needs and goals. The main role of the DDE evaluator is to act as a mediator and counselor, with a special emphasis on the development of mutually accepted processes and striving to build consensus through argumentation.

The many different classifications of evaluations into different approaches and models, (cf. Stufflebeam and Shinkfield, 2007) make it difficult to identify the evaluation methods that will best suit the task of addressing the problems of a democratic society. However, this task could be made easier if the three Democratic Evaluation Orientations (DEOs) identified by Hanberger (2006) could be used as a point of departure in the evaluation process. It is clear from this Table 1 above that people in different democratic orientations construe knowledge, truth, and relevance in markedly different ways and that they therefore require different types of evaluation methods to be used by public administrators in order to suit their context. From this perspective, the public administrator needs to take a specific approach when planning and conducting an evaluation.
THE DEVELOPMENT OF A CLASSIFICATION SYSTEM TO MEET THE NEEDS OF A DEMOCRATIC SOCIETY

Our attempts to address the identified weaknesses in current classification systems by means of the proposed development of an alternative classification system should be seen in the light of the needs of public administrators operating in a democratic society. The suggested typology makes extensive use of the building blocks identified by Guba and Lincoln (http://www.evaluate-europe.net/projects/eval3/.../Guba-Lincoln.doc). The focus of our proposed typology is the concepts ‘logic’, ‘ontology’, ‘epistemology,’ ‘axiology,’ ‘methodology and causal linkages. The author will firstly look at the different evaluation approaches from a philosophical point of view. More specifically the ontology and epistemology of the different approaches will be highlighted (see Table 2). The follow-up table (Table 3) will present the suggested typology within the parameters of methodology, axiology and causal linkages.

**Table 2: Different evaluation approaches from a philosophical point of view**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logic</th>
<th>Ontology (nature of reality)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Logical Positivism (Objectivism; Empiricism)</td>
<td>Pragmatism, Realism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deductive (arguing from the general to the particular; emphasis on a prior hypotheses (or theory).)</td>
<td>Choose explanations that best produce desired outcomes. Accept external reality. Reality is interpreted and negotiated; consensual.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naive realism - objective, external reality.</td>
<td>Subjective point of view. Ontological relativism - multiple social realities, products of human intellects, exist and may change as those who constructed them change. There are only multiple constructed realities. The real world could be discovered by means of a systematic, interactive methodological approach. Reality is internal; truth depends on the knower’s frame of reference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a single reality. Things in the world can be known directly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C.J. Auriacombe
### Epistemology (relationship of the knower to the known)
- Objective point of view. Knower and known are dualism, or independent. Learning is transferring what exists in reality to what is known by the learner.
- Both objective and subjective points of view.
- Subjective point of view. Knower and known are inseparable.

### Examples of the approach
- Experimental design, Quasi-experimental design
- Utilisation focused evaluation
- Fourth generation evaluation of Guba and Lincoln

**Source:** *(Own Observation)*

### Table 3: Different methods and values of evaluation approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Axiology (role of values in inquiry)</th>
<th>Logical Positivism (Objectivism; Empiricism)</th>
<th>Pragmatism/realism</th>
<th>Constructivism (Interpretivism; Naturalism)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inquiry is value-free.</td>
<td>Quantitative.</td>
<td>Quantitative &amp; Qualitative (mixed methods or mixed methodology).</td>
<td>Qualitative. Naturalistic, emergent research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inquiry is value-bound.</td>
<td>Values play a big role in interpreting results.</td>
<td>The research question is more important than both the method and paradigm underlying the method.</td>
<td>Focus on natural settings and external validity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Quantitative.</td>
<td>Quantitative and qualitative methods are compatible.</td>
<td>The researcher provides insights into the behaviour expressed and the meanings and interpretations that participants give to their life worlds. Use of first-person accounts, documents, and auto-ethnographies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experimental research design.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Focus on controlled settings and internal validity.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** *(Own Observation)*
As is clear from the preceding two tables, the philosophical/theoretical approaches to evaluation range from a positivistic, deductive perspective on the one side to a post-modern inductive and constructivist paradigm on the other side. These two opposites are classified into two main paradigms namely, the quantitative versus the qualitative. In the middle of these two extremes lies a third approach that is both deductive and inductive namely the pragmatic paradigm. Following on this evaluation, research may adopt a quantitative, a qualitative or a mixed-methods research approach (Hartsliëf and Auriacombe, 2009). This means that the research will either be: (i) deductive (drawing on existing abstract theories in scholarly disciplines to develop models explaining the relationship between programme treatments and outcomes), (ii) inductive (delineating and elucidating concrete perceptions and/or theories held by programme staff and stakeholders regarding what the programme does to produce its desired outcomes); or (iii) user-focused (helping intended users to articulate their operating theory) (Auriacombe, 2005 and Auriacombe and Mouton, 2007). According to Patton (2008) blending paradigms boils down to making use of a paradigm of choices. He believes that in this way the unhealthy competition between the two paradigms can be solved by blending both quantitative and qualitative methods into one paradigm.

The ontological viewpoints of logical positivists rests on a naive realistic belief in an objective, external reality while constructivists believe that there is no real world or truth out there but only a narrative truth, implying that reality can only be known by those who experience it personally. Realists or pragmatists on the other hand believe that an external reality exists that can be discovered by means of a systematic, interactive methodological approach (Auriacombe, 2009 and Mouton, Auriacombe and Lutabingwa, 2006).

Quantitative evaluation approaches normally take the form of experimental designs while qualitative research makes use of methods associated with interpretivism including analytic induction and grounded theory. The pragmatist/realist perspective on the other hand uses both quantitative and qualitative methods (a mixed or integrated methodological approach). An analysis of both the above tables shows that a combination of qualitative as well as quantitative evaluation paradigms can enhance our ability to do evaluation research. More specifically it could help governments to develop participatory management programmes and practices (Auriacombe, 2007).

When the role of theory in the different evaluation approaches is analysed, it is clear that some are value-driven while others are value-free. More specifically positivist research will be value-free while constructivist research will be value-bound. Values will also play a large role in the pragmatist approach. A comparison between the evaluation needs of the different democratic orientations as identified by Hanberger (2006) with the three most important evaluation approaches presented in Figure 1, clearly shows a relationship between the two. This relationship mainly
lies in the way the philosophical evaluation approaches (positivism, pragmatism and constructivism) are able to address the needs of evolving democratic orientations (See Figure 1).

**FIGURE 1: RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE NEEDS OF DEMOCRATIC SOCIETIES WITH DIFFERENT ORIENTATIONS AND DIFFERENT EVALUATION PARADIGMS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logical positivism</th>
<th>Pragmatism</th>
<th>Constructivism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the people</td>
<td>By the people</td>
<td>With the people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme accountability</td>
<td>Evaluation focus needed</td>
<td>Empowerment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: (Adapted from Hanberger 2006)*

As is clear from Figure 1, elitist democracy mainly needs a rational feedback with the emphasis on accountability and good governance. Therefore, this evaluation need will best be served by a logical positivistic approach. In contrast, participative democracy mostly needs an evaluation process fostering empowerment and self-determination. This need is best fulfilled by a pragmatic approach such as the utilisation-focused evaluation of Patton (2008). On the other hand the evaluation needs of a deliberative democracy will best be fulfilled by using an evaluation approach fostering free reasoning and the participation of all stakeholders in on-going discussions, such as the fourth generation evaluation method of Guba and Lincoln (1989).

To operate well, different models of democracy need different supportive tools, for example, one such tool is evaluation. Generally, the need for evaluation grows when new governance models are introduced. This is especially true in transitional societies, such as South Africa, where new public management models or multi-level governance models are developed to replace the old and where a fragile democracy needs to be strengthened. As Hanberger (2006:24) explains, accountability and effectiveness have become the key words in public administration. Governments are therefore expected to render effective services and to be accountable to their citizens. This is even more evident in transitional societies where rapid changes take place and where the political and administrative roles are unclear. Therefore, a “democratic function of evaluation is to help increase effectiveness and rationality in public policy and democratic governance” (Hanberger, 2006: 23).
Citizen participation is high on the global agenda, hence the discussions on participatory democracy. In essence, this means that democratic governance demands the participation of citizens in government structures. The participatory theory of democracy assumes that people’s participation fosters democracy. Therefore participation is the most important quality of a democracy (Hanberger, 2006:24). Evaluation can also serve as a tool to turn around the feeling of declining trust in government (Hanberger 2006). In this way, evaluation could be used to recreate trust and legitimacy especially in transitional societies. Accordingly, functions of evaluation could be: legitimising those in power, developing programmes and policies, and implementing a model for the development of democracy. The democratic functions of evaluations can also prevail in other ways. As Hanberger (2006:24) states: “evaluations can and should have an enlightenment function or a learning function in democratic governance”.

In line with resolutions taken by the World Summit, ordinary people are called upon to hold government accountable and to influence governance and service delivery (Walker & Tompson, 2008). It is therefore now more necessary than ever before to take a critical look at the current way evaluation research is implemented in a participatory democratic setup. It is clear from Figure 1 that positivist evaluation approaches providing a rational feedback to citizens can no longer meet the needs of a democratic society based on citizen participation (Hanberger, 2006).

When citizens are given an active role in public policy-making and are expected to contribute to the development and implementation of a policy or programme, a participatory or deliberative democracy is promoted (Hanberger, 2006). This participatory role clearly demands evaluation methods that are designed and used in policy processes where stakeholders, including citizens, are given a partnership role and responsibilities. A democratic function of evaluation is therefore to help increase effectiveness and rationality in public policy and democratic governance (Hanberger, 2006). Evaluation could thus become a democratising force with evaluators advocating on behalf of disempowered groups within societies (Mouton, 2007:502).

**CONCLUSION**

This article focused on the presentation of evaluation methods that could specifically be used by public administrators to help increase effectiveness and rationality in public policy and democratic governance. Because the emphasis of a democratic society is currently placed on citizen participation, it is argued that a participatory evaluation approach would best suit the needs of a democratic society.

The article highlighted the historical background and importance of evaluation in governance and introduced a classification of democracy models and the type of evaluation needed. The relationship between the needs of democratic societies with different evaluation paradigms, was explained. It also discussed the different
methods and values of evaluation approaches from a philosophical point of view. The article then moved towards the development of a classification system to meet the needs of democratic society to improve good governance.

REFERENCES


http://ec.europa.eu/research/evaluations/pdf/archive/fp6-evidencebase/evaluation_studies_and_reports/evaluation_studies_and_reports_2005/social_


ABSTRACT

Good governance, the Holy Grail all countries, particularly developing countries, seek has been a topic of interest in Africa since the 1990s, spurred by concerns about the continent’s lagging development. This article analyses the quality of South African governance based on 2007 to 2012 Mo Ibrahim Index of African Governance (IAG) reports, which provide substantial, reliable and objective data for analysis. The IAG responds to the need for a relevant, objective, quantitative instrument for measuring quality of African governance and facilitating institutionalisation of good governance. African leaders have been concerned with devising an appropriate mechanism that would not only measure quality of governance but, more importantly, provide an opportunity for countries to improve through learning from one another. Bad governance, invariably synonymous with pursuit and implementation of policies that are not in the interest of majority of citizens or policies with undesirable outcomes, is the bane of many developing countries globally, particularly in Africa. The apartheid regime in South Africa represented an epitome of bad governance. Dismantling of apartheid in 1994 marked a watershed in the country’s history and signaled the African National Congress-led democratic government’s determination to provide a ‘better life for all’. The eve of the twentieth anniversary of majority rule is opportune to assess South African governance. The article notes that although government performance has improved and the country consistently ranked fifth best-governed in Africa, performance in three of the four pillars (Safety and Rule of Law, Participation and Human Rights and Sustainable Economic Opportunity) has deteriorated from 2006 to 2011. In this period, minimal improvement has occurred in Human Development. It is recommended that government should prioritise Participation, Accountability, Infrastructure and Personal Safety, while not relapsing in the other IAG indicators.

INTRODUCTION

‘Governance’ is a buzzword in the discourse of development and resonates in policy debates in developed and developing economies alike (Stoker, 1998:18). In highlighting the polysemy of ‘governance’, Koechlin (2011:1-3) identifies four dominant approaches. The first is good governance, which focuses on the state and
denotes “a set of specific institutional features and configuration of an effective, efficient and accountable public sector”. This approach reflects a normative Western bias. The second approach to governance relates to policy making, which extends the state to other actors in planning, regulating and governing. The third approach, influenced by international relations and political science, is social-scientific concept involving cooperative action between state and non-state actors confronted with complex societal problems. This perspective involves issues of public interest beyond hierarchical, governmental or inter-governmental regulation and is said to hold potential for Africa. The fourth approach, an exploratory, rather than a fully-fledged analytical model, is social anthropological, actors-oriented, and focuses on actors, norms and practices involved in public services delivery.

The Economic Commission for Africa (1998) outlines four types of governance relevant to Africa. The first, economic governance, encompasses decision-making processes bearing on a country’s internal or external economic activities, which impacts on production of wealth, its distribution and quality of life. Political governance, the second, refers to political decision-making and policy implementation of a legitimate and authoritative democratic state with proper separation of powers (between the three arms of government namely, the legislative, executive and judiciary), a pluralist polity and regular and frequent participation of citizens in electing leaders and representatives. Thirdly, administrative governance refers to a system of administration and policy implementation carried out through an efficient, independent, accountable and open public sector. Finally, systemic governance embraces all the attributes of governance that enhance citizens’ lives and subsumes the other three types of governance. African countries face challenges in all four types of governance and need to construct and sustain systems that respond to economic, political and management needs of citizens.

As a concept, governance is broader than government (Nzongola-Ntalaja, 2003) and came into use because “the changed role of government and changed environment in which it has to discharge its role have brought governance into common usage as a process for which ‘government’ is no longer sufficient” (Corkery, 1999:12). Governance has a plethora of definitions. Rhodes (1996:653) suggests about six different uses of ‘governance’ exist. The most prominent definition of ‘governance’, however, is that of the World Bank (1997:1), cited in Holzer (2002): “… the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country’s economic and social resources for development”. Other notable definitions include Olouw and Sako (2002:37), Kaufmann, Kraay and Zoido-Lobatón (1999:1), and Kauzya (2003:1). Abdellatiff (2003) and Campbell (2000) explain the existence of multiple definitions of ‘governance’. The former states that: “governance, as a theoretical construct, separate from the theory of the state, is not only in an embryonic stage, but its formulation also differs among researchers depending on their ideological convictions” (Abdellatiff, 2003:3). Campbell (2000:4) offers three reasons to explain “the considerable amount of...
ambiguity and confusion surrounding the notion of governance as has been used by multilateral and bilateral funding and development institutions over the last decade”. First, is lack of a good management model coupled and conception of governance as a *modus operandi* in the corporate sector. Secondly, governance has multiple definitions and the notion is constantly evolving. Thirdly, ‘governance’ is not a neutral term; it is highly political. Pierre and Peters (2000:7) state that: “the concept of governance is notoriously slippery; it is frequently used among both social scientists and practitioners without a definition all agree on”. In fact, the impossibility of proffering a single, all-embracing definition of governance is likened to trying to “nail a pudding on the wall” (Bovaird and Löffler, 2003:316).

This article focuses on the prescriptive meaning of governance, the normative concept of ‘good governance’ (Kohler-Koch & Rittberger, 2006:29), which equates to the good governance approach identified by Koechlin (2011:2), and relates it to the Mo Ibrahim Foundation’s effort to assess and improve quality of governance in Africa. Specifically, the article highlights the significance of the Mo Ibrahim Index of African Governance (hereafter referred to as IAG) and analyses South Africa’s performance on it. It briefly examines the African Peer Review Mechanism (APRM), identifying voluntariness as its fundamental weakness, which has rendered the initiative impotent.

The article is organised in several discussions parts to address the foregoing issues. The first introduces the concept of governance and touches on multiplicity of definitions and different perspectives. The second part briefly examines the history and origin of the prescriptive concept of good governance and highlights its assumption of a global agenda, while the third part notes the cultural framing of governance, which militates against an existence of a commonly-agreed definition with a common set of attributes. The fourth part briefly examines the APRM, one of two initiatives aimed at assessing and improving African governance, noting its main weakness. The fifth part is a focused discussion on the background, uniqueness and composition of the IAG is provided as a foundation for analysis that follows. In the sixth part, this section presents a systematic, category-by-category in-depth analysis of South Africa’s performance on the IAG, including an indication of improvement or decline in performance for each pillar and sub-category from 2006 to 2011. The seventh and last part makes provision for drawing up the recommendations and finally making conclusions for the article.

**ORIGIN OF GOOD GOVERNANCE CONCEPT**

The concept of good governance is centuries old. Djikstra (2013:5) refers to Ambrogio Lorenzetti’s frescoes in the Palazzo Publicco (Siena, Italy), dating as far back as 1338-1340, depicting good governance as an enthroned king surrounded by virtues with images of orderliness and happy life, citizens paying taxes and engaging in productive and cultural activities as consequences. Conversely, bad governance is personified by the devil, with justice in chains. Its attendant
consequences include death and destruction, burning houses, idling citizens while land lies uncultivated. These depictions of the consequences of bad governance reflect its reality even today. The African Good Governance Network (AGGN) (2010:5) views the coupling of ‘good’ with governance bringing into being a whole new concept. ‘Good’ connotes a positive judgment about how a country is governed. It suggests good quality, desirability and what ought to be or striven for. Thus, ‘good governance’ is value-laden and implies existence of its opposite - bad governance, denoting negativity, how disastrous governance is or ought not to be. Good governance entails developing and implementing policies leading to delivery of desired political and socio-economic outcomes that improve citizens’ lives and is distinguishable from bad governance.

Bad governance might be described as a deviation from the practice or norms of good governance. Weiss (2000) characterises bad governance as personalisation of power, lack of human rights, endemic corruption and unelected and unaccountable governments. In contemporary Africa, bad governance is experienced in various forms, including: incumbent governments stealing elections, self-aggrandisement, corruption in various guises, inability of governments to maintain effective law and order, flagrant abuse of human rights and citizens’ being deprived of basic public services, and, among others. Marginalisation of majority of citizens, denial of access to basic public services and a lack of respect for human dignity and human rights were the apex of bad governance under the apartheid regime in South Africa.

Although the World Bank is thought to have brought the concept of good governance into public discourse in 1989, Mkandawire (2007:1) claims African scholars, including Clause Ake, Waheed Oshikoya, and Gladson Kayira, coined ‘good governance’ in the World Bank’s report, “Sub-Saharan Africa: from Crisis to Sustainable Growth. A long-term perspective study”, which popularised the concept. The concern of African scholars was to ensure state-society relations was developmental, democratic and socially inclusive (AGGN, 2010:6). Admittedly, however, international financial institutions must be credited with focusing “renewed attention on the concept of ‘governance’ within the development community in the 1980s” (de Alcântara 1998:107) by making an agenda of an existing idea and holding it as a condition coupled with open market, friendly and competitive economies and support for democratisation and improvement of human rights records for giving aid (AGGN, 2010:7). To buttress the point that good governance is endogenous to African systems of governance, the AGGN asserts that rules, principles and practices of fairness and respect for members had existed in traditional African societies to facilitate holistic development long before the term ‘good governance’ was coined.

Gray and Khan (2010:1) trace the good governance agenda to three sources, namely: first, theories developed in the area of new institutional economics on the salience of property rights for a market economy; secondly, theories highlighting the negative effects of rent and rent-seeking, and thirdly; political economy theories on
the potential of democratic accountability to reduce corruption and rent seeking. Further impetus for good governance agenda derives from econometric studies indicating a link between good governance and economic growth, although the nexus is disputable.

**CULTURAL BASIS OF GOOD GOVERNANCE**

Good governance has no functional or single-agreed upon definition (Aubut, 2004:8). It is affected by the cultural context (Abrams, Borrini-Feyerabend, Gardner & Heylings, 2003:19). As such, definitions are culture-dependent because societies differ in the emphasis they place on different aspects of governance (Plumptre & Graham, 1999:11). Definitional diversity is evident in the literature. Some authors (Nicolic, 2008; Hirst, 2000; Munshi, 2004) provide straightforward definitions while others, such as Overseas Development Administration (1993), combine definition with attributes. Although a unanimous definition of good governance does not exist, Nicolic (2008:12) states that: “governance is good when it ensures that political, social and economic priorities are based on a broader consensus in society, and that the voices of all are heard in decision-making over allocation of resources”. A lack of consensus on the attributes of good governance, invariably a result of different definitional formats, is evident in Wohlmuth (1998:7), UNESCAP (2006:1), Kauzya (2003:2), UNDP (1997, cited by Abdellatiff 2003:5), European Commission (cited by Parto 2005:5), UNHCR (cited by Chowdhury & Skarstedt 2005:5) and Economic Commission for Africa (1998), to mention a few.

Given the cultural orientation of definitions of good governance and its attributes, purely Western definitions and attributes of good governance do not meet the demands of African realities. While there is currently no concrete definition of good governance in the African context, AGGN (2010) suggests three perspectives from which good governance could be seen. First, from the political perspective, governance would be described as where sustainable human development is promoted. Generation, utilisation and accounting for public resources to society is the norm and the right of citizens to demand accountability are respected (AGGN, 2010:7-8). Secondly, from an environmental and natural resource perspective, good governance would be seen to exist where people are involved in democratically deciding how best to exploit the continent’s abundant natural resources sustainably for their own benefit and that of posterity. Finally, from a corporate governance perspective, good governance involves aligning the interests of politicians, bureaucrats and the electorate such and must ensure business codes direct, control and make institutions accountable (AGGN, 2010:9).

**Initial reaction to notion of good governance**

Politically, the notion of good governance did not initially meet with enthusiasm from African leaders because it was perceived to be associated with liberalism and laissez-faire policies in developed countries. Further, It was seen as subjective given “the context of large and diverse economies that characterise the developing
world” (Chowdhury & Skarstedt, 2005:11). There were also concerns about good governance seeming to be applied to states and entities in the South, but not those in Europe or North America where the concept was launched (Doornbros, 2003:40). However, as a result of its strong nexus with development, good governance commands a wide support among African leaders and citizens. Plumptre and Graham (1999:12) suggest different approaches to governance might be suited to different stages of development or historical circumstances. Being the least developed continent as a result of having been raped by colonial powers, abused by its own pioneering leaders and with different material circumstances to developed countries, one would expect the perception of good governance in Africa to differ in certain ways from how it is perceived elsewhere. It would appear the African concept of good governance is a balance between contextually relevant criteria and universal attributes of good governance in the literature, which constitute the guiding principles of the IAG. Development and launch of the IAG means Africa’s historical record of bad governance (Hope, 2003:2) is being addressed. The continent is no longer turning a blind eye to bad aspects of governance in the name of sovereignty (Herbert & Gruzd, 2008:4). Human rights are no longer subservient to collective welfare; one-party states out of fashion, and quasi-or full-scale dictatorships adorned with corruption, mismanagement and human rights violations fast fading. Good governance in Africa is not an option; it is the only hope for the continent to pull away from the precipice of under-development.

**Assessing and Improving Quality of African Governance**

Government exists to provide for citizens’ welfare in broad terms. In a continent saddled lagging development and poverty, inequality and unemployment in the midst of potential wealth evident in vast natural resources, good quality governance is essential to improve on citizens’ quality of life. Good governance is important for Africa’s development “because bad development management, institutional instabilities, and internal political shocks impede investment - domestic and foreign” (Wohlmuth 1998:10). What constitutes good governance, how to measure it and, ultimately, how to enhance its quality deserve focused attention. Before analysing South Africa’s government performance, the next three paragraphs briefly examine the African Peer Review Mechanism (APRM), an initiative aimed at highlighting governance practices and institutionalising good governance in Africa.

**African Peer Review Mechanism**

Although good governance has always been an important issue, African leaders started paying serious attention to it towards the beginning of the new millennium (Gruzd, 2009:4). The APRM is described as constituting “one of the most ambitious and innovative governance exercises undertaken in Africa and provides important opportunities for public dialogue” (Chéne, 2009:2). It is an initiative aimed at facilitating institutionalisation of good governance. Roots of the APRM can be traced
to the traditional African practice of consultation within one’s age-group peers for counsel, advice or direction when confronted with a situation. In recognition of the fact that “one of Africa’s greatest problems since independence is simply governance” (Hansungule n.d.,:2), the protocol establishing the APRM was agreed at the Organisation of African Unity Summit on 8 July 2002 and the first forum took place in 2004 (Herbert & Gruzd, 2008:4). The APRM was launched to address governance deficits in African countries and bring about good governance by pushing states to pursue policies and practices that conform to the agreed political, economic and corporate governance values, codes and standards contained in the Declaration on Democracy, Political, Economic and Corporate Governance (Hansungule n.d.,:2-3).

Touted as “the most ambitious piece of innovation to have come out of Africa since decolonisation” (Hansungule n.d.,:2), the APRM has five stages: preparation and self-assessment, country review mission, preparation of final country assessment, peer review by heads of states and presentation to the public and African institutions. In practice, however, rather than stages, five types of reviews are conducted, namely: country self-assessment report, background desk report by the Secretariat, experts’ assessment during country review mission, review by heads of state and two- to four-year self-assessments and country reviews, and on-going monitoring by civil society of progress towards implementing the Programme of Action, of which six monthly reports must be supplied by governments (Herbert & Gruzd, 2008:17).

Only on completion of all five stages can a country be said to have been reviewed. Of 29 countries that signed the APRM Memorandum of Understanding, as of September 2008 only nine (Ghana, Rwanda, Kenya, South Africa, Benin, Nigeria, Burkina Faso, Algeria and Uganda) had undergone the full process (Hodess, 2009:6). A major flaw of the APRM is the notion of voluntary participation, a relic from the OAU’s obsession with sovereignty, which has seen some of the worst-governed countries on the continent hidden from the limelight. The requirement of voluntary participation has rendered the APRM a virtually still-born initiative. Further, non-obligation of participating countries to accept and implement review findings make the APRM a paper tiger.

The Mo Ibrahim Index of African governance

The Mo Ibrahim Foundation, launched opportune in October 2006 to stem the tide of bad governance associated with many African states since independence from late 1950s onwards and its negative impact on development, aims at:

- providing a framework and tools with which citizens and governments can assess and measure progress in governance;
- recognising excellence in African leadership and provide a practical way in which leaders can build positive legacies on the continent when they have left national office;
stimulating debate on the quality of governance and major governance issues in Africa; and

The IAG is one of four programmes the Foundation runs to achieve its objectives. The Index was first published in September 2007 (Mo Ibrahim Foundation, 2007:1). It is an innovative ranking of governance in sub-Saharan Africa developed by Rotberg and Gisselquist at Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University for two main purposes, namely: first, to provide objective criteria by which citizens can hold their governments to account and, secondly, stimulate debate about governance across sub-Saharan Africa and the world (Mo Ibrahim Foundation, 2007:1). Its aim is to “measure the quality of political goods provided by African states to their citizens” (Saisana, Annoni & Nardo 2009:9). The IAG is both a mechanism for measuring as well as institutionalising good governance in Africa.

The IAG is touted as setting benchmarks not only for Africa, but for the world. Its key features are: comprehensiveness of measures, focus on measurable key political goods, wide coverage of countries, ranking based on governance quality, and progressive expansion and refinement of criteria. The significance of the Index is that good governance is measured against key criteria and conditions deemed essential for a meaningful life for Africans. It is, therefore, a credible and appropriate instrument with which African countries’ governance performance may be measured. According to Rotberg and Gisselquist (2008:8), the IAG not only enables citizens and civil society to compare their government’s performance with that of other governments within and beyond their region, but also enables governing authorities themselves to compare their performance with their counterparts across Africa. Further, the IAG enables citizens, governments, donors and international organisations to see areas of weakness they need to make improvement.

**Uniqueness of the Index**

Globally, measurement of governance quality is an enterprise of interest, which has resulted in a proliferation of governance measurement models with varying degrees of merit and practical usefulness. Compared with other standard measures of governance such as the United Nations Development Programme’s Human Development Index (HDI), Transparency International’s Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI) and the World Bank’s World Governance Indicators (WGI), the IAG is unique in two main respects.

First of all, while the CPI and HDI adopt a narrow definition by focusing on certain components of governance, the IAG measures governance broadly, a property it shares with the WGI, Overseas Development Institute’s World Governance Assessment (WGA), United Nations Economic Commission for Africa’s African Governance Report, United Nations Development Programme’s Governance Indicators Project and the World Economic Forum’s Global Governance Initiative.
(Rotberg & Gisselquist, 2009:8). The IAG’s definition is also more encompassing than that of the APRM, which sees governance as political governance, relating to rule of law, democracy and human rights. For the IAG, ‘good governance’ is construed as delivery of core political goods in a number of categories, which all governments, irrespective of place, culture or ideology, provide. Further, it emphasises good governance may be captured objectively in figures and statistics showing different ways and levels of achieving it by different governments. On the contrary, definition of ‘good governance’ in the WGI, WGA and Africa Governance Report (2005) is based on perceptions or processes devoid of objectivity.

Secondly, the IAG coverage is wide. Only the WGI comes closer to it. Other governance measures have far more limited coverage. Since 2009, the IAG has been providing a comprehensive view of governance in all African countries, a marked improvement on 2007 and 2008 when it excluded Algeria, Egypt, Libya, Morocco and Tunisia.

**Components of the Index**

The final index is based on a simple average at all levels of aggregation (sub-pillar, pillar, overall Index) (Saisana et al., 2009:4). Governance being intangible, it is measured indirectly by observing variables describing its different latent dimensions (Saisana et al., 2009:9). Before 2009, the IAG was based on five categories, each with sub-categories and sub-sub-categories, namely: Safety and Security; Rule of Law, Transparency and Corruption; Participation and Human Rights; Sustainable Economic Opportunity; and Human Development. According to Saisana et al. (2009:3), “... these five categories of political goods are considered to encapsulate the performance of any government”. However, in 2009, Rule of Law, Transparency and Corruption, and Safety and Security were merged, reducing the pillars to four, in line with a policy of continuous improvement of the IAG. The reconstituted pillar is labelled ‘Safety and Rule of Law’. Comprehensiveness of the IAG is evident in the composition of its pillars and their components. The four pillars have 14 sub-categories, with 88 indicators and 123 constituent variables (IAG, 2012:9). Each pillar and its components are briefly described in the next paragraph.

Safety and Rule of Law has four sub-categories, with 21 indicators: Rule of Law, 5; Accountability, 6; Personal Safety, 5; and National Security, 5 (IAG, 2012:16). Participation and Human Rights is made up of three sub-categories, with 19 indicators, namely: Participation, 5; Rights, 7; and Gender, 7 (IAG, 2012:16). Sustainable Economic Opportunity comprises 28 indicators in four sub-categories: Public Management, 12; Business Environment, 5; Infrastructure, 5; and Rural Sector, 6 (IAG, 2012:17). Human Development comprises three sub-categories, with 20 indicators: Welfare, 9; Education, 6; and Health, 5 (IAG, 2012:17). With a not-so-glorious history of governance in African countries since independence, manifested in a record of one-party state dictatorships; economic mismanagement,
leading to poverty and under-development amidst vast resources; unemployment, particularly of the youth; high levels of inequality; illiteracy, ignorance and prevalence of preventable disease; marginalisation of sections of society; violations of human rights and other ills, the basket of political and socio-economic goods contained in the IAG constitutes relevant criteria for assessing quality of African governance.

**ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICA’S GOVERNANCE PERFORMANCE**

This section analyses South Africa’s performance from 2006 to 2011, reflected in 2007 to 2012 IAG reports. This assessment is of special interest and significance.

**Motivation and significance**

Since assuming power in 1994 with the promise of ‘a better life for all’, the African National Congress-led government has dismantled most of the apartheid regime’s political and socio-economic infrastructure that served a minority, adopted a progressive constitution and established wide-ranging, all-inclusive policies and institutions. Hopefully, this means uneven national and human development; human rights abuses; endemic unemployment, poverty and inequality; and political, economic and socio-cultural marginalisation of majority of the population belong to the past.

On the eve of South Africa’s twentieth anniversary of majority rule and seven years since the IAG was launched, it is instructive to assess the country’s quality of governance performance for the past seven years based on this objective instrument. The motivation for 2006 being the starting point is that the IAG was launched in 2007. As such, relevant and comprehensive data were available for rating scores for the previous year. In this regard two need to be clarified from the onset. First, IAG reports are released one year after data have been collected. This means, for example, that the 2012 report provides results for data collected in 2011. Secondly, rating scores for the four pillars and their sub-categories/indicators and their variables are lagging. In other words, scores reflect the past year’s performance; they are historical snapshots. Consequently, the indicators are not, in any way, indicative or predictive of future performance.

**Interpretation of rating scores**

For the sake of simplicity and consistency, all reported rating scores are rounded to the nearest whole number. Further, rating scores for Rule of Law, Transparency and Corruption, and Safety and Security for 2006, 2007 and 2008 are reported directly under the reconstituted Safety and Rule of Law pillar to bring them in line with the 2009 change, as reflected in the 2012 IAG report.

Since the Mo Ibrahim Foundation provides no guidance on interpretation of performance rating scores, the following interpretation has been adopted to facilitate analysis of data presented in all tables:
0-49 = poor, underperformance or below the threshold;
50-59 = average performance;
0-69 = good performance;
0-79 = very good performance; and
80-100 = excellent performance.

Pillar and sub-category analyses

Data on South Africa’s performance in each of the four pillars are presented in Tables 2 to 5.

Safety and Rule of Law

As mentioned earlier, in line with practice in the 2012 IAG report, rating scores for this reconstituted pillar are for the six-year period, instead of being separated into two sets of scores, one set representing 2006 to 2008 for Rule of Law, Transparency and Corruption, and Safety and Security, and the other set for the reconstituted pillar (Safety and Rule of Law) from 2009 to 2011. Table 1 shows South Africa’s overall performance in Safety and Rule of Law was very good from 2006 to 2008, changed to good in 2009 and 2010 and improved to very good in 2011.

Table 1: Scores on indicators of Safety and Rule of Law (2006-2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
<th>Rule of Law</th>
<th>Accountability</th>
<th>Personal Safety</th>
<th>National Security</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>79.0</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>76.6</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>86.4</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>69.1</td>
<td>84.9</td>
<td>74.1</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>69.5</td>
<td>86.4</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>95.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>95.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Extracted from IAG (2012:129)

The National Security indicator is made up of the following components: cross-border tensions, involvement of government in armed conflict, domestic armed conflict, political refugees produced by the system and existence of internally displaced people. As the table shows, South Africa’s performance on this indicator has been excellent throughout the period. Similarly, the country achieved excellent rating scores in Rule of Law, which consists of the following variables: judicial process, judicial independence, sanctions, transfer of power and property rights.
has been excellent. A consistently very good performance was recorded and achieved in Accountability, constituted by the following variables: public sector accountability, transparency and corruption; accountability, transparency and corruption in rural areas; corruption and bureaucracy; accountability of public officials; corruption in government and public officials; and prosecution of abuse of power, although scores have been on a steady decline since 2006. The Achilles’ heel (weakest spot) was Personal Safety, which comprises physical integrity rights/political terror; social unrest; safety of the person; violent crime and human trafficking. Rating scores have been poor (below 40) throughout the period.

**Participation and Human Rights**

Table 2 depicts South Africa’s performance in Participation and Human Rights, which is made up of three categories of indicators, namely: Participation, Rights and Gender. The overall rating scores for the six-year period were very good, reaching a peak in 2006, but dropping in subsequent years. Participation indicators include free and fair executive elections, free and fair elections, political participation, electoral self-determination and effective power to govern. Excellent performance rating scores were achieved in 2006 and 2007, but with decreasing scores declined to very good in subsequent years. Of all the indicator categories, Rights, comprises core international human rights conventions, human rights, political rights, workers’ rights and various freedoms and civil liberties as variables, attained the least rating scores with a fairly consistent good performance. In 2006, the second lowest rating score for the entire period was achieved, rising to the highest for the period in 2007, but dropping in 2008 and even further in 2009 to it lowest level. Since 2010, rating scores have only slightly improved over the 2008 rating score.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
<th>Participation</th>
<th>Rights</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>91.9</td>
<td>67.7</td>
<td>67.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>73.5</td>
<td>81.9</td>
<td>69.2</td>
<td>69.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>72.6</td>
<td>78.6</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>72.9</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>76.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>74.1</td>
<td>68.9</td>
<td>76.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>73.3</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>68.9</td>
<td>78.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Extracted from IAG (2012:129)*

The Gender indicator, which is made up of gender equality; gender balance in primary and secondary education; women’s participation in the labour force; gender representation in rural areas; women in parliament; women’s economic rights and legislation on violence against women as its variables, started off with good rating scores in 2006 and 2007 and moved up to the very good band from 2008 to 2011, with improved rating scores.
Sustainable Economic Opportunity

Table 3 portrays rating scores for the four indicators (Public Management, Business Management, Infrastructure and Rural Sector) of Sustainable Economic Opportunity. Overall, South Africa’s performance in Sustainable Economic Development was good throughout the six-year period, with 2007 registering a slight improvement over 2006. The rating score declined in 2008, but picked up in 2009 and 2010 before dipping to the second lowest level in six years. Variables for Public Management indicator are: statistical capacity, public administration, inflation, diversification, reserves, budget management, total revenue to total expenditure ration, ratio of budget deficit (surplus GDP), fiscal policy, external debt service to exports ratio, reliability of financial institutions and revenue collection. Very good performance was registered in Public Management during the period, with rating scores highest from 2006 to 2008, but declining thereafter. Business Environment, with competitive environment/competition, unfair competitive practices, investment climate, investment climate for rural business, rural financial services development, and bureaucracy and red tape as variables, maintained a fairly consistent good performance for the first three years, but achieved very good rating scores in the next three years.

Table 3: Scores on indicators of Sustainable Economic Opportunity (2006-2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
<th>Public Management</th>
<th>Business Environment</th>
<th>Infrastructure</th>
<th>Rural Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>77.5</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>46.9</td>
<td>57.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>63.1</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>57.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>60.5</td>
<td>77.4</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>39.2</td>
<td>57.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>62.0</td>
<td>74.7</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>63.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>76.2</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>64.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>41.2</td>
<td>57.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Extracted from IAG (2012:129)

Variables constituting the Infrastructure indicator include access to electricity, road and rail network, air transport facilities, telephone network and IT infrastructure, mobile phone subscribers, household computers and Internet subscribers. Rating scores for Infrastructure were the worst of the four indicator categories, all well below the threshold. The Rural Sector indicator comprises public resources for rural development, access to land and access to water for agriculture, agricultural research and extension services, agricultural input and produce markets, policy and legal framework for rural organisations, and dialogue between government and rural organisations. Average performance was recorded in the first three years, followed by a marked improvement (good performance) in 2009 and 2010 and a downward spiral into average performance in 2011.
Human Development

This pillar has three broad categories: Welfare, Education and Health. In the six-year period, the country’s overall performance in Human Development was very good, with the best scores recorded in 2007 and 2008. Since 2008, rating scores have declined, but remain within the excellent band.

Indicators for Welfare include welfare regime, social protection and labour, social exclusion, welfare services (health and educational), equity of public resource use, access to piped/improved water, access to improved sanitation/open defecation sanitation, and environmental policy and environmental sustainability. Performance in Welfare mirrors that overall rating performance. Very good rating scores were achieved throughout the six-year period, starting with 75.7 in 2006 and reaching a peak of 77.9 and 77.8 for 2007 and 2008, respectively. However, rating scores declined in the last three years, but remained within the very good band. Table 4 shows rating scores for the three indicators during the period.

Table 4: Scores on indicators of Human Development (2006-2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
<th>Welfare</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Health</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>77.3</td>
<td>80.2</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>77.4</td>
<td>77.9</td>
<td>82.9</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>77.8</td>
<td>76.8</td>
<td>80.4</td>
<td>76.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>75.9</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>71.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>76.6</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>73.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>76.6</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>73.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IAG (2012:129)

Education, the best-performing indicator in Sustainable Economic Development, is made up of the following variables: education provision and quality, primary school pupil-teacher ratio, primary school completion, progression to secondary school, tertiary enrolment and literacy. It was rated excellent throughout the six-year period, with identical rating scores except for 2007 when this indicator registered its highest rating score. Health, the last indicator has maternal mortality, child mortality, immunisation against measles and immunisation against DPT, antiretroviral treatment provision and antiretroviral treatment provision for pregnant women, and malaria and tuberculosis as variables. From a good rating score of 69.6 in 2006, subsequent years saw this indicator rated as very good, peaking in 2008. Since then, rating scores declined, but stayed within the ‘very good’ performance band.

Overall performance

By way of summary, Table 5 provides a bird’s-eye view of South Africa’s overall performance on the IAG for each year and each category over the six-year period.
Throughout this period, the country’s overall rating has remained consistently very good, peaking in 2006 and 2007, but slightly declining since then. Safety and Rule of Law started off being excellent in the first three years, declined in 2009 and 2010 and reverted to its 2007 situation 2011. The country’s performance in Participation and Human Rights has been excellent, peaking in 2006, followed by slight declining rating scores since then.

**Table 5: Summary of South Africa’s overall performance in the four pillars (2006-2011)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Overall rating/ Ranking</th>
<th>Safety &amp; Rule of Law</th>
<th>Participation &amp; Human Rights</th>
<th>Sustainable Economic Development</th>
<th>Human Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>71.8</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>75.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>73.5</td>
<td>63.1</td>
<td>77.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>72.6</td>
<td>60.5</td>
<td>77.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>69.1</td>
<td>72.9</td>
<td>62.0</td>
<td>75.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>69.5</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>76.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>70.7</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>73.3</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>76.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Extracted from IAG (2012:129)*

In Sustainable Economic Development, scores have remained good (between 64 and 67) throughout, with slight decline in 2008 and 2011. Human Development has been the best domain of performance, with a very good score in 2006, improvements in 2007 and 2008 and a slight decline since then. This analysis shows a generally healthy picture of South African governance. However, to fully appreciate what lies behind these absolute figures, it is important to examine pattern of performance (improvement and decline) for each pillar and its subcategories over the years.

**Pattern of performance**

A clearer picture of South Africa’s quality of governance emerges from a summary of improvement and decline in performance rating scores for each of the four pillars and their respective sub-categories for the seven-year period. Table 6 indicates deviations in performance for the main pillars and their respective sub-categories. In this period, overall performance (composite index) declined by -1.1.
Table 6: Change in South Africa’s overall performance rating scores for each pillar and sub-category from 2006 to 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safety &amp; Rule of Law (-1.9)</th>
<th>Participation &amp; Human Rights (-2.4)</th>
<th>Sustainable Economic Development (-0.9)</th>
<th>Human Development (+0.9)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rule of Law -1.5</td>
<td>Participation -18.9</td>
<td>Public Management -1.5</td>
<td>Welfare -1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountability -8.5</td>
<td>Rights +1.2</td>
<td>Business Management +3.0</td>
<td>Education +0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Safety -2.5</td>
<td>Gender +10.6</td>
<td>Infrastructure -5.8</td>
<td>Health +4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Security +5</td>
<td>Rural Sector +0.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IAG (2012:128)

From the table, it is clear only one pillar of governance (Human Development) registered a modest overall improvement (+0.9) in the seven-year period. In this pillar, only Health indicator improved significantly (+4.2). Education recorded negligible improvement (+0.1), while Welfare experienced a -1.6 drop in the seven-year period. The country’s overall performance in the other three pillars declined, moderately for both Participation and Human Rights, and Safety and Rule of Law and slightly for Sustainable Economic Opportunity. Rather alarmingly, all sub-categories of Safety and Rule of Law, except National Security, weakened, the worst being Accountability. Participation and Human Rights saw a -2.4 drop over the years. While Gender and Rights recorded excellent and moderate improvements, Participation registered a steep decline (-18.9). Rating scores for Sustainable Economic Opportunity declined by -0.9 over the years. Only Business Management saw a modest improvement, with Rural Sector showing marginal improvement. Infrastructure declined significantly, while Public Management registered moderate decline.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the analysis, it is recommended that government pays particular attention to four key areas. First, continuous education of citizens on the need for public participation needs to be intensified. Citizens need to be given opportunities to register their voices meaningfully and taken seriously in governance, especially at the local level where their input in making and shaping policies affecting their lives is particularly important. Secondly, there is a need to improve governmental accountability. Concerted, well-coordinated efforts must be made to counter corruption at national, provincial and local spheres of government before it reaches highest proportions. Thirdly, personal safety needs to be prioritised for all the citizens, particularly the vulnerable: the elderly, women and children. Fourthly,
infrastructure needs government’s focused attention since it is the backbone of sustainable development. Finally, Welfare, Rule of Law and Public Management as well as other indicators modest improvement made need further government’s attention.

**CONCLUSION**

Since 2006, South Africa has consistently been ranked as the fifth best-governed country on the continent after Mauritius, Cape Verde, Seychelles and Botswana. However, underlying this sterling performance is a not-so-positive side: declining performance in three pillars and seven indicators, and minimal improvement in three indictors. Government needs to focus on consistently improving performance in all fourteen sub-categories. Good governance, as defined by the IAG, is delivery of political and social goods to citizens, leading to improved lives. While absolute figures for the four pillars of governance are impressive, analysis of sub-categories and changes of the seven-year period suggests otherwise. Participation, the constitutionally-mandated priority of the new democracy, is weakening and so is Accountability. Infrastructure development continues to lag behind and constitutes a major area of weakness. Personal safety remains problematic, especially for the vulnerable, including elderly people, women and children. Given these negative developments, perhaps it is not surprising service delivery protests persist as a constant reminder to government of poorer citizens’ plight. Consequently, government has to not only arrest declining performance in accountability, participation, infrastructure and other weakening indicators, but also ensure consistent improvement in all indicators of governance. Implementation of the recommendations alongside other measures will go a long way towards addressing these governance issues.

**REFERENCES**


Aubut, J. 2004. The good governance agenda: who wins and who loses. Some


Hansungule, M. n.d. Overview paper on the role of the APRM in strengthening


http://belfercenter.ksg.harvard.edu/files/xstandard/revised_index_briefing.pdf [Accessed 8 July 2013].


ROLE OF LEADERSHIP IN CREATING COMMITMENT IN THE PUBLIC SERVICE

M.J. Mafunisa
Department of Public and Development Administration
University of Venda

ABSTRACT

Public servants play a major role in providing services that are responsive to the needs of members of the public. Public servants should be commitment to their work. Worthwhile commitment does not come automatically. It has to be created. Creating commitment in public servants contributes in developing a positive work ethic as commitment is one of its behavioural indicants. In this article, the description of the term commitment will be provided. Four pillars of creating commitment will be identified and discussed. These pillars are: a sense of belonging to the public service, a sense of excitement in the job, confidence in leadership and public servant competencies that allow success. The informing of public servants about the public service values and involving them in making decisions that affect their work will be used to indicate how public servants can be influenced to feel that they belong to the public service. It is concluded that the manifestations of unethical behaviour by senior public functionaries not only reduce the morale of many committed junior public servants but also negatively influence others in engaging themselves in similar practices. To break this culture of unethical behaviour, experience indicates that frying a big fish is essential. Big, corrupt actors must be named and punished so that a cynical citizenry believes that an anti-corruption drive is more than words.

INTRODUCTION

Public servants play a major role in ascertaining, producing and providing the products and services that are responsive to their needs timeously. Public servants should be commitment to their work. Worthwhile commitment does not come automatically and needs to be created. Creating commitment in public servants contributes in developing a positive work ethic as commitment is one of its behavioural indicants. In this article, the description of the term commitment will be provided. Four pillars of creating commitment will be identified and discussed. These pillars are: a sense of belonging to the public service, a sense of excitement in the job, confidence in leadership and public servant competencies that allow success. The informing of public servants about the public service values and involving them in making decisions that affect their work will be used to indicate how public servants can be influenced to feel that they belong to the public service.
It is concluded that the manifestations of unethical behaviour by political and administrative leadership not only reduce the morale of many committed junior public servants but also negatively influence others in engaging themselves in similar practices. To break this culture of unethical behaviour, experience indicates that *frying a big fish* is essential. Political and administrative leaders must be named and punished so that a cynical citizenry believes that an anti-corruption drive is more than words.

**CONCEPT COMMITMENT**

According to Martin and Nicholls (1987:3) commitment entails such things as: using one’s time constructively, making that extra effort, getting it right first time, accepting change, willingness to try something new, making suggestions, co-operating with others, developing one’s abilities, seeking continuous improvement, enjoying one’s job, giving loyal support where needed and not neglecting details. A committed workforce is one that is working together, with every public servant doing the best, and getting satisfaction from the common effort to do their level best. Committed public servants feel that they belong, are excited about their job and have confidence in their leadership.

Commitment deals with the will of a human being. An individual public servant cannot force commitment on behalf of someone else. Commitment is personal, evolving from within a human being. Worthwhile commitment is voluntary, unleashing a determination and enthusiasm for that which is regarded as essential. In this case public servants are expected to be committed to the services or goals of the public service. Commitment is facilitated by personal choice. When public servants are told what do and implicitly forced to do it, either by threat of punishment or promise of reward, they feel little commitment to it. They do not own the task, i.e. they do not feel responsible for how it is done. When public servants volunteer or agree to perform the job, they feel more committed to do it. They feel personally responsible for its success or failure. Personal choice can be involved at numerous points in the relations between the public service and the public servant. The public service should not overlook the opportunity to allow public servants a personal choice in the assignment of daily tasks (Cherrington, 1980:169).

Senior public servants often decide what to do and instruct junior public servants to do it. Although junior public servants know that they cannot refuse without being disciplined, they would have preferred to be asked rather than instructed. Thus it may be stated that public servants feel more committed to the job if they are requested and if they volunteer to do the job rather than being instructed. Public service commitment implies identification with the public service and acceptance of its goals and values as one’s own. The activities of the public service are essential to the public servant. The committed public servant’s involvement in the public service takes on moral overtones, and his/her stake extends beyond the satisfaction.
of a merely personal interest in employment, income, and intrinsically rewarding work. The public servant becomes conscious of the goals of the public service and sensitive to how his/her actions contribute to the fulfilment of those goals. To identify with the public service implies that the public servant is willing to expend effort for the sake of the public service, and the public service performance is experienced as a personal success or failure as well. Committed public servants defend the public service when threatened and desire to maintain their employment relationship even when offered attractive alternatives (Lincoln & Kalleberg 1992:22-23). Research (Cherrington, 1980:167) indicates that commitment is indeed related to work values and performance. Public service commitment refers to the strength of an individual’s identification with and involvement in a particular public service.

CREATING COMMITMENT

As indicated above commitment does not develop within public servants automatically, it has to be created. Creating commitment has four major pillars. The four pillars are described in the following paragraphs.

Sense of Belonging to the Public Service

A sense of belonging to the public service builds the required loyalty that is necessary to overcome the barriers of them and us. It has long been recognised as one of the most powerful forces that bind people together, whether in families, clans, tribes or nations. Senior public servants create this sense of belonging by ensuring that the workforce is simultaneously informed and involved. Communicating the strategic goals and core values of the public service downward through each level of hierarchy creates a focus. At each level, these goals and values should be translated into the work and decisions of each public servant. Public servants should be guided in the right direction to have their efforts focused. Shea (1990:33) states that the art of leadership consists of concentrating the attention of the junior public servants against a predetermined mission or focus.

According to Charlton (1992:50) a mission’s purpose is to create an attractive future that stimulates public servants and enable them to define their roles within the public service; and which assists public servants to engage in a creative and purposeful venture. A mission provides focus concerning the main purpose of the public service and transmits unbridled clarity of what is expected from public servants. Kinlaw (1993:12) also argues that commitment is evidenced in the purposeful, focused behaviour of public servants who are willing to sacrifice their time and energy in order to ensure quality of work.

Need to be informed

The need to be informed is essential in human relationships. A feeling of not knowing why actions are undertaken and being cut off from information destroys trust. Among ways of informing the workforce, team briefing is a structured cascading of information down from top management to the public servants at
lower hierarchical structures. Junior public servants are regularly briefed by their immediate senior public servants, to ensure that information is appropriately worded for the listeners. Team briefing is often supplemented by video tapes and the senior public servants need to be available to answer questions. Information that has been previously kept confidential also needs to be disclosed in order to keep the team informed. Departments in the public service that give access to information are convinced that the benefits in increased understanding and commitment far outweigh the possible threats to confidentiality (Martin & Nicholls, 1987:14-17).

Without information public servants become unaware of the actions being undertaken by the leadership. They would not know what progress is being made toward the achievement of public service goals and would not know how to help make those goals achievable (Dell, 1988:37). If public servants are not informed they feel unessential, overlooked and undervalued. When public servants do not obtain adequate information, they form subgroups to create their own information. These groups are called grapevines or cliques. Instead of using their time and energy doing their work they create diversions. When public servants are excluded, the public service loses both efficiency and commitment. Nicol (1991:368) contends that when public servants are communicated with, they find enthusiasm and commitment. Informed public servants feel that they are accepted as valued members of the public service. Studying perceptions of competence, research (Godsell, 1983:47) indicates that the public servant’s feeling of acceptance by his/her colleagues precede feelings of competence. A practical reason for this is that many public servants reported that until friendship and trust developed between them and their co-workers, their colleagues did not provide them with information they needed to perform their jobs competently. It is essential for senior public servants to assist their junior public servants in acquiring interpersonal relations so that they are able to develop sound relations and trust with co-workers. Informing public servants about the public service goals and procedures contribute in developing a positive work ethic in them as they do not spend the official’s time in searching for the work information.

**Making junior public servants feel involved**

A sense of belonging can be enhanced by making junior public servants feel involved. According to Kinlaw (1993:14) junior public servants do not perform well when they are consistently denied any input in their jobs and are expected to follow unquestionably the decision of the senior public servants. Senior public servants who deny junior public servants any involvement get the results they deserve: boredom, passive resistance and even sabotage. Involvement reduces junior public servants resistance to change and contributes to higher job satisfaction and reduced turnover (Cherrington, 1980:170).

Kinlaw (1993:14) argues that most junior public servants end up doing what they are instructed to do, but they do it exactly and do not perform beyond that.
Involvement is essential as it breeds ownership of tasks, and ownership of tasks breeds loyalty. Cotton (1993:3) argues that junior public servant’s involvement has the potential to improve efficiency, quality of service and product as well. Three ways in which senior public servants can extend involvement to the junior public servants are innovation, planning and problem-solving. Innovation is defined as the process of developing and executing new ideas (Kinlaw, 1993:15). Fox and Meyer (1995:14) define innovation as the development and implementation of new processes or procedures that are subsequently different from existing ones; and that it implies change through activity. Senior public servants involve junior public servants and co-workers in the process of innovation by: encouraging them to present new ideas, allowing them to assist in deciding which ideas will be tested or developed and helping them to test and gain support for new ideas. It takes discipline to encourage new ideas.

Planning involves making decisions about the use of limited resources for the attainment of pre-determined objectives sometime in the future (Conyers & Hills 1984:5). Senior public servants can also extend the opportunities of junior public servants and co-workers to participate in the various planning processes of the public service, e.g. work planning, financial planning, planning public service transformation and developing work group goals. When junior public servants participate in setting their own financial plan and work standards, they accept them as their own plans for action. Kinlaw (1993: 16) argues that co-workers and junior public servants can be involved in three ways: having them provide information and suggestions for financial plans, team goals and planned changes; using decision-making in developing plans and having them select strategies for executing plans, evaluating plans and modifying them. Smit and Cronje (1992:145) define a problem as a barrier to the attainment of public service goals and is therefore an obstacle that needs to be overcome by decision-makers. Kinlaw (1993:16) argues that senior public servants can extend influence to junior public servants and co-workers by giving them the chance to work on the problem in three ways: identifying problems, researching data, providing technical information and expertise; participating in decisions about the definition of a problem and about which problems will be addressed, designing solutions and undertaking and evaluating strategies.

Martin and Nicholls (1987:17) argue that the traditional distinctions in treatment between senior public servants and junior public servants at the lower level of public service structure should be eroded. Senior public servants are expected to take pains to consult junior public servants at the lower level of the public service structures on political and work procedural changes. This should be done in advance, giving a real opportunity for their workers to press their points of view to influence results. Involving them early on could complicate decision-making, but the disadvantages are outweighed by increased commitment to the final decision.

From the foregoing it can be deduced that involving junior public servants in
developing and executing new job ideas, planning and problem-solving contributes in developing a committed workforce. The main reason for this is that involvement has the potential to improve efficiency and effectiveness as junior public servants will regard the tasks they perform as their own.

**Sense of Excitement in the Job**

Dell (1988:30) argues that public servants, who primarily perform only one task all day, every day, become bored quickly. To guard against boredom the following aspects should be considered: rewriting job descriptions, rearranging work flows, giving more responsibility for problem solving, providing recognition for a job well done and letting public servants rotate from one job to another to create more interesting work experiences (Dessler, 1993:63). However, there are some disadvantages to rotation, for example lack of commitment to the new job, lack of expertise and lack of pride. It is essential for rotated public servants to be offered skills training for them to be able to perform a new job efficiently.

Job enrichment, a major productivity improvement measure in the public service since the 1960’s, also contributes in making the work more interesting. This is due in part to growing worker discontent with overly simplified and monotonous work which resulted in high absenteeism and turnover, poor quality work and strikes. An enriched job is one in which the public servant has opportunities for achievement, advancement, responsibility, recognition and growth. An enriched job is one in which public servants can be involved in the production of goods from the beginning to the end. Enriched jobs are not a series of limited, specialised activities, repeated over and over again. Rather, they are those in which the public servants have an opportunity to undertaken processes or tasks through from the start to the end (Bruce & Blackburn, 1992:12).

Smit and Cronje (1992:326) argue that job enrichment refers to the vertical extension of a job. Vertical work loading occurs when the planning and control of work previously performed by persons in higher leadership positions are now performed by the public servant who is at the operational level. Job enrichment is an essential motivational technique because in job enrichment greater scope for personal achievement and recognition is built into the job, and this result in greater job satisfaction. According to Morley (1988:135-136) job enrichment refers to the redesigning of a job to increase the amount and/or degree of core dimensions it contains.

According to Bruce and Blackburn (1992:12) job enrichment contains five core dimensions. These dimensions are task identity, diversity, autonomy, wholeness and feedback. The public servant who can point at the product and brag: “I made that product,” is experiencing task identity. Diversity refers to the performing of a variety of different tasks that uses a number of skills or liabilities. Autonomy refers to the exercising of freedom and discretion in performing tasks and making decisions. Wholeness refers to the performance of an identifiable or complete piece of work.
rather than proportions of it. Feedback deals with the provision of information about job performance in a clear and direct manner (Morley, 1988:135-136).

An example of an enriched job is that of a municipal manager who has responsibility for the entire administration of a municipality. The municipal manager’s job requires the administrative duties of the senior public servant: policy-making, organizing, financing, personnel provision and utilization, determining of work procedures and control. Municipal managers serve as a link between the municipal council and the junior municipal officials. They are expected to serve the interests of all municipal councillors but at the same time are expected to be objective. The municipal manager has a variety of statutory functions. These include: having formal custody of the records of his/her council, representing the council in legal proceedings, and signing formal documents such as contracts and formal notices.

According to Bruce and Blackburn (1992:13) municipal managers have jobs with task identity, diversity, autonomy, wholeness and sometimes feedback. Municipal managers are excited about their jobs and they report a high level of job satisfaction. Over 81.4 per cent of the almost two thousand municipal managers surveyed by Bruce and Blackburn agreed with the statement: “considering everything, I am satisfied with my job at the present time”, as did 86 per cent of the professionals surveyed by them.

From the forgoing it can be deduced that job enrichment can contribute to the development of a commitment in that it makes the job more exciting to public servants. Public servants who are excited about the job will enjoy doing the job to achieve the goals of the service effectively and efficiently.

**Confidence in Leadership**

Anderson (1983:111-112) defines leadership as a relationship and a set of processes in which unequal authority operates to achieve common purposes. This definition can be divided into four components parts, each of which will lend itself to further analysis. These component parts are relationship, processes, authority and purposes. Leadership is a relationship between a leader or leadership group and those who are led. It is a two-way relationship. It enriches and benefits both parties. Leadership consists of; inter alia, leader-follower interactions. These interactions are processes in which both a leader or senior public servant and followers or junior public servants influence each other. The nature of the process depends on the situation, the behaviour and attributes of a leader and group members, and the qualities of the public service and the environment.

The attributes of a leader include morality. Junior public servants look towards leaders for moral guidance. This tendency reflects the importance of leadership ethics for those in leadership positions. Junior public servants will forgive the leader who fails to manage by objectives, or is inefficient in the use of time, but will not forgive the leader who is immoral and no-principled. Such a person lacks
moral authority and is not trusted or respected. What a leader says and does in the sphere of morality has enormous influence on his/her junior public servants. The behaviour of a leader communicates more than any memorandum, directive or letter. The leader’s actions toward junior public servants set the tone for their behaviour toward one another and for their performance on the job. An effective leader accomplishes, through personal behaviour, the building of a workforce oriented toward co-operative accomplishment of the task (Manning & Curtis, 1988:85-86).

Beach (1980:477) defines authority as the legitimate right to direct or influence the behaviour of others. Authority acquires legitimacy in part from its legal underpinnings – a senior public servant is appointed and assigned authority by legally constituted governing bodies. In addition authority comes from recognition, acceptance, and willing participation by junior public servants in a relationship of unequal influence and power by a leader. Legitimacy derives largely from the primary moral quality of the public service professionalism. In the public service, professionalism and its underlying values tend to lend legitimacy to leaders (Anderson, 1983:112).

Professionalism promotes the development of a positive work ethic as it ensures that people who meet the relevant educational and training requirements and who share similar work values are appointed and promoted to specific positions. The fact that senior public servants are accountable for the arrangement and systematizing of the activities being executed in the public service and for directing and leading (i.e. the management of the public service activities) (Thornhill & Hanekom, 1995:22) promotes the development of a positive work ethic as they ensure professionalism and excellence. These activities, which are to be mastered by senior public servants, are administrative, functional, auxiliary and managerial.

Senior public servants have come to realize that their style of leadership shapes the climate of the public service. Public service climate has an impact on the behaviour of the public servant. Public service climate refers to the overall conditions of the public service, both physical and psychological. It includes the expectations and feelings public servants have about the purposes of public service and the perceptions of what occurs within the public service. It can contribute either negatively or positively to the development of work attitudes and values. As such, the proper climate should be created to elicit the kinds of attitudes and values the leadership desires. Senior public servants strive to foster a supportive environment of friendly interdependence. They are aware that a climate of commitment and efficiency to productive service contributes to the development of a positive work ethic (Cherrington, 1980:150).

The extent to which an individual junior public servant has settled into the world of work may be related partially to his/her perceived relationship with his/her senior public servant. This is supported by West and Newton (1983:134) who found
that junior public servants who saw their senior public servants as understanding of their work and personal difficulties, concerned about their problems and needs, and interested in them as individuals, were more highly efficient in the achievement of the purpose of the public service.

From the forgoing it can be argued that senior public servants, as leaders, need to show interest in what junior public servants are doing and in what they are. They must also indicate by actions that they are willing to assist junior public servants to overcome their work and personal problems to ensure efficiency. Before realising it, this will make junior public servants to have confidence in them and in the work they perform.

**Public Servant Competencies that Allow Success**

According to Lincoln and Kalleberg (1992:125-126) competence is defined partly as the capacity for hard work (diligence) and perseverance but partly as talent, skill or capacity. The concept *skill* can be defined as the ability and capacity acquired through deliberate, systematic and sustained effort to smoothly carry out complex activities or functions involving ideas (cognitive skills), things (technical skills) and/or people (interpersonal skills). United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (2007) defines capacity as “the ability of individuals, institutions and societies to perform functions, solve problems, and set and achieve objectives in a sustainable manner.”

Diligence and perseverance are general value orientations which structure behaviour in a variety of social roles and environments. Strong feelings of identification with the public service (for example) and a commitment to perform diligently on the public service’s behalf constitute an orientation towards a particular public service which may well be more prevalent among public servants socialized in the abstract values of diligence and perseverance.

Kinlaw (1993:12-13) argues that public servants develop commitment toward what they believe they can perform well. People dislike being failures. They will try to avoid the tasks that they cannot perform. If senior public servants want commitment, they need to ensure that junior public servants have the abilities and willingness to be successful in their jobs. There are three elements that senior public servants need to address in building competence. These elements are: (i) they need to ensure that their juniors have the skills, knowledge and experience to perform assigned tasks; (ii) they need to ensure that the juniors have the confidence to perform assigned tasks (Kinlaw, 1993:12-13) and (iii) they need to ensure that their juniors have the willingness to do the job. Junior public servants may have the skills, experience and confidence to do the job, but the question which the senior public servants should ask themselves is: “Are they willing to do the job?” This indicates that an attitude plays a major role in building commitment in junior public servants.

Kinlaw (1993:13) argues that the point is not simply that developing junior
public servants will assume human competence for doing today and tomorrow’s work. Developing competence is also fundamental to building commitment. Senior public servants who assist junior public servants to increase their knowledge, skills and experience are building junior public servant commitment, which is the key to sustained performance. They are also contributing to the promotion of efficiency which is dependent upon the knowledge, skills and attitudes which junior public servants possess (Thornhill & Hanekom, 1995:204).

The ways to build competence include training and tuition reimbursement programmes (Bruce & Blackburn, 1992:164). Some departments in the public service have computer and learning centres. The most personal strategy for building competence, and therefore, one of the most powerful, is coaching. It is the one sure way in which senior public servants can establish what the junior public servants do not know and how they have to perform their jobs. Coaching is also a way to provide support and reassurance to junior public servants who are taking new responsibilities. Coaching facilitates learning because it is timely and focuses on exactly what the individual public servant needs to know concerning the job (Kinlaw, 1993:13-14).

Cherrington (1980:16) argues that the development of a positive work ethic depends significantly on the quality of coaching. A work ethic, negative or positive, is a learned value. Junior public servants will learn the value they are taught in their environment. It is the immediate senior public servant who assigns duties, gives instructions and evaluates performance of his/her juniors. It is the duty of the senior public servant to create a healthy climate wherein the juniors can improve their performance and eliminate waste.

Thornhill and Hanekom (1995:205) argue that public servants will be better suited to perform their functions successfully if they are in possession of suitable abilities. Suitable training can contribute towards public servants acquiring knowledge and skills which will enable them to perform their functions with a greater measure of competence. Public servant competence contributes to the development of a positive work ethic in that public servants who are diligent in work, trained and skilled, perform their jobs effectively and efficiently. It can therefore be argued that public servants should be provided with the necessary training to enable them to perform their duties effectively and efficiently.

**EXEMPLIFYING ETHICAL LEADERSHIP BY POLITICAL AND SENIOR ADMINISTRATIVE LEADERSHIP**

It is essential for political office bearers and senior public officials to personify the public service values and as such provide tangible role models for subordinate public servants to follow. Senior public servants show their subordinates the right (model) way of behaving at work (Deal & Kennedy, 1988:14-15). If unethical behaviour exists at the top of the hierarchy, it is likely to permeate the entire public
service. Rasheed and Olowu (1993:44) argue that the unethical conduct known to exist in Africa starts at the top of the political and public service leadership and flow down the ranks by example. Once the head gets rotten the body has no chance of escaping the cancer. For example, if political office-bearers and senior public servants at the top who are well paid are engaged in unacceptable ethics, the attitude of the traffic officer to his/her job is likely to change drastically and he/she will see nothing wrong taking a bribe for example to release a driver who violates a traffic sign. In this atmosphere all junior public servants discover illicit ways of obtaining money from their jobs.

The manifestations of unethical and irresponsible behaviour by senior public functionaries not only reduce the morale of many committed junior public servants but also negatively influence others in engaging themselves in similar practices. Ethical values and norms of the society, which had been widely respected, disintegrate immediately particularly in a society, which respect political office-bearers and officials. To break this culture of unethical behaviour, experience indicates that frying a big fish is essential. Big, corrupt actors must be named and punished so that a cynical citizenry believes that an anti-corruption drive is more than words. Importantly, therefore, one of the first big fish must come from the ruling political party (Klitgaard, MacLean-Abaroa & Parris, 2000:79).

CONCLUDING REMARKS

The need for creating commitment in the public service derives from the nature of goods and services. Most goods and services provided to the community by the departments in the public service are basic in nature, such as the provision of potable water and electricity. The imperative of service and product quality requires dramatic changes in the way public servants view their jobs. Public servants need to be committed to the main reason for the existence of the public service, viz the promotion of public welfare. Committed public servants will help the public service to be effective and efficient. In addition, committed junior public servants will perform the effectively at work even in the absence of the watchful eyes of their senior public servants.

The description of the term commitment was made. Four major pillars of creating commitment were identified and discussed. These pillars are a sense of belonging to the public service, sense of excitement in the job, confidence in leadership and public servant competencies that allow success. Informing junior public servants about goals and values and involving them in making decisions that affect their work were used to indicate how junior public servants provide a sense of belonging to the public service. The role of senior public servants in involving juniors was identified and discussed. The role of political and administrative leadership in exemplifying ethical leadership was discussed. It was argued that the manifestations of unethical leadership by senior public functionaries not only reduce the morale of many committed junior public servants but also negatively
influence others in engaging themselves in similar practices. It is concluded that to break this culture of unethical behaviour, experience indicates that frying a big fish is essential. Big, uncommitted actors must be named and punished so that a cynical citizenry believes that an anti-corruption drive is more than words.

REFERENCES


EMPOWERING WOMEN COUNCILLORS THROUGH A LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

Z. Mpehle  
M. Kanjere  
Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership  
University of Limpopo

ABSTRACT

The provision of better services to the people is a constitutional obligation of the South African government, and for that to happen local municipalities need to have leaders with the right sets of skills. For that reason, local municipalities saw it fit to introduce programmes that would empower their councillors with necessary and appropriate leadership skills that would enhance their performance for the betterment of service delivery. The Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality in the Limpopo Province is one of the municipalities that initiated leadership development programmes with the aim to empower women councillors with the skills that would see them improve their leadership skills for better municipal performance. The purpose of this article is to ascertain how effective the leadership programme introduced by the Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality has been empowering women councillors with much needed skills. The article argues that although there have been successes in the implementation of the programme, challenges such as, lack of funding for the sustainability of the programme, the duration of the programme and the use of facilitators need to be addressed.

INTRODUCTION

The development of leadership competence in municipalities is essential as it is an attempt to respond to the dynamic nature of modern public sector institutions. As public institutions change quite often because of external and internal pressures, so do the roles of councillors within the Local Government Sphere. It therefore becomes imperative that councillors who have an important role in community leadership are exposed to various leadership training programmes that equip them with relevant skills that will make them cope with impending changes in the complex environment. The changes in modern government institutions such as municipalities warrant specialised skills that councillors need to possess and respond to service delivery needs accordingly. Their response to changes in the environment will only become useful if they have been trained in relevant skills. Nel, Werner, Sono, Duplessis, Ngalo, Poisat, Van Hoek and Botha (2011:357)
maintain that training has always been a powerful lever for improving both the individual opportunities and institutional competitiveness in countries and organisations worldwide.

South Africa as a relatively new democracy requires vigorous leadership programmes in municipalities that will equip councillors with necessary skills to take the country forward. According to the White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service that was introduced in 1995, the government’s strategy is to improve and transform public service delivery. It is imperative for government to be committed in the training and development of public leaders in order to equip them to deal with leadership challenges the country is facing since the advent of democracy in 1994. It is important that the country has leadership that will ensure that the government becomes a performance-oriented one. For that to happen, the government needs to be committed to effectively train and develop community leaders who will play a pivotal role in changing their communities for the better. Chapter five of the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act (Act No. 32 of 2000) also emphasises that the local government has the moral and legal responsibility to develop an integrated development plan that, among other things, addresses the critical transformation and development needs. It is therefore imperative that the integrated development plan should focus on leadership development, as leadership is one of the pillars of transforming local government councillors into relevant, dynamic and vibrant leaders that will respond to the local needs in an efficient and effective manner.

For that reason, the Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality embarked on an extensive programme to train women councillors in ethical community leadership, as the ability of women to lead is questioned in most public and private domain; women are still faced with a number of challenges that deter their development as leaders. The programme is aimed at equipping them with skills in various fields such as project management, strategic management, financial management, and human resource management. All the trainees are black females since Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality is on the drive to empower black females for equity reasons. This is in accordance with the South African government’s approach in addressing the gender imbalances created by the past apartheid regime with the legacy still persistent currently. As captured in the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (Act No. 55 of 1998), black women are also classified as a designated group and a previously disadvantaged part of the South African community that still lags behind on empowerment.

The article provides the introduction in which the role of government in as far as the transformation of government institutions for effective and efficient service delivery is highlighted. This is followed by the brief history of Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality and its role in empowering women councillors for better leadership. Furthermore, the concept of empowerment and the Empowerment Theory are explored. Furthermore, the article gives an exposition of literature on
women empowerment and provides the legislative framework on gender equality. The aim and objectives that highlight the possible problem of the research are mentioned, followed by the research methodology. As this study is empirical in its nature, it is imperative to present data and its analysis. Finally a conclusion is drawn and recommendations tabled.

**BRIEF HISTORY OF LEPELLE-NKUMPI LOCAL MUNICIPALITY**

Lepelle- Nkumpi Local Municipality is situated within the Capricorn District Municipality in the Limpopo Province. The municipality is located 55km south of the district municipality’s headquarters which is in the city of Polokwane. It is predominantly rural and is divided into 29 wards where only four of these wards are located in a township called Lebowakgomo, one of Capricorn District’s growth points where all the Provincial Legislature sittings take place. Lebowakgomo was once the Parliament of the former homeland headed by the late Dr. C. L. Phathudi who was imposed on people by the Apartheid government. The municipality has a population of 230 350 people, 59 682 households and the unemployment rate of 48, 10% (http://www.localgovernment.co.za/locals/view/119/lepelle-nkump-local-municipality).

The Local Government Handbook (2014:1) states that Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality has various political parties that have been allocated seats according to the votes that each party received, and the majority comes from the ruling African National Congress (ANC). Given the South African Apartheid history, most of these councillors (as political leaders within the domain of local government) were educationally disadvantaged; therefore they lack good leadership skills. It became vital for the Lepelle- Nkumpi Local Municipality to organise an on-going training for the ward councillors who mostly were females with different educational backgrounds, ranging from matriculation to postgraduate qualifications. Women Councillors were trained on the following modules for three days, that is from the 10-12 December 2013 that were undertaken by different facilitators: Leadership, Ethics and Team Building; Strategic Management; Project Management; Financial Management; and Human Resources Management. Councillors were subjected to summative assessment at the end of the training intervention as a means to apply the principles of teaching and learning so that they could obtain credits bearing certificates.

**EMPOWERMENT DEFINED**

Empowerment is the process of assisting an individual or a group of individuals to become aware of their full potential through formal and informal sharing of knowledge. Empowerment is the acquiring of knowledge with the purpose of changing the *status quo*, moving from a limited state of control or no control at all to a state of full control, from a state of dependence to an independent one. By implication, as Mosedale (2005:244) puts it, people who are empowered are usually
at a disadvantaged position in a society but determined to acquire knowledge that will enable them to make important and crucial decisions pertaining to their lives, and having the ability to put those decisions into practice.

According to Maton (2008) and Rappaport (1981) in Petersen (2014:1) empowerment can be defined as “an active, participatory process through which individuals and groups gain greater control over their lives, acquire rights, and reduce marginalisation.” Scanlan and Hernández (2014:2) state that empowerment as the process that opens up “…an opportunity to learn and grow”, equipping an individual to have the capacity to effectively utilise resources in the completing of the task at hand.

In the context of this study empowerment is an act of abetting with an intention to contribute to the betterment of knowledge to a society through formal learning that facilitates self-actualisation on the part of a participant who is not seen as a passive individual but rather as playing an active role in the whole process. The concept of empowerment is largely by scholars

**EMPOWERMENT THEORY**

This study is based on empowerment theory which, in the purpose of this article emphasises the necessity of women to increase their socio-economic, political and cultural statues in society. Empowerment enables women to challenge the existing barriers and structures that prevent their social mobility. Christens and Lin (2014:212) contend that empowerment theory lends explanatory power to the transactional perspective of the relationships between individual and community well-being.

Empowerment theory emphasises the necessity of women to increase their socio-economic, political and cultural power. Tasli (2007:7) asserts that the main instruments of empowerment approach are awareness raising and political mobilisation. Politicians and government has a role to play in raising awareness amongst the communities to support women empowerment initiatives. The approach to women empowerment should emanate from the fact that women have multiple roles that they play in society. Tasli (2007:7) identified the following roles played by women:

Reproductive role - The reproductive role in women goes beyond biological reproduction, it includes care and maintenance of the current workforce, that is, the husband and working children. The role also includes the future workforce that includes the infants and school-going children.

Productive role - Women have a role to play in the society in addition to their traditional responsibilities of rearing children. They form part of the productive workforce that contributes to the growth of economy.

Community managing role - More often than not, women have the tendency of taking care of the community’s needs. They engage in activities which ensure that
the provision and maintenance of scarce resources of collective consumption such as water, health care and education are taken care of. In most cases, the work that the women do in their communities is voluntary and thus unpaid.

**IMPORTANCE OF WOMEN EMPOWERMENT**

Carmichael, Collins, Emsell and Haydon (2011:4) argue that leaders have to learn to work in institutions which have increasing diversity, changing opportunities, increased political, economic and social influences. Municipalities are therefore the embodiment of such institutions. Hence, women councillors more often find themselves isolated with minimal support and institutional support is limited as there are often no mentoring programmes in place. Most women emerge “from extremely poor environments where they have never been exposed to electricity, health care, education and technology” (Ijeoma and Chiloane-Tsoka 2011:741). Matsiliza (2012:450) also concurs that South Africa has not reached a level where most of the ward councillors are educated enough to be able to articulate public financial management principles, among many other responsibilities that they are expected to be familiarised.

Women councillors who are elected in rural areas they have limited resources which often makes them to fail in the performance of their duties. Matsiliza (2012:449) reminds us that municipalities in the rural areas do not have the sufficient financial base as there is limited revenue collected to administer municipal affairs. Furthermore, donors and investors are usually not interested in the developing towns and villages since infrastructure is not at the required state or non-existent in many cases. Political parties generally accept women in certain areas as ward councillors so as to garner more votes during the local elections. The challenge in this case is that empowerment programmes are not usually provided for to ensure that such women have the requisite skills to undertake their councillor responsibilities with some level of readiness.

This depicts the fact that women councillors are not immune to problems that generally affect women; challenges that emanate from gender-based discrimination and harassments tend to follow them. They are also susceptible to entrenched socio-cultural stereotypes that tend to undermine women’s ability to lead. Kanjere (2014:1) states that entrenched socio-cultural stereotypes against women cut across all the sectors of the society including issues of pigmentation. Ijeoma and Chiloane-Tsoka (2011:738) confirm that women were the victims of the past patriarchal minority rule and customary laws that rendered them powerless and treated them as minors were endorsed by the pre-colonial society. Thus, one of the challenges of women ward councillors is that their viewpoints are overlooked and not considered.

Ijeoma and Chiloane-Tsoka (2011:741) maintain that the on-going frustrations and problems faced by women negate the concerns of many women who
attempt to coerce and network in one voice. Leadership training is essential as a continuous intervention because it would enable women to develop skills that could help them their course in this regard. This kind of interventions would also help the women councillors to develop confidence in undertaking their leadership responsibilities. This is because women are often more marginalised in the society and are often required to prove themselves against their male counterparts where their social conditions is characterised by patriarchy and unfair treatment in their public responsibilities.

Empowerment of women councillors could help eradicate some of the prejudices against women leaders and make most municipalities functional and effective. Disoloane and Lekonyane (2011:1076) agree that most municipalities are prone to failure as they do not have capacity, skills or leadership to implement developmental policies. Rankhumise and Mello (2011:788) believe that training interventions are necessary to ensure that councillors are made aware of the implementation of certain policies relevant to their work.

THE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

The South African government in its bid to address gender inequality had to introduce policies that will assist in the realising of its goal of seeing the disadvantaged section of the citizenry, particularly women, develop in leadership qualities. Nkwana (2012:160) highlights the need to consider pieces of legislation that play a role in the development of human resources in the South African public sector environment. For the purpose of this article this section discusses four policies namely the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; the South Africa’s National Policy Framework for Women’s Empowerment and Gender Equality; The Skills Development Act 97 of 1998; and the White Paper on Human Resource Management in the Public Service.


Chapter Two of the supreme legislation of the country, The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, herein referred to as the Constitution, promotes equal rights in the advancement of all citizens in education opportunities and exposure to information that will enhance their knowledge regardless of, inter alia, race, sex, colour, gender, culture and religion. By implication the Constitution advocates non-discriminatory practices in a work environment in the advancement of citizens' education, and that includes capacity building programmes. Sections 152 (c) and 153 (b) state that the local government’s object is to “promote social and economic development” and has the responsibility of formulating and implementing developmental policies and relevant programmes that are in line with the provincial and national goals respectively. Social and economic development involves capacity building that encompasses all functional levels and different roleplayers in an institution, including leadership development, which is
a crucial investment in the future sustainability of an institution. Capacity building in leadership plays an important role in the strengthening of existing institutional managerial systems. Section 154 (1) further mentions that municipalities “must support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities to manage their own affairs.”

**The South Africa’s National Policy Framework for Women’s Empowerment and Gender Equality, 2003**

The South Africa’s National Policy Framework for Women’s Empowerment and Gender Equality, hereafter referred to as the Gender Policy Framework, that was approved by Parliament in 2000 and published in 2003 has its emphasis on the transformation that needs to be put in place by institutions to ensure that gender equality is achieved in the country. Chapter One of the Gender Policy Framework states that public and private institutions have a pivotal role to play in this regard by ensuring that policies, practices, programmes and procedures are put in place to facilitate the process, and that all sectors promote a cooperative approach to make gender equality a realisable goal. Furthermore, the gender policy framework serves as a guide to institutions in exposing women to capacity building opportunities and programmes. In the context of this article, the Gender Policy Framework has the following three primary indicators, *inter alia*, in the movement towards gender equality: a significant change in the involvement of women in the political decision-making process since the culture in political institutions was not responsive to female civil servants’ and politicians’ needs; an attitudinal change towards women, particularly in the recognition of the value they add to institutions and society; and professional opportunities being accessed by women in enhancing their knowledge, skills and expertise.

**The Skills Development Act 97 of 1998**

The purpose of enactment of the Skills Development Act (SDA), as indicated on its Section 2, is to facilitate the development of skills of citizens in order to improve performance, productivity and competitiveness at a workplace for better service delivery. The SDA further states that this Act consider encouraging employers to introduce developmental programmes that will enhance leadership skills of employees, and encourage employees to participate in these programmes. The SDA also emphasises that the workplace should serve as “an active learning environment” that will “provide employees with the opportunities to acquire new skills”. According to Schedule 2, Section 14 (6) of SDA the municipality has the responsibility to identify the developmental needs of employees as far as their job performance is concerned, elect those identified to participate in training and development programmes that will enhance their skills, knowledge and expertise.


According to this White Paper, the proper management of human resources is one of the strategies to produce employees that are diverse in their skills and
competent in the delivery of services. One of the fundamental principles to be actualised in the South African public service, as stipulated in parts 8 and 15 of the White Paper is to develop a workforce that is multi-skilled, multi-cultural and service delivery oriented. Moreover, the public service needs to be a career service that will offer employees opportunities to advance so as to improve the overall institutional performance. A public institution must have mechanisms not only to identify its operational needs but also the needs of employees and to respond those needs accordingly.

**PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

The purpose of the article is to analyse the perceptions of councillors that participated in the Women in Leadership Training Programme. This is intended to determine if this programme is viewed as successfully equipped participants with the necessary leadership skills that will assist in enhancing their performance in their positions as ward councillors.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

The study utilised both the qualitative and quantitative methods to acquire data from both the participants of the Women in Leadership Training Programme conducted in Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality and the municipal official responsible in running the programme. The two methods were primarily used to gather primary data through questionnaires and an interview. The survey questionnaires were designed and utilised to obtain information from all the nine trained women councillors. The first part of the survey questionnaire was designed to gather biographical data of respondents to determine their educational level, race, their full-time occupation and monthly income. The second part was designed to ascertain the level of knowledge of leadership by trainees prior and after the training; determine the skills benefited by trainees after undergoing such training; assess whether the perception of leadership by trainees changed after the training; identify challenges in the programme as a whole; and obtain suggestions on how the programme could be improved. Eight out of nine questionnaires were completed, resulting to 89% response rate which is sufficient to provide researchers with the required data for processing and analysis. An interview was held with one municipal official responsible for the coordinating of the training programme. A semi-structured interview schedule was designed to gather information from this municipal official. The advantage of using such a schedule was to allow the researchers to have follow-up on open-ended questions directed to the interviewee to clarify issues raised during the interview. It was important to get views from both the organisers and participants of the programme to make certain that both views are accommodated to prevent biasness and to maintain reliability. Secondary data was obtained by making use of relevant literature from different sources which considered discussions on issues of women empowerment. The literature review
has formed the basis for this article and has assisted in the formulation of questions for data collection instruments used.

**ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS**

The following specific questions relevant to the topic were analysed and interpreted:

**Respondents by Employment**

Respondents were asked if they have a full time job elsewhere in addition to the job of being a councillor, as councillors are not full-time employees of the municipality and only get a monthly stipend as their income. About 87.5% indicated that they only depend on the stipend given them by the Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality that amount to an average of R132 000 per annum. These councillors voiced that they find the stipend not matching the precarious job they are doing for the community, especially when service delivery has become a volatile issue and the possibility of their houses torched because of the high resistance from communities that regard them as failures. Again, the stipend is regarded as inadequate to take care of their personal and family needs as the pension fund; medical aid contributions and other allowances are not taken care of, and therefore require them to do other part time jobs to augment their income. This in the long run, may have a negative effect on their time dedicated to leadership roles (as ward councillors) they have to play in the municipality as they have to juggle their time between their part time jobs. The meagre stipend makes them feel that their leadership role is not appreciated, which they consider as a demotivating factor that makes them not to put much energy in what they are doing as councillors.

**Respondents by Age**

The age of respondents ranged from 36 to 61, with an average of 42. This implies that the majority of councillors (84%) are at an age of development opportunities, to learn more on leadership issues that can enable them to contribute positively in the communities they serve.

**Respondents by Education Level**

The majority (75%) of respondents do not have a post high school qualification, with only 25% having obtained tertiary qualifications. Respondents expressed that their exposure to leadership matters was limited and the use of English as the medium of teaching and learning made it somehow difficult for them to grasp the subject matter. The latter had a negative effect on their understanding of certain concepts presented during their training and development. They expressed that they were unable to ask some questions they would have loved to ask because of the language barrier and inability to express themselves in English. This limitation is necessary as their daily responsibilities of passing by-laws and other municipal policies require their English language competence to be able to execute their duties properly.
Respondents’ Knowledge and Perception on Leadership Prior and Post the Training Programme

The respondents who do not have post-matric qualifications (75%) expressed that their knowledge of what leadership entails was very limited prior to the training programme, but somehow improved after receiving the training. They felt empowered to tackle leadership challenges in the municipality and the communities they serve. The training exposed them to leadership skills needed, that will assist them in ensuring that service delivery is provided in a sustainable manner, and sharpened their understanding on the importance of teamwork and influence, as they have to work together with all the stakeholders to foster participatory culture in the delivery of services. The respondents also expressed that their self-awareness, that is, knowing what they are capable of doing and how they perceived themselves in general changed for the better.

Duration of Training

All respondents expressed the concern that the duration of the training which was three days was too short a time whereas the content was too much, especially when, as mentioned above, most of them do not have post-matric qualifications. Again, facilitators are forced to focus only on the essentials even in some instances whereby candidates do not have enough background to the modules offered. Modules are offered as developmental programmes (short learning course), which does not guarantee that councillors will be able to implement what they have learnt during training at such a short period of time. The indication from these participants was that the training should have been done for a period of at least two weeks. As argued by Van Rooyen and Whittle (2011:1051), training or developmental experience of a few days is unlikely to change behaviour. To really have an impact on behaviour, the programme should address the different learning domains; provide opportunities to apply what have been learned; and provide follow-up sessions where what has been learned can be reinforced. As highlighted above, therefore the training interventions that were conducted in Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality did not satisfy the above mentioned principles.

The respondents also voiced a concern of the programme being offered once with no follow-up programmes. As far as they are concerned, follow-up programmes could be useful as they refine the skills they acquired in the previous programme and ensure a municipality maintain itself as a learning environment.

Continuations to a Higher Qualification

The training provided in at NQF Level 5 which could not be articulated to a higher qualification in a form of a recognised diploma or degree. This means that there is no synergy in the programme that can enable councillors to progress to advanced qualifications or degrees offered at the University of Limpopo. For them proceeding to a higher recognised qualification will have a higher return such as having more skills, expertise and knowledge that will make their chances of being

Z. Mpehle & M. Kanjere

773
employed improved. The advantage of having a better job is the improved income associated with it, which in turn may lead to a better style of life and social status. The other problem relate to the fact that councillors are appointed on a five-year term in office which often makes it difficult for some to vacate without having made any meaningful impact on service delivery agenda of the municipality.

**Sustainability of the training programme**

The challenge of funding poses a threat to the programme. Without finance, the machine to drive programmes makes it difficult for the municipality to sustain its training programmes for the capacity building of its ward councillors. The programme was an initiative of the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) with the view of empowering councillors. However, as expressed by an official, SALGA struggles to raise funds for the programme in order for it to consistently continue. Secondly, the term of office of councillors is five years unless re-elected, which has undesirable high turnover of councillors. This means that every in-coming councillor should also be trained when the municipality is already stretched as far as budget is concerned. Finally, the private sector in most cases is not readily willing to support the initiative, especially when businesses have no direct benefit from the programme.

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

There is a need therefore for municipalities as part of government that is nearest to the people to equip officials and stakeholders such as councillors with the necessary leadership skills. Efficient and effective service delivery will never be realised as long as capacity building in public institution, particularly at the local level of government still remains an unresolved issue. Although the Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality has initiated a capacity building programme to equip women councillors with leadership skills that will enable them to deliver services effectively and efficiently, there are still challenges that need to be addressed to make the programme successful. The following recommendations may assist in this respect:

The condition of employment for part-time councillors needs to be revisited; they need to have benefits enjoyed by full-time councillors like medical aid and pension fund. The stipend presently offered them is not sufficient to take care of all their needs, and therefore causes them not to dedicate their time in serving their communities because of their pursuance of other ways of raising money to support themselves and to take care of most of their needs.

Considering the level of education the majority of councillors possess, it is advisable to offer the programme for a longer period than the time allocated presently in order for them to grasp leadership concepts within their context and the new content they were not exposed to before.

There should be a provision made for the programme to be offered in other
indigenous/official languages to take care of those who are less privileged in the use of English. For effective learning to take place, whether in a formal or informal contexts, communication and understanding of what is communicated is basic and essential.

Raising of funds is very important for any programme to be sustainable. Therefore, ways of negotiating with the business community on how best they can support their capacity development activities should be mutually sought. Furthermore, there should be commitment by the municipality and other government departments in supporting the programme in all aspects. Finally there should be mechanisms put in place to monitor if skills that have been gained from the programme are applied.

**LIST OF REFERENCES**


NETWORK GOVERNANCE FOR SERVICE DELIVERY: LESSONS FROM SOUTH AFRICA AND UGANDA

B.C. Mubangizi
Z.F. Nhlabathi
University of KwaZulu-Natal
R. Namara
Uganda Management Institute

ABSTRACT

All government spheres in multi-level governance systems face challenges of co-ordination and alignment of scarce resources for the common good – while retaining their distinctiveness and independence. Within a decentralised system, the challenges of poverty and inequality require a co-ordinated response by all spheres of government, and it is considered that network governance may provide a useful model for co-ordinating a joint response to such complexity. This article examines network governance using two case studies. The first is South Africa’s KwaNaloga Games, an annual sporting event run under the aegis of KwaNaloga (the KwaZulu-Natal Local Government Association) and the second is Uganda’s Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project (NECDP), which aims to improve the quality of life of children below the age of six years. The programmes are a microcosm of active network governance and their success is attributed to the role played by network governance in co-ordinating the interaction of divergent governmental and non-governmental entities. We draw from previous research on these case studies and use document analysis to show how the various systems deal with challenges of decentralisation by drawing on bureaucratic and non-bureaucratic; formal and informal structures. We conclude that in a decentralised system, network governance can indeed contribute to service delivery amidst resource-poor units of local government – especially if there is strong and effective collaboration across the different spheres of government, the private sector, and civil society.

INTRODUCTION

Written against a backdrop of service-delivery protests in South Africa and Uganda, and the attendant debate around policy versus implementation, this paper considers what insights the concept of network governance offer for sound intergovernmental relations (IGR). In a decentralised system like South Africa and Uganda – where each sphere in the country’s multi-level governance system is structurally distinct, but yet functionally interdependent – the network-governance model may be useful for co-ordinating responses to complex social problems. This
article considers the concepts of IGR and network governance in South Africa and Uganda, in order to compare and contrast efforts of the two countries in promoting service delivery within a decentralised system of governance. The comparison is done through the lens of similarly-organised programmes in both countries, the KwaNaloga Games in the province of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa and the Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project (NECDP) of Uganda.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 provides for decentralisation and three spheres of government – national, provincial and local – and Section 40(1) describes them as ‘distinctive, interdependent and interrelated’. Uganda’s decentralisation is enshrined in its constitution and is legalised by the Local Government Act, 1997. The Act established district, municipality and sub-county. These are corporate bodies of local government to which far-reaching powers and responsibilities are devolved (Asiimwe & Musisi, 2007: xiv). An arrangement of this nature requires each sphere to work together (co-operate) to provide citizens with a comprehensive package of services.

**INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS AND NETWORK GOVERNANCE**

In a decentralised system functioning under the New Public Management model of efficiency and effectiveness, various roleplayers must, by necessity, find ways to traverse multifarious relationships so as to render effective services. When different role players align to accomplish some kind of policy function – two particular concepts come to mind, namely, intergovernmental relations and network governance – a discussion of which follows.

**Intergovernmental relations (IGR)**

Mentzel (2000:3) describes IGR as interactions and mechanisms for multi- and bi-lateral, formal and informal, multi-sectoral and sectoral, legislative, executive and administrative interactions, entailing joint decision-making, consultation, co-ordination, implementation and advice between spheres of government at both vertical and horizontal levels, and touching on every sphere of governmental activity. In line with this definition, the (South African) Department of Provincial and Local Government’s Inaugural Report of 2005/06-2006/07 views IGR as a system of the various components of the governance, administrative and fiscal arrangements operating at the interface between national, provincial and local governments. Ile (2007: 18) calls IGR the ‘glue’ between governmental activities – that ensure the achievement of common goals. The aim of IGR is to seek synergies between various government entities to enable the efficient and effective delivery of services, and to sustain democracy in a number of ways – including the strengthening of capacity across all government spheres. In broad terms, IGR constitute a negotiation and consultation process between the spheres of government, aimed at harmonising government’s actions and decision-making. An IGR system therefore requires
facilitative systems to enable the units of government to participate effectively, and to carry out their mandates so that governmental goals are achieved. These include executive mechanisms, co-ordinating mechanisms, co-operative agreements, and judicial and legislative mechanisms.

The IGR system in South Africa has evolved since decentralisation became government policy, and various commissions and reports have highlighted a shift in the way IGR is perceived. Nhlabathi and Mubangizi (2012:56) have observed that the initial focus on IGR was at the legislative, conceptual and policy level, and led to the creation of IGR structures, procedures and processes, and a primarily ‘silo’-based sectoral focus. Currently, the focus is more on the implementation of IGR, through the development of actual processes to support co-ordinated service-delivery priorities, and intergovernmental dialogue and collaboration. While IGR are embedded in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996), it was not until the promulgation of the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act (No. 13 of 2005) that IGR were given real legal and practical substance. This took place after the 1998 Presidential Review Commission and the 2003 IGR Audit Report highlighted critical practical challenges in implementing IGR.

In Uganda, no specific legislation on intergovernmental relations is in place. However, the Local Government Act of 1997 assigns specific responsibilities to local Government. Olowu (2003:45) notes that these responsibilities include provision of public services in health, water, feeder roads, human resources, district planning, probation and welfare – to mention a few. Uganda’s decentralisation system thus entails centre-local relations which, as Makara (2009:61) observes, attempt to transfer powers to local governments with some legal mandates. In the main, the mandates require local governments to collect some revenues and to spend it on local priorities, to have discretionary powers over locally-employed staff, and to plan for the development of their areas. In return, Makara (2009:61) points out that the central government offers a range of grants to local governments – to maintain security, engage in macro-economic planning, and to monitor and tender advice to local governments. Intergovernmental relations in Uganda therefore prescribe organised dispersal of power in society – both in a political and an economic sense. Intergovernmental relations further prescribe for the sharing of power and responsibility between several sub-national authority units, which have jurisdiction over their areas in terms of providing services to their constituents. But while the differentiation of responsibility is clearly stipulated within the government system, significant overlap still persists and creates a grey area of responsibilities between the various stakeholders and levels of government suggesting weak intergovernmental relations.

A research on Fiscal Decentralisation and Sub-National Government Finance in Relation to Infrastructure and Service Provision (NALAD and EPLAC, 2000: 188) laments the little integration of functions between the various levels of government which often leads to duplication and fragmentation of efforts, including those of
Donors and other NGOs in the provision of public services. According to the same research, the lack of intergovernmental integration significantly compromises efficient delivery of services to consumers. The research highlighted the need to harmonise and co-ordinate the activities of various stakeholders in the provision of public services.

From the foregoing discussion, it is clear that a common conceptual understanding of IGR exists in the two countries and that the responsibilities of each level of government are clearly stipulated. What remains unclear, however, is how to operationalise these relationships for the attainment of common objectives. Indeed, IGR in systems that have decentralised remain problematic to nurture later or legislate. Peters and Pierre (2001:133) note that IGR have become increasingly negotiated and contextual – taking on the form of network governance. However, Peters and Pierre also advise that in the grand scheme of things, decentralised systems should make incremental changes towards formal roles that are necessary if IGR are to carry any weight in the provision of public services.

Network governance

Beyond intergovernmental relations, network governance – as a concept – is attracting increasing attention in public policy debate (Provan & Milward, 1995; O’Toole, 1995; Jones, Hesterly, & Borgatti, 1997; Provan & Kenis, 2008; Dedurruwaerdere, 2007; Sorensen & Torfing, 2005; Van Alstyne, 1997; Koppenjan & Klijn, 2004; Koliba, Meek and Zia, 2010). In South Africa, while the terminology is relatively new, the principle has been around for a long time. Terminologies used in this respect appear to centre on related concepts – IGR and MLG – as discussed above.

Since the 1980s, and particularly since the establishment of the European Union, the network perspective has become more common in western public-management research (Provan & Kenis, 2008). This is because, as Goldsmith and Eggers (2004) have shown, the network form is becoming more frequent in the provision of public services. The need to deliver publicly-funded services at the local level, and to integrate and co-ordinate service providers in this regard, are at the heart of this development. Sorensen and Torfing (2005:195) describe ‘governance networks’ as a relatively stable horizontal articulation of interdependent – but operationally autonomous – actors, who interact through negotiations that involve bargaining, deliberations and intense power struggles. Governance networks take place within a relatively institutionalised framework of contingently articulated rules, norms and knowledge. According to Jones et al. (1997:914) the network-governance concept promises increased efficiency and reduced agency problems for public institutions in turbulent environments. Efficiency is enhanced through distributed knowledge acquisition and decentralised problem-solving, while effectiveness is improved through the emergence of collective solutions to global problems that are indifferent to self-regulated sectors of activity.
The emergence of network governance can be correlated with an attempt to take into account the increasing importance of NGOs, the private sector, scientific networks, and international institutions in the performance of various government functions. According to Van Alstyne (1997:91), governance networks can provide an innovative environment for learning, and laying the way for adaptive and effective governance, by integrating actors from different sectors. Koppenjan and Klijn (2004) argue that many contemporary policy problems would be more effectively and legitimately dealt with through network co-ordination of resources, skills and strategies – across public sector institution, formal organisations, policy sectors and jurisdictions.

**NETWORK GOVERNANCE FOR SOUND INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS**

A recent self-assessment report on the state of local government (Department of Co-operative Governance & Traditional Affairs, 2009) attributes recent service-delivery challenges in South Africa to a range of factors – including corruption, lack of skills, historical backlogs, co-ordination problems, and institutional complexity. Of all these challenges, the last is perhaps the most vexing and urgent to address in the context of public administration and IGR in particular. Institutional complexity stems from the inherited organisational structure of the modern public sector, which produces what Hertting and Vedung (2012: 30) call ‘administrative silos’. Administrative silos lead to sector departments typically functioning in isolation, and unable to deal with cross-cutting social problems that require cross-sectoral interventions. Institutional complexity in South Africa also stems from the policy of decentralisation, which has created three spheres of government with an attendant administrative layering effect. Many services which require functional intergovernmental relations with input from all three spheres – notably housing, water and infrastructure development – have suffered because of a lack of co-ordination and sharing of key resources. The institutional complexity of administrative silos and layers is further complicated by the fact that South Africa’s social problems are themselves complex – being the consequence of a myriad of interrelated factors. The situation is not much different in Uganda where a recent study noted ‘little integration of functions between the various level of government which often leads to duplication and fragmentation of efforts’ (NALAD and EPLAC, 2000:188)

Hertting and Vedung (2012:30) state that co-ordination between various stakeholders is an important tool for bringing together different expertise, experience and perspectives. They liken network governance to the creation of a kind of ‘workshop’ – in which these different inputs are presented and discussed in order to generate new and more holistic understandings of the problem and its solutions. According to Hertting and Vedung (2012:31), the ‘ideal-type’ of network governance is rationalised as a response to problems with substantive, institutional
and political dimensions of complexity, in public policy. They further contend that – through its emphasis on co-ordination – network governance promises to turn vexing complexity into opportunities for holistic synergies, without formally intervening in established and politically important structures. From a network-governance point of view, a complex, intractable problem can be redefined as a site of ‘interdependency’ (Rhodes, 1997; Scharpf, 1978). Since participation in networks is by definition voluntary, this raises the question of the motivation of actors. What are the incentives for them to involve themselves in issues that require them to interact and negotiate with other groupings and entities – often at the expense of time, money and comfort? The answer is that they have no choice if the complexity of the issue demands it. Substantive complexities (read ‘interdependencies’) constitute incentives for operators to voluntarily co-ordinate their activities and strategies. In other words, they get more from pooling and exchanging their resources – to come up with a collective strategy for their joint and individual responses to a problem. Hertting and Vedung (2012:35) explain that agencies entrusted with policy mandates to address cross-cutting policy issues like homelessness, poverty and crime, are inherently dependent on other actors – because they do not ‘own the issue’. Such interdependent actors cannot hope to control their specific ‘outcome space’ because they are not sovereign actors implementing their agendas autonomously. Figure 1 (below) demonstrates how four such actors influence each other’s results. In this context, they are mutually interdependent, as they cannot control their own outcome domain in isolation from the other actors.

**Figure 1: Institutional complexity**

Source: (adapted from Hertting and Vedung, 2012).
The strength of network governance, we argue, is that it is the only way in which complex issues can be addressed in a decentralised administration. This is especially the case in South Africa and Uganda, where traditional horizontal ‘administrative silos’ are also segmented into vertical ‘layers’ of national, provincial and local government in the case of South Africa – and central, district and sub-county in the case of Uganda. Indeed, contrary to the ideal-type conception of network governance, network governance in South Africa and Uganda is – and has to be – a multi-directional relationship between actors in both vertical ‘silos’ and horizontal ‘layers’. We examine this scenario using, firstly, South Africa’s KwaNaloga Games as a prime example of network governance. Secondly, we draw on examples of bureaucratic and non-bureaucratic, formal and informal structures of Uganda’s Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project (NECDP), which have drawn on network-governance processes to succeed.

**NETWORK GOVERNANCE IN SOUTH AFRICA: THE KWANALOGA GAMES**

As a joint initiative of local government and various government and non-government actors, the KwaNaloga Games are in many ways a microcosm of the interactions that take place between role players in other social and economic developmental contexts (Nhlabathi & Mubangizi, 2012). Judging by the long history and increasing scope of the Games, they are not only an example of IGR at work, but also of network governance as the key to the success thereof. Beyond their usefulness as an illustration of network governance at work, we argue that the Games play an active role in cultivating new relationships and partnerships which bode well for successful IGR elsewhere.

Affiliated to the South African Local Government Association (SALGA), KwaNaloga is a Provincial Local Government Association representing all categories of municipalities in the province of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN). The KwaNaloga Games are one of the many collaborative models trialled in an attempt to give practical expression to the constitutionally-embedded values of IGR in South Africa. According to the KwaNaloga Blueprint Document (KwaNaloga, 2003), the Games were conceived as a vehicle to promote reconciliation, reconstruction, nation building, civic pride and service delivery in participating municipalities. The Document acknowledges that the various sport codes are not ‘just games’ – but rather can contribute to peace, reconciliation, hope, unity, and harmony among the participants and across the province. The official goal of the Games is to promote sound inter-district relationships by using sport as a vehicle to forge sustainable partnerships and strengthen existing relationships – thus achieving sustainable teamwork and partnerships (KwaNaloga, 2006). Stakeholders who have been involved with the Games for a long period state that the original aims of the Games were to bring peace to the strife-torn KwaZulu-Natal Province, to promote infrastructural development in the province, to forge mutual understanding among the former Regional Councils, and to learn from one another. The stakeholders of
the Games comprise: districts, local municipalities; sport federations, the provincial and national departments of Sports and Recreation and Education; local sport structures, the South African Police Services (SAPS), the provincial Department of Health and Emergency Services, and the business and private sector. For the Games to be staged successfully, each stakeholder has to fulfil certain roles and responsibilities.

The National Department of Sport and Recreation (DSR) plays a pivotal role in shaping the development of sport in KZN. Funding is allocated to provincial structures, which, in turn, are expected to facilitate the devolution of those funds to district-level federations (Burchell, 2009). The national and provincial DSRs are also charged with advising and assisting with the co-ordination of the Games at all levels, while the sports federations provide technical expertise. KwaNaloga ‘owns’ the Games, and appoints the Local Organising Committee (LOC) responsible for the organisation and co-ordination of the Games on its behalf.

Organisationally, the KwaNaloga Games are the culmination of a process which starts at municipal ward level, proceeds to the local municipality level (Mayoral Cup Games), then to district level (District Eliminations Games), and ends with the annual provincial KwaNaloga Games. Athletes are drawn mainly from schools that participate in the United School Sports Association of South Africa (USSASA) Games, as well as out-of-school youth, community clubs, and sport federations. The players range in age from 10 to 35 years, depending on the sport code, and are drawn from both rural and urban areas. Being a developmental initiative, the KwaNaloga Games attempt to identify, expose and nurture the talent of young athletes – from an amateur to a professional level. During the preparations for the Games, budgets and other cross-sectoral activities are co-ordinated by establishing consultation and implementation protocols within sport-planning committees and other structures. In this regard, Nhlabathi and Mubangizi (2012) hypothesised that in the process of sharing information and exchanging leadership, administration and management ideas, skills and expertise, IGR are fostered and strengthened. They concluded that the successful staging of the KwaNaloga Games since 1998 indicates the overall success of the mechanisms that produce the event. Specifically, since they are a single, jointly-produced affair, their success attests to the behind-the-scenes success of the relations between the various stakeholders. The ability of such a wide variety of role players to work together across institutional, political, and economic divides, can be attributed to network governance – is a wholly appropriate model for a context as institutionally and substantively complex as grassroots development in South Africa.

**NETWORK GOVERNANCE IN UGANDA: THE NUTRITIONAL AND EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (NECDP)**

In Uganda, the involvement of the private sector in decentralisation and network governance transcends all fields – including health, agriculture, and water
and sanitation. Faced with budgetary cuts, Uganda, as with other developing countries, is in a continuous search for ways to provide public services efficiently and effectively. Drawing on the private sector through partnership arrangements is not uncommon. Under the Public Sector Participation (PSP) strategy, Hirn (2013:3-4) notes that all construction work for water and sanitation facilities is expected to be done by the private sector. Beyond construction, however, it is expected that PSP also takes on the role of management. In this regard, there has been a proliferation of private operators in the management of piped-water supply systems in small Ugandan towns. A good example of a network-governance arrangement is Uganda’s Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project (NECDP), which aims to improve the quality of life of children below the age of six years. Britto, Engle and Alderman (2009:26-27) note that the project had three aims. These were to:

- Help communities organise services for children aged less than six years through growth monitoring and promotion activities, establishment of early childcare and education facilities, and access to child-health services through six-monthly child health days.
- Strengthen the capacity of families and communities through sensitisation, education, and skills training on early child development and nutrition, and training for savings and income generation.
- Provide support to communities through community grants and incentives.

The programme delivery is achieved with three inter-related components: community-based interventions and grants, sub-district activities, and national-level initiatives including capacity-building mechanisms by NGOs. The project is as such conceptualised as a multi-sectoral intervention designed to improve the distribution of economic benefits and the quality of life of the population.

The NECDP is an International Development Association (IDA)-supported project which was implemented in 35 districts in Uganda from 2000 to 2003 (Britto, Engle & Alderman 2009). At the start of the project, 12% of Ugandan children were expected to die before reaching their first birthday due to preventable infectious diseases, there were many (1.2 million) orphans and vulnerable children left in the hands of extended families mainly due to the HIV/AIDs pandemic, and Ugandan children and mothers were said to suffer from micro-nutrient deficiencies that contributed to poor health (World Bank, 1997). According to Fraser (Britto, Engle & Alderman, 2009:25), the NECDP was designed to enhance the capacity of families and communities to foster the growth, learning and development of children aged less than six years. The NECDP was implemented and achieved through a network of actors at different levels. NECDP implemented multiple interventions including: community-based interventions and grants; sub-district/sub-county level activities; and national-level activities. Based on the level of malnutrition, infant mortality, and rate of primary-school enrolment, certain sub-counties were selected to participate in the project – in which two-thirds of all communities in these districts
participated. Britto, Engle and Alderman (2009:26) emphasise that NECDP was implemented through a decentralised system coordinated by local NGOs and community-based organisations, who provided training to child caregivers. Two volunteers per community were selected, provided with bicycles, and then trained to undertake child-growth promotion. Communities had access to grants from the bank and district. Through participatory planning and learning processes, communities determined how such grants should be utilised.

Child-health days were organised at the parish level every six months. These days were used as an opportunity to provide integrated-health services to communities, and to conduct sensitisation about health, nutrition and food security. Another important intervention at the community level included the ‘educational campaign, community and home-based interventions for long term development’ (Britto, Engle & Alderman, 2009:28) – which mainly focused on messages and information on growth and child development, such as health-seeking behaviours, breastfeeding, complementary feeding, the importance of learning in children through play activities, and the importance of fathers in the development of their children. At national level, the project design was discussed widely among government ministries and development agencies, NGOs, and the private sector (World Bank, 1997) – and was basically embedded in the Uganda National Programme of Action for Children. The national-level interventions included: building a common understanding of the project among implementing districts, community leaders and CBO/NGO staff; building capacity through training in project and financial management for the project implementers; conducting training needs’ assessments at district and regional levels in project-management areas and technical areas of early childhood development, micro-enterprise development, and participatory planning and implementation (Child Health & Development Centre, 2001). The training targeted key project functionaries from the districts, lead NGOs, and district focal persons, and also focused on building teams. It is through such participatory training that stakeholders were assigned roles and responsibilities with regard to project activities, procedures such as procurement and planning were laid out, and a common perception about early childhood development was also established. Through such activities, lead NGOs and CBOs were trained to adapt/develop training materials for sub-county CBOs/NGOs. The lead NGOs were supported to set up management information systems, and to prepare to undertake district monitoring and evaluation exercises. There was a clear network and coordination-development mechanism – right from the initiation of the project. The project was designed to include several sectors and to enhance coordination among them. For instance, the team-building training or workshops at the start of the project, in all sub-regions, brought together all line departments of the districts, including: agriculture and production, health services, chief finance officers, gender labour and social/community development, chief administrative officers, local NGOs/ CBOs responsible for children and women affairs, elected leaders, opinion leaders,
and other key stakeholders. In the end, such team-building exercises led to sharing of information about the project (distribution of printed materials) and building consensus on what different districts can do – thereby developing district action plans for the NECDP.

LESSONS ON NETWORK GOVERNANCE FROM UGANDA AND SOUTH AFRICA

The cases from Uganda and South Africa show how two or more legitimately independent formations have worked together to achieve, not only their own objectives, but also those of the collective. The cases demonstrate that some of the networks are either self-initiated spontaneous arrangements that surface out of need, or they may be decreed by mandate or contractual obligation. In each case, there are valuable lessons to draw – which could inform future practice and further research. As discussed below these lessons centre on four critical aspects which we consider pivotal to successful network processes, namely, administration and management; leadership; good relations; communication and capacity issues.

Administration and management in network governance

While KwaNaloga is the custodian of the Games, there are currently no full-time officials for their co-ordination; instead the KwaNaloga Association staff assists with the operational planning and administration of the Games. The co-ordination of the Games is solely the duty of sport officers/managers on the LOC – through the setting up and planning of meetings and the drawing up of operational plans and budgets. Although the provincial DSR is responsible for sports development, their role and involvement in the Games is seen to be minimal. In a scenario with as many stakeholders as the Games, conflict is likely to develop, as various roleplayers often have different expectations and agendas. For example, councillors and sport federations have different interests, expectations and requirements – especially regarding the selection of athletes – which sometimes cause conflict in the co-ordination of the Games. Interestingly, as the example of politics in the section below about NECDP in Uganda shows – these conflicts have been successfully dealt with in the past through network governance. Since horizontal co-ordination follows from deliberation, open communication and mutual trust (Hertting & Vedung, 2012:38), it can be inferred that these channels are open to participants in the Games, and that these, together with the incentive to deliver successful games, have created an enabling environment for conflict resolution.

The NECDP in Uganda had a formal control-governance system with a clear implementation structure to ensure effective implementation of the project. Provan and Kenis (2008:231) argue that for goal-directed organisational networks with a distinct identity, some form of governance is necessary to ensure that participants engage in collective and mutually supportive action, that conflict is addressed, and that network resources are acquired and utilised efficiently and effectively.
As such, the NECDP structure emphasised decentralised governance, but at the same time recognised the role of bureaucratic governance. According to the World Bank (1997), the main executing agency was the Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development, and NGOs and CBOs were the principal implementing agents at the community level. At the national level, the coordinating committee was multi-sectoral and comprised representatives from the Ministries of Health, Population and Economic Development, Education, Gender and Local Government as well as NGOs, and the private sector. The committee was chaired by the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development and was responsible for policy oversight and approval of plans and budgets. At the same time, there was a project coordinator at the ministry level to undertake executive, reporting and communication roles. Project implementation for national-level interventions and district-level interventions was undertaken by NGOs/CBOs, who reported to the project coordinator and district focal persons respectively. NGOs/CBOs were selected using competitive bidding. Co-ordination mechanisms for such multi-layer and multi-organisation collective action-oriented undertakings may present complexities. However, the initial orientation workshops of the project and the fact that the project involved beneficiaries in decision making enabled easy coordination.

**Leadership and network governance**

Without good, co-operative leadership at all levels; the KwaNaloga Games could not take place. Surprisingly, political leadership seems to have little influence on the manner in which the Games are managed – since the different decisions and agendas are set for the Games by whichever official happens to be available at the time. The case study shows that quality leadership and skills are displayed by officials, politicians and federations alike, during the sport-planning meetings for team selections and the holding of finals. Therefore, while leadership is crucial in programme implementation, political leadership is not necessarily the only source to look towards. Collaborative networks are typically regarded as having no distinct leader or supervisor-subordinate hierarchy, but instead have ‘(supposedly) equal, horizontal relationships among a group of diverse stakeholders’ (Mandell & Keast, 2009:6). These authors go on to describe success in collaborative networks as ‘based on establishing and maintaining appropriate interactions among partners’ (Mandell & Keast, 2009:4). Through the LOC which it nominates, KwaNaloga can be seen a ‘facilitator’ rather than a ‘leader’ in the collaborative network of which it is a part. Hertting and Vedung (2012:33) explain that:

‘...it is no contradiction in terms that external governors, such as a national government, or the European Commission, may play a central role in network cooperation and coordination as facilitators. According to our ideal-type definition, they may do so if their stimuli are intended and organised as starters, based on the idea that, in the long run, the pertinent actors themselves will cooperate and organise cooperation’.
While the LOC’s role conforms in some ways to the role of the administrative entity that co-ordinates activities in the network administrative organisation governance model (see Provan & Kenis, 2009: 448), it is also an actor in the network – providing vital services and input of its own. Using Mandell and Keast’s terminology, the role of KwaNaloga (via the LOC) is that of ‘process catalyst’. Otherwise stated, KwaNaloga provides the impetus for the interactions, but does not control the outcomes of the process. It provides the stimulus for ‘directive collective action’ (Mandell & Keast, 2009), and is responsible for ensuring that participants stay on track and work collaboratively. KwaNaloga carries out this facilitative/directive role via the LOC, by organising regular planning and feedback meetings – including post-mortem meetings after each of the Games.

In the case of NECDP in Uganda, although the coordination is done through the regular bureaucratic structures in the district, the Implementing Agents in the district are, in fact, NGOs. In their role as Implementing Agents, NGOs operate in a tripartite partnership with districts and central-government structures. The Implementing Agents thus comprise a network of NGOs contracted by the government to motivate communities and provide information to project participants. Garcia, Alderman and Rudqvist (1999), note that the project relies on systematic monitoring of inputs and outputs flowing through the organisations that implement the project. In communities, inputs, outputs, and child outcomes are monitored continuously, and are reported to higher levels of the project’s organisational structure. This is done, for example, through the lead NGO and to the district-coordinating committee, and finally to the project-coordinating office based at national level. Through this, partnership capacity of communities and district personnel is built to review and support project activities. In addition, specific community needs for childcare are identified for implementation within the available resources. In this way, the NECDP arrangement provides a good reference case with regard to IGR and network-governance processes. A highlight of its success lies within the strong strategic communication programme, which forms a foundation of the project. The strategic communication programme not only helps mothers and caregivers adopt appropriate behavioral changes, it also helps frame project-related issues relevant to different stakeholders – such as parliamentarians, mothers, community leaders, educators, and local-government administrators; crafts persuasive messages according to needs, concerns and perceptions; and uses the most appropriate communication channels (Carbanero-Verzosa, 2005).

In the final analysis, the success of the mooted collaborative networks is judged as much by their primary goal attainment, as by their ability to establish and maintain appropriate interactions among partners. These interactions include the ‘parent’ organisations of which each stakeholder is a part, and which have to be kept informed regarding the activities and contribution of their delegates. Through the networking process, new infrastructure and environment are created, that allows for the innovations needed to deal with complex problems in the future – as well as those currently being worked on.
**Good relationships in network governance**

The quality of relationships is important, because as participants communicate and interact, relations are promoted. Good relationships enhance team spirit and performance, and the success of the KwaNaloga Games, for example, can be attributed to the collaborative nature of their organisation. This collaboration is not the result purely of a formal requirement (even though it does originate from one) – but of the action of participating and negotiating a shared solution to a common goal. The latter sustains the network over time, and enables it to extend to other contexts. This has implications not only for the negotiation of future cross-cutting challenges, but also for stakeholders’ future contributions to their ‘home turf’, be it a government department or NGO. As Mandell and Keast (2009:15) put it, network members:

‘...can no longer only make changes at the margins in how they operate. Instead they will be involved in actions requiring major changes in their operations. These may range from deleting and/or changing their rules and regulations to agreeing to give up and/or take on new responsibilities in carrying out their operations. The risks are very high. Participants must be willing to develop new ways of thinking, form new types of relationships and be willing to make changes in existing systems’.

Another aspect of relationship-building in networks is the element of accountability. Because the participants are jointly responsible for the functioning and results of their networking, they are also accountable to each other. Hertting and Vedung (2012:38) cite Elinor Ostrom – who argues that an important prerequisite for a successful cooperation is that the co-operating partners themselves jointly organise ‘mutual monitoring’ of each other. Although there are fora for feedback and discussion, accountability and transparency have, however, not yet reached this level in KwaNaloga. Provan and Kenis (2008) note that networks comprise autonomous organisations – however, they are essentially cooperative endeavours, with no legal imperatives and therefore their relationships are bound together by governance to ensure collective and mutually-supportive actions. Similarly, in the case of NECDP, the different levels and multiple actors were bound together by the governance structure, clarity of roles, and clarity of direction and communication efforts.

**Communication and network governance**

The KwaNaloga Games demonstrate that communication mechanisms within a specific project improve over time. This is largely due to the learning that takes place over the years within the network of stakeholders – in this case the Games. In the case of Uganda’s NECDP, a comprehensive communication programme was developed at the programme-design stage, and this provided a clear understanding of the perceptions and positions of key stakeholders, and served to address perceived fears and barriers to change (Carbanero-Verzosa, 2005). In both cases, communication between the various offices occurs through meetings, training
workshops and other forms of electronic communication. In the case of the KwaNaloga Games, the communication systems evolved out of need rather than statute. Thus, while statutory bodies may be useful in initiating network governance, it is clear that these cannot be forced or indeed legislated. Rather, interaction and trust-building over a period of time create sound intergovernmental and network relations that benefit all parties. According to Mandell and Keast (2009), this is because in such networks, the formalised communication processes work as a de facto leadership mechanism. In support of this argument, they cite Huxham and Vangen’s findings that leadership is not always enacted by people, and structures and processes in themselves can facilitate interaction and drive agendas for action. Returning to the question of network governance, it may be argued that once the conditions are created for communication across sectors – paths and links are set up, and these have a long-term benefit in sustaining network governance.

**Capacity issues and network governance**

A further benefit of network governance is in the inherent opportunity for capacity building and knowledge exchange. As expected, different role players in the network will have different skills which are often exchanged for the greater good. We noted that participating districts do not have sufficient staff dedicated to sports and recreation in the case of South Africa or to foods and nutrition in the case of Uganda. Some districts have limited facilities and infrastructure, resulting in a shortage of physical, human and financial resources. For example, the sports officers are not only responsible for sport, but also deal with other youth programmes, arts/culture, and tourism. The duties performed during the Games are beyond the available human resources in the Community Services Department, in all districts. Yet municipal officials, Department officials, and sport federations all come together to assist where extra hands are needed. At the beginning of the project, there was limited capacity in project management and also in technical areas of early childhood development in Uganda. The ability of Ugandan women to provide adequate child care was not only said to be limited by lack of knowledge, but also by their lack of access to, and control over income and family resources (World Bank, 1997). The needs’ assessments conducted by the Child Health and Development Centre at Makerere University in 2001, show that: a) most staff at district level did not have training in most of the thematic areas – particularly ECD/ECE, children’s rights, nutrition, community health, and participatory planning; and the few staff that had been trained in some of the thematic areas, had had no opportunity to practice such skills and to pass on the acquired knowledge to the community. The study concluded that there was a need for capacity building in areas of: participatory planning and implementation, community mobilisation and sensitisation, children’s rights and advocacy, training of trainers, project design, data-collection techniques, micro-enterprise development, management information systems, project monitoring and evaluation, report writing, rapid-appraisal techniques, and early childhood education/development. Indeed, the
project conducted several capacity-building interventions, including: team-building workshops; project planning and management training; training of trainers in early childhood development; community participatory planning and sensitisation workshops; child-day campaigns conducted at parish level; and training in savings and group formation to support child development. These community-level workshops also provided an opportunity for communities to learn more about factors related to early child development. In addition, at the sub-district level, child-health days were held every six months, and provided an opportunity to communities to access integrated health services (Alderman, Konde-Lule, Sebuliba, Bundy & Hall, and 2006:124). Furthermore, the child-health days provided an opportunity for imparting information about health, nutrition, and food security through a range of interactive methods.

**CONCLUSION**

The findings suggest that a contributing factor to the success of the KwaNaloga Games and the NECDP, is a shared conceptual understanding of the nature, relevance and role of network governance in the implementation of these projects. In the delivery of public services therefore, it is necessary that role players in all spheres understand the ‘bigger picture’. Such role players should therefore be encouraged to think beyond their own sphere of government, and seek out the contribution of other spheres in the achievement of developmental local-government objectives. This can be done through sharing of leadership skills, facilitation and capacity building – combined with organisational and management development.

Joint co-ordination of the KwaNaloga Games and the NECDP creates a unique network collaboration which promotes IGR through coordination, communication and capacity-building. This fruitful interaction between the different spheres of government and other stakeholders is an instructive example of network governance which provides lessons for IGR in other service-delivery programmes in the public domain. We urge that successful relationships and partnerships forged in the delivery of the KwaNaloga Games and the NECDP can be sustained to contribute to the advancement of further developments in the provision of public services.

Lessons from South Africa and Uganda suggest that communication between the various co-ordinating structures plays a critical role in project success and network governance generally. For this reason, updated communication facilities, including email, should be made available to all stakeholders. Interestingly, once projects have been initiated and relationships forged amongst participants – they achieved a momentum of their own and cultivated communication and co-ordination procedures that have become a *de facto* leadership mechanism in themselves. The successful staging of the KwaNaloga Games and the implementation of the Ugandan Nutritional and Early Childhood Development Project speak to the overall success of the mechanisms in implementing the two. Specifically, since each is a jointly-produced affair, their final success attests to the behind-the-scenes
success of the relations between the various stakeholders at different spheres of government, and including the private sector and NGOs. The ability of such a wide variety of role players to work together across institutional, political and economic divides can be attributed to network governance. It is a wholly appropriate model for a context as institutionally and substantively complex as grassroots development in South Africa and Uganda.

REFERENCES


THE IMPACT OF MENTORING ON LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOUR

J. Weimers
C. Gwandure
University of the Witwatersrand
T. Mayekiso
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

ABSTRACT

The aim of the study was to assess the impact of mentoring on leadership behaviour. There were fifty-six employees in leadership positions who participated in this study. The sample was drawn from organisations based in Johannesburg. Leadership behaviour was measured using Stogdil’s (1963) Leader Behaviour Description Questionnaire (LDBQ) From XII Self. The test scores of participants in leadership positions who went through a formal organisational mentorship programme were compared with those of employees in leadership positions who did not receive organisational mentorship. Data were analysed using t-tests. The results showed significant differences in leadership behaviour between the two groups with respect to two aspects of leadership behaviour. The two groups differed significantly on leadership behaviours such as demand reconciliation and consideration. The findings suggest that mentorship had a positive impact on some aspects of leadership behaviour. Directions for future studies could focus on the aspects of leadership behaviour that are lacking in most of the leaders managing organisations in South Africa.

INTRODUCTION

Most of the language that is used in organisations could mean more than one thing due to the lack of consistency in terminology used to describe leadership concepts. Some of the terms are used interchangeably or loosely. Mentoring can be looked at from a layperson`s point of view and organisations could take a casual approach when implementing leadership improvement interventions. The public service could use leadership terms in a manner that could convey different meanings in the corporate world. In this study leadership behaviour is a variable that is defined according to standards that could be applied to both the public and private sectors. This study takes the stance that managing others is a universal concept that applies to all leaders irrespective of the context in which they work. There is not much that is written about leadership behaviour in South Africa although there are on-going studies on mentorships (Mastrofski, 2006; Schafer, 2009). Even though there are isolated studies on both concepts in South Africa,
the rate of publishing is not yet comparable to Europe and the United States of America (USA). Researchers on human resource management and organisational development in South Africa could ignite the debate and stimulate the research thrust on mentoring and leadership behaviour.

Mentoring is deemed to improve leadership qualities and it is regarded as one of the methods used to sharpen leadership skills (Monaghan & Lunt, 1992; Leaders, 2008). There has been a significant amount of research done on mentoring in Western countries such as the USA, England and the Netherlands. The application of mentoring to nursing and business is mainly explored in the American context and the role of mentoring in teaching is widely reported in England (Monaghan & Lunt, 1992; Hoffmeister et al., 2011). The interest of this study is to assess how mentoring affects leadership behaviour in an organisational context in South Africa. The argument of this study is that if we had effective leadership programmes throughout the world perhaps the world today might not have experienced adverse events such as managerial derailment in the multinational organisations, the US Shutdown in 2013, the global financial crisis which started around 2007, the Arab Spring in 2010, endless wars in the Middle East and unpredictable coup d’états in Africa. These world events show leadership failure that resulted in untold suffering of the world’s population (Sosik, Juzbasich, & Chun, 2011). Poor leadership and bad governance have negative consequences on the performance of the public service, parastatals, firms, and humanitarian organisations. Industries struggle to survive and some workplaces shed off employees when leadership flounders (Sosik, Juzbasich, & Chun, 2011). An organisation’s values are affected by its leaders (Ciulla, 1999) and the coordination and integration of groups is affected by the behaviour of its leaders (Outhwaite, 2003).

MENTORING IN AN ORGANISATIONAL CONTEXT

Mentoring involves the imparting of work-related knowledge by a senior employee to a new and inexperienced employee. It can be understood as a relationship between a less experienced employee and a more experienced employee who guides the less experienced employee (Altmeyer et al., 1994; Hale, 1996; Cooper & Kurland, 2002; Smith, Howard, Harrington, 2005; Robbins et al., 2009; Welsh, Bhave & Kim, 2012). The mentor seeks to pave a way for the career development and personal growth of the protégé who is groomed to become one of the leaders of the organisation. It is observed that managerial employees need continued retraining and retooling in order to meet the ever-changing demands of the global workplace and the job market (Hale, 1996; Saleem, 2013). In order to prepare employees for leadership roles, some organisations develop organisational learning models (Kim, 2007). These models include mentoring as part of the training and development programmes for employees. The availability of regular and consistent training facilities in organisations allows for peer development in which employees amongst themselves encourage the development of positive work-related attitudes, peer-based learning, and the promotion of innovative and
critical thinking in decision making (Chan, Li, & Pierce, 2013; Kim, 2007). Learning from peers in organisations has been found to facilitate knowledge transfer and it enhances employee productivity (Chan, Li, & Pierce, 2013).

Mentoring is associated with employee motivation. Mentees usually have high levels of work motivation, institutional attachment and they normally have a more positive attitude towards their career development (Irby, 2011). Other studies such as one by Cooper and Kurland (2002) and another by Hoffmeister et al., (2011) have suggested that mentoring is linked to the career mobility of employees as well as career development. Mentoring could improve employees’ soft skills and prepare them for the world of work. It could equip employees with skills and abilities that would enable them to enter the global job market with a competitive edge (Bloch, 1996). Mentors can help protégés develop problem solving and reflective thinking skills (Barnett, 1995). Mentoring as a structured competency development training programme could improve employee performance (Bapna et al., 2013).

There is confusion and ambiguity about the indicators of successful mentoring in the workplace. Hamlin and Sage (2011) point out that there is paucity of studies that demonstrate what successful mentoring is. Most of the studies on mentoring do not seem to take into account the fact that the mentoring process might fail. It is argued by some critics that mentoring might not work in some instances no matter the intensity of the investment in human capital development (Maloney, 2012). Effective mentorship should reflect positive personal attributes in mentees and they should exhibit trustworthy work behaviours. Successful mentorships are associated with happiness, job satisfaction, job success, or organisational commitment (Maloney, 2012). When mentoring fails, there are reported cases of mentee abuse, or the development of undesirable relationships between the protégé and the mentor or the lack of commitment by the mentee and mentor (Maloney, 2012).

In some organisations trainees have to make an effort and find their own mentors (Hale, 1996). This creates a situation where the mentee might not necessarily get all the guidance they would need. If the employee seeking mentorship does not get a senior manager who would be willing to provide mentorship duties, it then implies that there would be no guidance for the new employee. It is common in South Africa that some managers develop themselves up the organisational ladder without having gone through a formal mentorship programme. Some mentors might be overloaded with mentees to such an extent that they would not be unable to give the trainees the level of attention necessary for professional development (Hale, 1996). If the mentorship programme is conducted in a haphazard manner and left to the new employees to decide, some of the employees without networks in the organisation might go without a mentor, not knowing where to find a mentor (Hale, 1996). Informal mentorship programmes are not guided, they happen as the organisation wishes at the whim and discretion of senior managers and directors in the organisation (Smith, Howard, & Harrington, 2005; Welsh, Bhave & Kim, 2012). The public service or civil service in Africa and other developing regions is
usually saddled with unplanned mentorship and induction programmes for new employees (Assan & Lumadi, 2013). Informal mentorships are spontaneous and unstructured relationships with minimal organisational involvement. Informal mentees are employees who have proved that they are worth mentoring, they have shown great potential and in return they receive the attention they are supposed to from their informal mentors (Smith, Howard & Harrington, 2005).

Successful mentorship programmes are characterised by managers taking a leading role in rolling out the mentorship for all recruits (Hale, 1996). In some organisations, all the managers and executives are expected to serve as mentors in their fields of specialisation (Bell & Goldsmith, 2013). In addition, some organisations provide various mentors or coaches who would offer guidance in specific work-related skills. Line managers normally act as coaches but some organisations would prefer to have multiple helpers to expose trainees to the wider spectrum of expertise in the organisation (Hale, 1996). This is done to develop multi-skills in the trainee managers and to immerse the new managers into the organisation’s history, culture and values (Bloch, 1996; Hale, 1996). The protégé is assisted fully to develop an organisational identity as a leader and to develop dreams that they would work to fulfil in the organisation by forming intimate and constructive relationships with their mentor (Kram, 1983; Monaghan & Lunt, 1992).

There are sceptics who do not believe that organisational training programmes can produce good leaders. Allio (2005) states that current leadership training programmes teach leadership concepts and theories but they do not teach leadership competencies. It is argued that leaders can only gain leadership competence if they perform leadership acts (Allio, 2005). The critics argue that leaders can only be made through experience and that the leadership training programmes that organisations make use of will not produce the desired leaders. It is suggested that potential leaders or mentees should have an older and more experienced mentor who can actually model leadership behaviours. The claim is that leadership behaviour cannot be produced from a training programme but only through the experience and guidance offered by a mentor (Allio, 2005). Particular importance is placed on the role of the mentor in assisting the creation of a leader who can actually perform leadership functions as opposed to a leader who is just well versed in leadership theory and models (Allio, 2005).

LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOUR

Leadership behaviour is used interchangeably with leader behaviour in this study to tie in with the historical development of the concept in organisational behaviour. There were no formal definitions of leadership when the researchers on organisational behaviour sought to assess a leader’s behaviour in an organisational context (Stogdil, 1963). Leadership behaviour is the action taken by the leader in leading others. This involves the transactions performed by the manager to promote the interests of the organisation on a day-to-day basis. Leadership behaviour or
leader behaviour in this study is based on the paradigm developed by Stogdil in 1963 which presents twelve dimensions of the concept. Leadership behaviour is characterised by the following measurable dimensions: representation, demand reconciliation, tolerance of uncertainty, persuasiveness, initiation of structure, tolerance and freedom, role assumption, consideration, production emphasis, predictive accuracy, integration and superior orientation (Stogdil, 1963).

Representation in leadership behaviour is a leadership quality that shows the leader’s ability to speak and act as the representative of the group (Stogdil, 1963). The manager should behave in ways that show that they work for the interests of the organisation and they are in essence institutional managers and not personal power managers. It is expected that the leader assumes the ambassadorial role in which they advocate and live for the organisation. Demand reconciliation leadership involves reconciling conflicting demands and reduces disorder to system (Stogdil, 1963). Leaders are expected to resolve conflict because too much strife can hurt organisational performance (Elmagri & Eaton, 2011). Leaders maintain order and they strive to maintain cordial relationships with internal and external partners (Karp, 2013). They manage people and systems according to laid down standards and they seek to avoid organisational instability (Karp, 2013). People who lead others should be able to tolerate uncertainty. They should embrace uncertainty and postponement without anxiety or upset (Stogdil, 1963). Leaders are expected to tolerate ambiguity and they should learn to be patient and postpone action until it is the right time to do so. Leaders deal with some situations that are uncertain and they are expected to tolerate risk in some business or organisational decisions (Frijns & Gilbert, 2013). Tolerance in organisational leadership and organisational investment is affected by the need to maintain a balance between risk aversion and risk taking (Frijns & Gilbert, 2013). Risk perception is a quality that leaders are expected have and they show their followers that they do not expose the organisation to unnecessary risks. Even if leaders are expected to show such qualities, they weigh costs and benefits before making a decision. If the leader is convinced that their organisation will not benefit from a business venture or similar arrangements they should be prepared to postpone the deal without reservations or being upset about it (Stogdil, 1963).

Leaders should be persuasive (Stogdil, 1963). Leaders who are not persuasive might not be patient enough to strike deals for their organisations in situations that are unpredictable and frustrating. Such leaders should be able to use persuasion and argument effectively and they should be able to exhibit strong convictions in what they believe in (Stogdil, 1963). Leaders who are not persuasive are usually poor communicators and they seldom win an audience or followers. Effective leaders influence decisions, attitudes, and beliefs like sales people (Conrad, 2013). Leaders are expected to initiate structure. The leader should clearly define own role, and lets followers know what is expected (Stogdil, 1963). If the leader fails to show subordinates or employees the work they are required to perform that could create
anarchy or poor performance in organisations. Employees or followers expect the leader to focus more on managing the business or work and not relationships at work (Littrell et al., 2013). The leader is expected to show qualities such as task-orientation and not concentrating on pleasing people at work.

Tolerance and freedom is a characteristic expected of leaders. Leaders should allow followers scope to for initiative, decision and action (Stogdil, 1963). Democratic leaders will delegate duties and leave employees to decide on how to meet the work requirements or productivity targets. Employee initiatives are crucial in work performance innovation as the employees could feel empowered when they are asked to seek out new ways of improving their work performance (Fernandez & Moldogaziev, 2013). Role assumption happens when a leader actively exercises the leadership role rather than surrendering leadership to others (Stogdil, 1963). Some of the leaders leave their work to be done by other people such as friends, spouses or powerful people or cliques in the organisation. Employees expect the leader to be present and stamping their authority. They might resent being managed by anyone else other than their designated leader or manager. However, there are differences in leadership characteristics in terms of power motivation and leadership role occupancy (Schuh et al., 2013). Some leaders do not like exerting too much power and influence on the followers. Leaders who score high on the dimension of consideration are people-oriented in their managerial style. Such leaders regard the comfort, wellbeing, status, and contributions of followers (Stogdil, 1963). They tend to be fair and are concerned about procedural justice when dealing with employees. They show high levels of empathy in the workplace and they seek to promote a sense of belonging in employees who are committed to the organisation (Cornelis et al., 2013; Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008).

Productivity is a measure that is used to judge leaders. Followers look for change and they expect the leader to bring about the change and improve their lives. Employees would like to have a leader who would enable them to meet production targets. Good performance is associated with security of employment and increase in income (Wu, 2013). Leadership behaviour has a production emphasis. The leader is expected to apply pressure for productive output (Stogdil, 1963). However, the leader needs to moderate the use of power to achieve goals because too much power and pressure could hinder employee resourcefulness and creativity (Fernandez & Moldogaziev, 2013). Predictive accuracy is expected of a leader. The leader should be able to exhibit foresight and ability to predict outcome accurately (Stogdil, 1963). Foresight is part and parcel of leading others (Gary 2010). Leaders should have a vision that helps them to predict fortunes for the organisation and threats lying on the horizon. If the leader fails to appraise the business environment in which they operate, that could cause organisational failure. Some companies get liquidated and some departments are closed down due to poor predictive focus and lack of futuristic planning (Gkliatis & Koufopoulos, 2013).

Integration in the organisation is realised when the leader maintains a
closely knit organisation and resolves inter-member conflicts (Stogdil, 1963). The maintenance of harmony in all sections of the organisation is a sign of good leadership (Chao & Tian, 2013). Superior orientation is a leadership attribute that focuses on maintaining cordial relations with superiors. The leader should have influence with them and the leader should be seen to be striving for higher status (Stogdil, 1963). Many unsuccessful leaders tend to disregard the input of those in higher authority and that usually results in managerial derailment (Williams et al., 2013).

**AIM OF THE STUDY**

The aim of the study is to assess the impact of mentoring on leadership behaviour.

**HYPOTHESIS**

There is no difference in leadership behaviours between leaders who have been mentored and leaders who have not been mentored in organisations.

**METHODOLOGY**

The research design, participants, sampling and instruments as well as procedure are discussed in order to legitimise the subsequent findings in the study.

**Research design**

The research design was that of comparing two groups. The scores of the group that was mentored were compared with the scores of the group that was not mentored. The cross-sectional design gathers all data at one point in time (Greenstein, Roberts, & Sitas, 2003; Rosnow & Rosenthal, 1999). It measures the existing differences in the sample. There were two groups; a control group and an experimental group. The independent variable could not be manipulated and it was a post-test only design. There was no random assignment because all participants who had been mentored were in the experimental group. Similarly, the participants who were not mentored made up the control group.

**Participants**

The sample consisted of 55 employees drawn from various organisations in both the public and private sectors. Participants were recruited on the basis of `having been mentored` or `not mentored`. Participants were any employees who performed leadership roles in their respective organisations or workplaces. These included managers, chairpersons, project leaders and coordinators.

**Sampling**

The sampling technique was non-probability sampling which meant that not everybody in the population had an equal chance of being selected to participate in the study (Greenstein et al., 2003). The sampling strategy was a mixture and had elements of convenience and purposive sampling. It had convenience elements in
that the sample was drawn only from those who were available and who wanted to participate in the study (Greenstein et al., 2003) although it also had elements of purposive sampling in that the sample had to have the specific characteristic of having had mentoring or not having mentoring.

**Instruments**

A biographical questionnaire was used to capture demographic characteristics of the study sample. The information required included age, job title as well as whether or not the participant had received mentoring. The Leader Behaviour Description Questionnaire-Form XII Self was used to measure leadership behaviour (Stogdil, 1963). The instrument has 12 subscales that measure representation, demand reconciliation, tolerance of uncertainty, persuasiveness, initiation of structure, tolerance of freedom, role assumption, consideration, production emphasis, predictive accuracy, integration and superior orientation. Before the study began, the instrument was assessed for reliability.

**Procedure**

The study got ethics clearance before participants were recruited. The researcher emailed various organisations and visited several organisations inviting employees in leadership positions to participate in the study. Permission was sought from organisations before participants were enrolled for the study.

**RESULTS**

The reliability coefficients of the subscales of the Leader Behaviour Description Questionnaire-Form XII Self (Stogdil, 1963) were established as presented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Reliability Coefficients (Cronbach alpha)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subscale</th>
<th>Reliability coefficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Representation</td>
<td>.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demand Reconciliation</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolerance Uncertainty</td>
<td>.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persuasiveness</td>
<td>.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiating Structure</td>
<td>.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolerance Freedom</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role Assumption</td>
<td>.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration</td>
<td>.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production Emphasis</td>
<td>.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predictive Accuracy</td>
<td>.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superior Orientation</td>
<td>.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The study used all the subscales as they were found suitable for the study.
sample. The main aim of the study was to investigate the effect that mentoring has on employees in leadership positions. A t-test, independent samples, was used to establish the difference between the two groups (Howell, 2008). The results showed that there was a statistically significant difference in the leadership behaviour dimension of demand reconciliation. It was $t (53) = 2.627, p < 0.05$. This means that the null hypothesis is rejected at the 0.05 level of significance. Therefore, there is a notable difference between the experimental group ($M = 2.89, SD = 0.47$) and the control group ($M = 2.50, SD = 0.62$). The experimental group had a higher mean on demand reconciliation.

The two groups differed significantly on the consideration subscale. It was $t (53) = -3.471, p < 0.05$. This means that the null hypothesis is rejected at the 0.05 level of significance. Therefore, there is a notable difference between the experimental group ($M = 4.100, SD = 0.804$) and control group ($M = 4.878, SD = 0.841$). The control group had a higher mean on consideration. There were no significant relationships for the leadership behaviour aspects such as representation, tolerance of uncertainty, persuasiveness, initiation of structure, tolerance of freedom, role assumption, production emphasis, predictive accuracy, integration and superior orientation.

**ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION**

Two significant results were found in this study. The first result was that those who had been mentored were found to be higher in the demand reconciliation. The results confirm previous studies which show that mentoring improves leadership behaviour (Welsh et al., 2012; Maloney, 2012). In this study participants who were mentored showed high scores on leadership attributes such as reconciliation of conflicting demands and they sought to reduce disorder in the workplace (Karp, 2013; Stogdil, 1963). The second result showed that the control group had higher scores on the leadership behaviour of consideration.

The demand reconciliation subscale measures how much the participants reconcile conflicting demands and turn a chaotic work environment into a more orderly one (Stogdil, 1963). This suggests that those who have had mentoring would be more proficient at creating an orderly working environment and settling any reconciling and conflicting demands from other employees (Elmagri & Eaton, 2011). It could be expected that mentored leaders would show conflict handling skills in the workplace. The ability to put systems in place comes with learning in an organisational setting (Karp, 2013). Trained leaders follow policies and organisational conventions in order to promote the organisational culture and organisational harmony (Chao & Tian, 2013). In South Africa, mentored leaders could have a strong need to avoid conflict in the workplace since some labour issues could escalate causing damage to organisational integrity, performance and profitability. Employees could lose part of their salary due to the rule that employees should not be paid for days not worked when they are on an illegal strike (Du Plessis, 2013).
In the study, participants who received mentorship showed lower scores on the leadership behaviour attribute of consideration than employees who were not mentored. This could be taken as a positive leadership attribute to some degree. Leaders or managers are mentored to balance work demands and human relations needs. In this case, the mentored leaders put more emphasis on work values and work attitudes that promoted organisational success. There are studies which support the idea that managers should be more task-oriented rather than human relations-oriented (Littrel et al., 2013). Depending on the industry or nature of the organisations, it is generally argued that as leaders or managers climb up the corporate ladder, they tend to be work-focused and results-oriented (Longenecker, 2013). Most of the organisational mentorship programmes do not lose sight of the job focus and corporate excellence as they incalculable leadership values in the protégés (Wu, 2013). The results do not imply outright negation of the consideration aspect of leadership behaviour, it only indicate leaders` inclination on a pendulum of managerial balance of work and empathy (Cornelius et al., 2013). It is argued in this study that it would not be surprising to find more of the leaders who were not mentored associating leadership with being sympathetic and empathetic to employees needs in the workplace (Cornelius, 2013). In most paternalistic cultures, leaders and elders are expected to provide for the needy and the unfortunate as a universal human virtue. Leaders view themselves as parents and employees are treated as children or minors who need to be protected (Pallegrini & Scandura, 2008). It could be argued that not having been mentored might have made the leaders in the comparison group feel that they needed to treat employees more humanely so that they could be perceived in a positive light as good leaders who are liked by employees. This might have prompted them to consistently work at a high level of consideration and to pay close attention to the needs of their colleagues and subordinates so as to increase employee loyalty in their leadership (Ding et al., 2012). Employee loyalty could be won through paternalistic acts of giving and generous offers by leaders to subordinates but that could be indicative of lack of leadership or managerial induction into formal leadership roles (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008).

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The sample size was small that could have affected generalisability of findings. The sampling strategy, non-probability, convenience sampling, might be problematic as this tends to attract a specific type of person to the research. This means, volunteers tend to be more active, engaged and thoughtful in general terms and might not be the most representative of the population. The study was non-experimental, which means there was no control over the independent variable and no random assignment. The instrument used in the study was long to such an extent that some of the participants might have been bored in the end.
IMPLICATIONS FOR LEADERSHIP

The results of this study have a bearing on leadership behaviour and how to deal with people who are being led. The results suggest that most of the training programmes that happen formally or informally in organisations do not have a marked impact on leadership behaviours. The display of leadership skills and how to deal with followers did not largely distinguish the mentored leaders from the unmentored. There were no profound differences in most of the aspects of leadership behaviour between two groups of leaders in this study. The results could have the implications that perhaps the current approaches to leadership training and skills development might need to be re-examined in South Africa. The seemingly generic training and development programmes that are offered in most of the organisations in South Africa might need to be refined with local content since most of the programmes are imported from training houses or training organisations based overseas.

The argument of this study is that leadership behaviour should not be confined to any one particular industry, or trade. Leadership qualities should be largely universal to meet the needs of various work contexts, that is, the public service, private sector or non-governmental organisations. It is argued in this study that leaders should be flexible and followers should be comfortable with leaders mentored in various work environments. Leadership behaviours should exhibit universal dimensions or characteristics found in all the people who lead others. In this study, the assessment of leadership qualities was independent of and blind to the background of the leaders recruited to participate in the study.

CONCLUSION

The study compared the leadership behaviours of participants who were mentored with the behaviours of participants who were not mentored. The results did not show differences in most of the dimensions of leadership behaviour. The two groups showed significant differences on the leadership behaviour aspects of demand reconciliation and consideration. More studies are expected to delve into the reason why mentorship programmes do not seem to produce the desired results in some organisational training programmes.

REFERENCES


Frijns, B., Gilbert, A., Lehnert, T., & Tourani-Rad, A. 2013. Uncertainty


Williams, F. I., Campbell, C., McCartney, W., & Gooding, C. 2013. Leader

MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEMS FOR ENHANCING GOVERNANCE AND GOVERNMENT LEGITIMACY IN SOUTH AFRICA

I.G. Govender
Department of Entrepreneurial Studies and Management
Durban University of Technology

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the article is to investigate the influence of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) on governance and government legitimacy. Monitoring and evaluation could enhance governance and government legitimacy through a participative approach of including more stakeholders in service delivery. The absence of proper performance management systems and accountability mechanisms diminish the value of M&E initiatives. The article proposes that M&E audits be undertaken through a cost-benefit analysis to ascertain their value to improving performance management and service delivery. The article further proposes that the government undertake accountability reforms to ensure the demand and sustainability of the M&E systems. The article is of value to institutions and officials with oversight roles to ensure effective and efficient management of state resources for the compliance with the national, provincial and local government socio-economic developmental mandates.

INTRODUCTION

Governments’ are increasingly required to demonstrate results, primarily by improving the quality of life of its citizens and ensuring that value for money has been delivered. While the recipients of basic services increased and with the massive expenditure in service delivery, community dissatisfaction with poor service delivery continues to increase in many municipalities around the country (Presidency, 2009: 4). Some of the reasons for poor service delivery include: a lack of political will, inadequate leadership, management weaknesses and inappropriate institutional design (Engela and Ajam, 2010:13). The increasing media reports of service delivery unrests, qualified reports from the Auditor-General and corruption in the public sector indicates that governance and government legitimacy are at low levels which could also be attributed to the absence of effective M&E systems. Monitoring aids consider the assessment of performance against set targets while evaluation focusses on the merit or worth of the intervention. The Government Wide Monitoring and Evaluation System(GWMES) which was implemented to
improve outputs, outcomes and impacts across the three spheres of government
has not been fully implemented resulting in fragmented M&E activities and low
levels of service delivery performance management.

CONCEPTUALISING GOVERNANCE

According to Bridgman (2007:14) good governance is the qualitative state of
efficiency in decision making. However, Frederickson (2005:293) citing Krasner
governance as a set of principles, norms, roles and decision making procedures
around which stakeholders interact in a given public policy arena. In terms of the
public sector, Bovaird and Löffler (2002:316) define public governance as “the ways
in which stakeholders interact with each other in order to influence the outcomes
of public policies” while the Institute for Democracy in Africa (IDASA) (2008:1)
defines governance as the development and stewardship of the rules that regulate
the public realm by the state, economic and societal actors interacting to make
decisions. Schacter (2000:1) using the Institute of Governance’s definition refers
to governance as the art of steering societies and institutions through interactions
among structures, processes and traditions that determine how power is exercised,
how decisions are taken and how citizens and other stakeholders have their say.
Cloete (2005:1) asserts that good governance is the production of the democratic
government to implement relevant developmental policy goals for local sustainable
development through the effective and efficient utilisation of the human, capital
and financial resources. In addition, Kuye and Kakumba (2008:632) believe that
good governance enhances accountability, transparency, responsiveness to societal
needs and policy development.

Flowing from the above definitions, the common elements of governance are
decision making, compliance to rules and regulations, stakeholder participation,
participation roles and processes and power. Therefore governance entails the
participatory approach to decision making by people in authority in compliance
with the rules and regulations that require the state institutions and corporations to
be held accountable with regards to their developmental mandates.

CORPORATE GOVERNANCE IN STATE DEPARTMENTS AND
ENTITIES

Fourier (2006:1) asserts the aim of corporate governance as to ensure public
sector institutions undertake their public accountability and conduct activities
according to acceptable ethical standards. Corporate governance promotes
institutions to become (Fourier, 2006:2):

- Effective, efficient and sustainable focusing on the upliftment of the quality
  of life of the people it serves;
- Responsive and accountable;
- Recognise and protect stakeholder rights; and
• Legitimate participation and representation based on democratic ideals.

However, Bekker (2009:7) citing Fourier (2006) suggests that for effective corporate governance, public sector employees should *inter alia* have the necessary knowledge, ability and commitment to undertake their responsibilities, understand their purpose and interests they serve, work towards achieving the objectives and strategies of the department and regularly report the departments activities in terms of effectiveness, efficiency and economy. From an institutional perspective Bridgman (2007:14) argues that conformance, performance and governance can only be achieved when all institutional roles are operating collectively among the three spheres of government and are aligned with M&E systems.

Kusek (2004:2) asserts that building and sustaining such M&E systems is primarily a political process rather than a technical one. In this regard Patton (1986:45) confirms that the two most critical factors that explain evaluation utilisation are the political and the personal factors. The political factor is determined by the power yielding stakeholders and is unique for each policy, programme and project. The personal factor represents *inter alia* leadership, interest, enthusiasm, determination, commitment and caring of individual people. Thus, an M&E intervention is more a political rather than technical initiative and political buy-in is critical for achieving successful outputs, outcomes and impacts to ensure good governance and government legitimacy.

In view of the above, both the political and administrative leaders in the government should ensure the implementation and management of a sustainable M&E system to enhance corporate governance and legitimacy of local government. The Public Service Accountability Monitor recommends partnerships among stakeholders, improved planning and budgeting, better implementation of policies and programmes, and improved oversight roles to improve corporate governance (Luyt, 2008:4). Good corporate governance would enable the organs of state to operate in an effective, efficient and sustainable manner by complying with the regulations, legislation and its own policies and processes thus improving accountability and legitimacy.

**LEGITIMACY**

In many countries, leaders in government experience the dual challenges of increasing demand for more efficient and accountable government while the communities trust in their capacity to deliver services equitably and transparently is decreasing (Carty and Rizvi 2004:1). Goss (2001:22) adds that across the world, respect and trust in government at all levels has reduced over the past few decades. Mangu (2008:1) supports this view by highlighting that the lack of leadership legitimacy has resulted in developing countries not achieving their developmental goals. This could be attributed, *inter alia*, to the perceived discrimination and exclusion by the elite who govern for themselves rather than for the masses, the
pervasive lack of governance, state capacity and accountability. Further, traditional accountable mechanisms did not provide the desired results of good governance and enhanced the mistrust between government and citizens thus affecting the legitimacy of national government in the municipal environment.

According to Welch (2002:443) legitimacy could be viewed as a political relationship between the state and its citizens where control is gained by the state through the provision of services to the citizens. State legitimacy includes a set of rules, an impartial service provider, political office bearers to guide service delivery and the protection of the system. Levi and Sacks (2005:1) comment that a democratic and equitable government achieves legitimacy when the citizens exhibit quasi-voluntary compliance and contingent consent. In this environment, the appeal for legitimacy is borne out of the reduced reliance on coercion and monitoring by government and the acceptance of the governments right to rule. However, the basis for the belief that the government is legitimate must be based on evidence and rationality and is succinctly expressed by Levi and Sacks (2005:22) as follows:

“To achieve legitimacy requires the rule of law and the provision of infrastructure, justice, education and other services that makes populations better off than they would be without government. But the law and services are insufficient without government commitments to procedural fairness and relative transparency. And that in turn rests on the symbiotic relationship with an alert citizenry willing to make demands and hold their public servants accountable. They will do so only if they believe - and for good reason - that they are getting something in return for their compliance and active citizenship”.

Legitimacy therefore requires the acceptance by the people of the political leadership and institutions that are mandated to serve their interests of promoting their socio-economic needs. Mangu (2008:6) citing Holsti (1996:97) refers to vertical and horizontal legitimacy where the former refers to the strength of the relationship between the community and the political institutions while the latter entails the agreement within society on the nature of polity. The consequence of poor legitimacy is frustration, anger and violent protests by communities who are excluded from the available socio-economic opportunities. All this suggests that governance in a developmental state is not only related to the power yielding leaders and institutions seeking conformance to the rules but rather to the participation of the citizens in making decisions that affect their lives. According to Carty and Rizvi (2004:1) the effective participation of the broader community and its institutions in matters that affect their quality of life would improve legitimacy. A culture of trust is also essential for better legitimacy and could be implemented by government’s enforcement of standards, contracts, anti-corruption measures and the rule of law. Therefore, legitimacy is contextualised as the acceptance by majority citizens of government performing its constitutional mandate resulting in their quasi voluntary support for the policies, programmes and projects that
improves their quality of life. The increasing rate of service delivery protests reported in the media indicates that communities are dissatisfied with the performance of the government, hence adversely affecting the legitimacy of government. Therefore a sustainable participatory M&E system could aid in better management of development to ensure that the government delivers on its constitutional mandate while empowering communities to become active citizens. In addition effective M&E systems enhance the subsidiarity principle which states that governance occurs as close as possible to the citizens.

MONITORING AND EVALUATION

Monitoring and evaluation systems provide information that permits public sector institutions to undertake evidence-based policy assessment to improve governance functions and performance of the state institution. Kettner, Moroney and Martin (2008:255) citing Rossi, Lipsey and Freemean (2004) define monitoring as an assessment of the extent to which a programme is implemented as designed and serves the intended group. An operational definition of monitoring is provided by Public Service Commission (2008:3) as a “continuing function that uses systematic collection of data on specified indicators to provide managers and the main stakeholders of an on-going development intervention with indications of the extent of progress and achievement of objectives and progress in the use of allocated funds.” This means that monitoring enhances better decision making, accountability and value when complemented by evaluation processes.

According to Dahler-Larson (2005:620) evaluation is a symbolically legitimate procedure in an era characterised by reflexivity, doubt and lack of belief in general progress and also cautions that if it is considered merely as an institutional ritual focusing on dominant cultural values rather than better outcomes and impacts which could create more uncertainty. Segone (2001:4) broadens the influence of evaluation on governance to include democratisation, de-bureaucratisation and organisational learning. In this regard democratisation is viewed as effective citizen engagement, de-bureaucratisation promotes public accountability, responsiveness and transparency and organisational learning is facilitated by using evaluation information to make better decisions.

According to the Public Service Commission (2008:3) evaluation is “the systematic and objective assessment of an on-going or completed project, programme or policy, its design, implementation and results. The aim is to determine the relevance, and fulfilment of objectives, development efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. An evaluation should provide information that is credible and useful, enabling the incorporation of lessons learned into the decision making process of both recipients and donors.” For example, the service delivery performance information could be used to decide future budget allocations due to the availability of accurate, appropriate and timely information provided by institutionalised M&E system.
Mark, Gary and Julnes (2000:3) suggest that the goal of evaluation is social betterment and evaluation can contribute by assisting democratic institutions to better select; oversee; improve; and understand the context of social programmes and policies. Mark et al. (2000:19) add that:

“Evaluation should be motivated by the goal of providing information that women and men as administrators, as legislators and as citizens in a democracy can use to better make sense of the objectives, operations and effects of social policies and programmes”.

Conceptually, evaluation is also the systematic or critical assessment of the merit, worth or value of administration, output and outcome of government interventions which is intended to add value to the relevant beneficiaries (Public Service Commission, 2008:6). It incorporates a knowledge dimension, a value dimension, a utilisation dimension and an evaluation dimension. It is critical to ensure all actors agree to these four dimensions prior to the institutionalisation of the evaluation so that consensus could be reached with regard to the purpose of the evaluation.

Institutionalisation of a sustainable M&E system requires that it is an integral part of the institutional management activity as well as a specialist support function with its oversight function being hierarchical in nature. Monitoring and evaluation can only grow in demand if a culture of performance and accountability exists within the public sector. Currently, the public sector does not have a management ethos towards performance and a culture of accountability for results (Presidency, 2008:20). This is evidenced for example by the failure of the education system to prepare school leavers with adequate numeracy, literacy and work-related skills despite the annual increase in the education budget (Luyt, 2008:2). In light of the above, a well-planned, implemented and managed M&E system could enhance the institutional change process towards becoming more performance oriented through the focus on outputs, outcomes and impacts, thus improving governance and achieving government legitimacy.

**GOVERNMENT WIDE MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEMS (GWMES)**

The National Government implemented the GWMES (Presidency, 2007:1) due to the absence of a coherent long-term development plan and a lack of progress in achieving its developmental goals. One of the aims of the GWMES is to encourage the development of a culture of learning within public institutions which requires a culture change to adapt to these new demands. This becomes difficult if managers are not held accountable for service delivery and other conduct. The twelve outcomes of the National Development Plan also depend on an effective and efficient GWMES. However, the GWMES has also been criticised for delays in its implementation. According to Cloete (2009:299) the structures and operations of
the GWMES are explained in a series of separate disparate documents compiled by
the different stakeholders that does not reflect an integrated hierarchical structure,
lines of authority and interlinking processes. The GWMES is also criticised for the
lack of clarity on what is M&E. Engela and Ajam (2010:20) add that there is a lack
of co-ordination and collaboration in the implementation, design and information
sharing among the main stakeholders and the government institutions. Cloete
(2005:7) recommends that good governance performance management system be
developed as an integral part of the M&E system. This means that government has
to critically reflect if they are on the right track by questioning the fundamental
assumptions on which a policy, programme or project is based (Engela and Ajam,
2010:26) and its integration in the GWMES.

DEVELOPING AN EFFECTIVE MONITORING AND
EVALUATION SYSTEM

Simister (2009:12) provides the following suggestions to ensure the M&E system
is successful, namely, senior management commitment, political will, the system
should be sustainable and not create unrealistic expectations. The approach that
“one size fits all” would not produce the maximum institutional value from the
M&E system.

Institutionalisation of a systemic M&E system also requires all stakeholders
to undergo a paradigm shift from utilising a single hierarchical causal effect to
a multiple causal effect of outcomes and impacts. This can only be achieved if
a systems approach is used to develop systems thinking. Once an M&E system
has been institutionalised the quality of the M&E system itself is critical to ensure
sustainable demand and good governance. While there are no industry standards
for assessing the quality of an M&E system, Chaplowe (2008:4) citing (IFAD: 2002)
proposes the following key criteria to be used to check the quality of the M&E
system:

- **Utility** - The proposed M&E system must serve the information needs of the
  intended beneficiaries.
- **Feasibility** - The proposed M&E framework is realistic and cost-effective.
- **Propriety** - The M&E activities will be conducted legally, ethically and with
due regard for the welfare of those affected by its results.
- **Accuracy** - The M&E reports and outputs will highlight and convey technically
  accurate information.

An effective M&E system is also dependent, *inter alia*, on the accountability
mechanisms in public sector entities. If there is a lack of accountability within the
institutional or corporate environment, the M&E system would fail. Bevir (2009:330)
considers accountability as censuring or rewarding of agents by the principals.
Therefore the agents who pursue the will and/or interest of others give an account
of their actions for which they are subsequently rewarded or censured. According to Goss (2001:162) some public sector employees’ political accountability is prioritised rather than administrative and service delivery accountability to the communities and customers. Therefore, members of the public who are not affiliated to the same political structure as the employee would be disadvantaged in terms of service delivery and customer service. Goss (2011:24) further explains that performance accountability enhances legitimacy through the achievement of outputs but neglects the procedural accountability and argues that there is work to be done to create modern systems of accountability to match the reality of governance. In this regard, an understanding of performance management, M&E and its influence on governance and legitimacy is critical for improving service delivery.

**RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT, MONITORING AND EVALUATION AND GOVERNANCE AND LEGITIMACY**

M&E systems are intended to ensure that functionaries are accountable to deliver the desired outcomes and provide an evidence to inform corrective action. Therefore, the outcomes of performance management, corporate governance (and legitimacy) and M&E are interrelated (see Table 1 below). Governance is a prerequisite for performance and a well governed institution has a better likelihood of good performance (Bridgman, 2007:50).

**Table 1: Outcomes of Performance Management, M&E and Governance and Legitimacy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Management</th>
<th>Monitoring &amp; Evaluation</th>
<th>Governance and Legitimacy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Continuous improvement of performance</td>
<td>Evidence-based decision making, outcomes and impact analysis.</td>
<td>Excellence in decision making and support for government decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a learning culture</td>
<td>Evaluation enables organisational learning</td>
<td>Maintain or improve effectiveness and efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanction good and poor performances.</td>
<td>Accountability - results or outcome based M&amp;E systems allocate accountability.</td>
<td>Accountability to provide quality services to the citizens. Conformance to rules and regulations. Rewards and sanctions should be relevant and appropriately meted out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrate milestones and successful completion of projects, programmes and policies.</td>
<td>Soliciting support - promoting inclusiveness and generating successes.</td>
<td>Participation of the communities in matters that affect them and report on successes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information management - distribute information to advocate institutional vision and mission.</td>
<td>Promoting transparency - sharing of information as the project or programme progresses.</td>
<td>Promote transparency - access to and the reporting of information timeously, accurately and in an acceptable format.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity development and empowerment of stakeholders.</td>
<td>M&amp;E capacity development programmes and projects</td>
<td>Capacity development of all stakeholders to conform and perform in a collaborative manner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of subordinates and resources.</td>
<td>Monitoring - control and supervision of processes, staff and resources</td>
<td>Internal and external audits undertaken to identify risk management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finances - proper allocation of resources through budgets.</td>
<td>Allocations made on historic performances reported via M&amp;E systems.</td>
<td>Allocations must be responsive to stakeholder needs and political mandates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How well is the institution currently performing?</td>
<td>Baseline data collected to set targets. Performance is analysed against the agreed targets.</td>
<td>Current performance and conformance reports from both internal and external stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** (Adapted from Bridgman, 2007:50).

Monitoring and Evaluation aids in better performance, of which in turn, enhances corporate governance and legitimacy by improving the quality of decision making, developing a learning culture, ensuring employees are held to account with appropriate rewards and sanctions, capacity development and improved resources management. In addition, participatory M&E system improves community inclusiveness, support and transparency. An understanding of the above relationship in Table 1 could assist politicians and administrators to create synergies via a systemic approach to achieving their outputs, outcomes and impacts.

**INFLUENCE OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION ON GOVERNANCE**

According to Mackay (2007:9) M&E systems support sound governance by:

- Supporting evidence based policy decisions in allocating resources to a project or programme;
- Assisting government in policy development and analysis;
- Helping government to manage activities at sector, programme and project levels; and
• Enhancing transparency and support accountability relationships.

As mentioned earlier, South Africa is not producing school-leavers with the required work-related skills despite changing from an outcomes-based education to the continuous assessment policies and the increased annual education budget. To correct the above situation, a systemic M&E system should be developed and implemented to manage education landscape in South Africa. Firstly, the current continuous assessment policy should be evaluated with collecting baseline data and developing appropriate indicators and achievable targets. The evidence obtained should then assist government to review its basic education policy. Secondly, the M&E system should incorporate programme and project management information systems that highlight the milestones and financials related to the programme or project. Finally, the system should allow all stakeholders to access the reports from the M&E system and provide feedback. The reports would enhance transparency and accountability of public sector employees.

In a similar vein the National Treasury (2007:3) also adds that the M&E should improve governance in the following manner:

• Transparency - All findings are publicly available unless there are compelling reasons otherwise;
• Accountability - Use of resources are open to public scrutiny;
• Participation - Voice is provided to historically marginalised communities; and
• Inclusion - Traditionally excluded interests are represented throughout the M&E process.

Due to South Africa’s history of apartheid and the high levels of inequalities among the rich and the poor, marginalised communities should be engaged in the development of their communities to ensure their interests are addressed. Since M&E supports better participation, inclusive decision making, better accountability and better service delivery (see Table 1 above), it could be deduced that M&E enhances good governance. In the final analysis, it should be argued that M&E enhances governance by increasing stakeholder participation, accountability and transparency, evidence based decision making and efficient and effective resource allocation for service delivery.

**ENHANCING GOVERNANCE AND GOVERNMENT LEGITIMACY**

The full value of the M&E would not be realised without the necessary accountability mechanisms being effective. Therefore the state has to undertake accountability reforms to create a platform for an effective and sustainable M&E system among the three spheres of government. The current M&E policies need to be reviewed in light of the outputs, outcomes and impacts achieved by programmes and projects being implemented. In this regard, a cost benefit analysis should be

The standard of M&E education, its relevance and impacts should be evaluated. A national audit should be undertaken to establish the extent of the available M&E capacity in the public and private sector. A quality audit of the existing M&E system itself should be undertaken to identify the enablers and/or constraints to enhancing better corporate governance.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Good governance attained through effective and efficient M&E systems lead to better government legitimacy. However, the current GWMES has not been fully implemented and cascaded to the Provincial and Local Government spheres has led to M&E initiatives not being fully aligned to the national policies. Absence of effective performance management systems and accountability mechanisms has led to community dissatisfaction with service delivery thus adversely affecting governance and government legitimacy. Urgent M&E capacity development interventions need to be implemented to create an awareness of the benefits, principles, terminology, tools and techniques.

The greatest challenge for government is to undertake accountability reforms that respond to new social demands, improve effectiveness in service delivery and manage the state funds in an accountable and transparent manner with the aid of a participative M&E system. South Africa, with high levels of inequality has a choice either to persistently focus their energies necessary to deal with their main problems or allow the public sector to degenerate to eternal ineffectiveness. An effective and efficient M&E system influenced by principled leadership and accountability reforms could enhance governance and government legitimacy.

**REFERENCES**


CAPACITY BUILDING FOR EFFECTIVE LOCAL GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE

Z. Gqamane
J.D. Taylor
Department of Political and Governmental Studies
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

ABSTRACT

This article reviews the empowerment needs of councillors at a selected local municipality in the Province of the Eastern Cape. The article further assesses capacity-building programmes previously offered by the selected municipality in an effort to empower its councillors in terms of the “new” developmental mandate, rules of procedure and the need for effective public consultation strategies. A recent empirical survey carried out at the selected municipality revealed that certain councillors require additional capacity-building programmes in areas such as local government law, council’s rules of procedure and the new developmental mandate assigned to local government. The empirical survey further revealed that the professional relationship between certain councillors and the bureaucracy is somewhat strained and remedial intervention is required to restore mutual trust. The article proposes that local municipalities should provide regular “in house” training to their councillors and officials and that additional training by outside agencies should also be implemented. In this regard universities have a particular important role to play.

INTRODUCTION

The transformation of local government in South Africa has a number of important implications. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, articulates that municipalities constitute the third sphere of government with additional responsibilities and duties. Local government councillors are now required to perform a number of important functions, which are reviewed in this article. In terms of new “developmental” local government legislation, inter alia, the White Paper on Local Government, 1998, the Local Government: Municipal Structures Act 117 of 1998, the Local Government: Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 and the Local Government: Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003, the duties, functions and responsibilities of municipalities and councillors are taken further. It is proposed that in order for local government councillors to perform their duties effectively, many require specific additional capacity-building skills.

LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE

Strodi (1993:2) articulates that leadership within the context of local government,
refers to the influence an individual has on the voluntary behaviour of others to work together and to encourage cooperative efforts. In an article authored by Nimrod Mbele in Management Today (undated) it is stated that many South African municipalities lack adequate capacity to plan strategically, to translate strategic plans into budgets, to engage civil society effectively in the strategic planning process and to manage the implementation of strategic plans. In this regard many councillors require capacity-building initiatives to further strengthen their leadership roles and so improve their governance functions. In terms of section 154(1) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, national and provincial government is obliged to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities. This implies that they should have the requisite capacity-building, monitoring and evaluation capability to do so. In terms of governance, Du Toit, van Niekerk, van der Waldt and Doyle (2002:64) state that this implies actions taken to improve the general welfare of society by means of the services rendered. In terms of the Local Government Turnaround Strategy, 2009, councillors are required to build clean, responsive and accountable local government. There is a need to ensure that systems and structures and procedures are developed and enforced to deal with corruption, maladministration and that municipalities communicate with and account more to communities to enhance basic service delivery (http://www.info.gov.za). Therefore, leadership and governance are of particular importance in this context.

THE ROLE OF MUNICIPAL COUNCILLORS IN DRIVING SERVICE DELIVERY

In terms of the Local Government Turnaround Strategy (LGTAS) approved by the South African Cabinet on 2 December 2009, municipalities are required to formulate and implement their own turnaround strategies to, inter alia, improve basic delivery and also the capacity of their administrations and political functionaries. The LGTAS aims to further restore the confidence of the majority of people in their municipalities as the primary delivery machine; and to re-build and improve the basic requirements for a functional, responsive, accountable, effective, and efficient developmental local government (http://www.dplg.gov.za).

The Local Government Turnaround Strategy provides an opportunity for all municipalities in the country to reflect on their own performance and concentrate on removing constraints. In this regard the LGTAS strives to set the standards by which municipalities will be held to account (to their communities) for their performance and actions in this regard five strategic objectives have been articulated in the LGTAS, namely:

- Ensure that municipalities meet the basic needs of communities;
- Build clean, effective, responsive and accountable local government;
- Improve functionality, performance and professionalism in municipalities;
- Improve national policy, oversight and support to local government.; and
- Strengthen partnerships between local government, communities and civil society (http://www.polity.org.za).
Despite the fact that the new local government system is already in its second decade, there are still signs and trends to indicate that the majority of municipalities are failing in delivering on their mandate. The introduction of the LGTAS is therefore, an important development in terms of addressing the numerous challenges that currently face municipalities in South Africa.

Under the former apartheid government there was systematic under-investment in municipal infrastructure in historically disadvantaged areas. This deprived millions of people of access to basic services, including: water, sanitation, refuse collection and roads. In terms of the “developmental local government mandate”, specific obligations have been imposed on municipalities to address backlogs (Gqamane, 2012:30). Municipalities are now required to develop service delivery strategies to meet the basic needs of communities. Basic services enhance the quality of life of citizens. Such an enhancement also increases citizens’ social and economic opportunities by promoting health and safety as well as facilitating access to work, education and recreation. It should also stimulate new productive activities (The White Paper on Local Government, 1998).

Draai (2010:133) suggests that by the mid-1990’s, the South African public service was influenced by international public-sector reform strategies emanating from the New Public Management (NPM) theory and practices. The adoption of the eight Batho Pele (People First) Principles that focus on quality client service provision is indicative of NPM reform strategies, because it specifies that the provision of public services become client-centred and thus performance-related (Draai, 2010:134).

Given the above understanding of local government in the current political dispensation informed by the former apartheid legacy, municipalities should ensure that adequate services do reach local communities. Taken further, the Local Government Turnaround Strategy approved in December 2009 places additional responsibilities on both the officials and elected representatives at the third sphere of government. Councillors have an important role to play in meeting their leadership and governance responsibilities. In this regard the delivery of basic services becomes of importance especially in light of the recent violent protest action by communities in many parts of the country.

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICE DELIVERY PRINCIPLES**

The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, outlines a number of principles which should guide municipalities and councillors in selecting the best delivery options for their areas, and include the following:

*Accessibility of services*

Councillors, through their governing function, should strive to ensure that all citizens have access to at least the minimum level of basic services. Where imbalances in access to services are identified they should be addressed thoroughly.
This may be through the development of new infrastructure or rehabilitation and upgrading of existing infrastructure or a combination of both. However, the resolutions adopted by councillors to enhance basic service delivery are often subject to financial constraints in terms of the capital budget of municipalities. The consolidated Municipal Infrastructure Programme (MIP) has been established to provide capital grants to assist municipalities in funding bulk and connector infrastructure for low-income households. This programme extends access to services to previously disadvantaged communities (Gqamane, 2011:32). The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, further urges municipalities to ensure that people with disabilities are able to access municipal services.

**Affordability of services**

The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, articulates that accessibility of services is closely linked to affordability. Councillors need specific financial management skills to better equip them in understanding complex financial reports usually prepared by relevant officials. The White Paper proposes that even when service infrastructure is in place, services may remain beyond the reach of many unless such services are financially affordable. Gqamane (2012:32) suggests that municipalities can ensure affordability through:

- Setting tariffs which balance the economic viability of continued service provision and the ability of the poor to access such services; and
- Determining appropriate service levels. Service levels which are too high may be economically unsustainable and jeopardise continued service provision.

It should be noted, however, that the White Paper on Local Government, 1998, does take into cognisance the fact that inadequate service levels may perpetuate stark spatial divisions between low, middle or high income users. This is especially true in urban areas, which could imply that the socio-economic objectives of a municipal council are bound to be jeopardised. To minimise the chances of occurrence of such a situation, municipalities could consider cross-subsidisation (between high and low-income users and commercial and residential users) within and between services. Again it is proposed that councillors need specific skills in local government financial management in order to execute their duties and responsibilities efficiently and effectively, as proposed in the 1996 Constitution.

Netswera and Phago (2009:135) state that ability to pay for basic municipal services is measured through the use of three variables, namely: (i) employment data, (ii) household income and expenditure, and (iii) living standard measurement data that assesses household material possessions. Furthermore, affordability is measured because measuring household wealth is a cumbersome process that cannot be fully explained through the use of a single variable.

**Quality of products and services**

The quality of services provided by municipalities may be difficult to define. Nevertheless, the White Paper on Local Government, 1998, proposes certain
criteria to be considered by local government councillors when adopting formal resolutions pertaining to the quality of services. The criteria include suitability of purpose, timeframes, convenience, safety and continuity, responsiveness to service-users; and a professional and respectful relationship between service-providers and service-users.

According to Maimela (2009:475) in order to provide high quality products and services, management must have an obsession with quality and perfection that pervades all faces of the public institution. The driving force behind quality management is customer satisfaction. Councillors should ideally pay particular attention to this requirement, especially in light of the violent service delivery protest action that has occurred in many parts of the country, including the Eastern Cape.

**Accountability for services**

While there may be several service delivery mechanisms or options available to municipalities, accountability for such services delivered or not remains the ultimate responsibility of the municipal council. Gqamane (2012:33) proposes that the accountability expected should, *inter alia*, relate to quality of services provided or planned as well as affordability and accessibility of the target recipients of the service.

Kakumba and Fourie (2007:652) state that accountability can be understood as the answerability for performance and the obligation that public functionaries are required to provide satisfactory explanations to the public over the exercise of power, authority and resources entrusted to them for service delivery.

**Integrated development and services**

In terms of this principle, municipalities should adopt an integrated approach to planning and ensure the provision of adequate municipal services. This implies taking into account the economic and social impact of service provision in relation to municipal policy objectives such as poverty eradication, spatial integration and job creation through public works programmes. According to Malefane and Mashakoe (2008:475), all planning for key social, economical and environmental sectors are incorporated in the Integrated Development Plan of a municipality.

**Sustainability of services**

On-going service provision depends on, *inter alia*, financial and institutional systems which support sustainability. Sustainability includes both financial and environmental viability with sound and socially just use of resources. In their compilation and execution of their developmental plans, municipalities must ensure that the services planned are sustainable, economically viable and do not disrupt environmental and social systems in place. According to Netswera and Phago (2009:136), municipalities are required by law to establish a tariff or levy system on services for sustainability purposes. Furthermore, sustainability has major implications for service-charge collection and the enforcement of payment.
Value-for-money

Value in the public sector is both a matter of the cost of inputs, and of the quality and value of the outputs. The above principles require that the best possible use is made of public resources to ensure universal access to affordable and sustainable basic services (Gqamane, 2012:33).

Ensuring and promoting competitiveness of local commerce and industry.

This principle requires that municipalities should ensure that the job-generating and competitive nature of commerce and industry are not adversely affected by higher rates and service charges on industry and commerce. Municipal councils may not delegate the responsibility for amendments to rates tariffs or service charges, which occur on 1 July each year at the commencement of the new municipal financial year. This consideration should not be compromised where there is a need to subsidise certain groups of domestic users. The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, prescribes that transparency is required to ensure that investors are aware of the full costs of doing business in a local area that falls within the geographical area of a municipality. In this regard, councillors need to be aware of the impact of their decisions (in terms of formal resolutions) on local communities, commerce and industry.

Promoting local democracy

In terms of Section 152(2) of the 1996 Constitution, municipalities must strive, within their financial and administrative capacity, to achieve the objects set out in Section 152 (1), which emphasises, inter alia, the need to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in local government matters. In this regard, councillors have a legislative obligation to promote community consultation and participation in local government matters. Taken further, the democratic values and principles as enshrined in Section 195 (1) of the 1996 Constitution should be promoted by all municipalities. This is one of the many functions expected of municipalities and councillors as portrayed in the White Paper on Local Government, 1998. An important aspect regarding service delivery is what clients expect from public institutions, public officials and their councillors. The primary function of a municipality is to serve its community by providing water, electricity, sanitary services and other related services (Du Toit, Knipe, Van Niekerk, Van der Waldt and Doyle, 2002:101). Furthermore, it is accepted that the activities undertaken by public institutions to deliver services are conducted in accordance with generally accepted normative principles. The Batho Pele Principles provide a fresh perspective to the meaning of normative principles. These principles emphasise the legitimate right of the public to expect quality services from public officials (Du Toit et al, 2002:101). Councillors have an equally important role to play in this regard in terms of their leadership and governance functions.
THE WHITE PAPER ON TRANSFORMING PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY (1997)

The above-mentioned White Paper introduced eight principles which are known as the Batho Pele (People First) Principles. They are the following and have an impact on what is expected of public officials and local government councillors:

Consultation must take place between the public sector and the citizens about the level and quality of the services to be rendered. Consultation also implies that the citizens must have a say regarding the services delivered. Mfene (2009:216) states that wherever possible, citizens should be provided with a choice of the services that are offered.

In terms of service standards, citizens should be informed about the level and quality of the services they will receive in order to be abreast of what to expect. This implies that public officials are obliged to deliver what is expected failing which the citizens have a right to complain (Gqamane, 2012:36).

Access implies that citizens also have a legitimate right to equal access to services, and public officials should not withhold that right. Mfene (2009:216) states that all citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled.

The principle of courtesy requires public officials to treat all community members with courtesy and consideration, irrespective of the social status of such persons.

Access to information means that community members have the right to accurate information regarding the public services they are legitimately entitled to. Public officials must therefore provide them with full and accurate information. An important implication of this principle is that, should the standard of service drop for whatever reason, citizens must be informed why this happened. They should also be informed of when the situation will be remedied. According to Van der Waldt (2007:627), government departments in South Africa need to develop service delivery improvement programmes. Such programmes should set out, *inter alia*, how the departments’ communication systems will improve information about the type and frequency of services that customers require and also how complaints systems will be developed. It is proposed that this requirement be equally applied to departments within municipalities.

Openness and transparency requires public officials to inform citizens about, *inter alia*, the administration and management of public sector departments, what it costs to run them, and who is responsible for running them. Additional prescriptions pertaining to openness and transparency are contained in the 1996 Constitution.

Redress implies that historically disadvantaged communities receive adequate budget allocations in terms of basic service provision.

Value for money implies that community members have the right to expect services that are efficient and provided economically.
It is proposed that in order for municipalities to further achieve the aims and objectives of the Batho Pele Principles, both local government officials and councillors need to become more “sensitised’ in terms of exactly what is expected from the bureaucracy and council members. This is important when one considers that community members have an important role to play in local government matters as prescribed in terms of a variety of applicable legislation including, *inter alia*, the Local Government: Municipal Structures Act 117 of 1998.

**APPROACHES TO SERVICE DELIVERY AND THE ROLE OF COUNCILLORS**

Councillors have specific governance and leadership roles to play, as required by law, to promote service delivery to their communities. In this regard they should be encouraged and capacitated to consider alternative approaches to service delivery and not only adhere to the more traditional methods. Gqamane (2012:38-42) proposes that the White Paper on Local Government, 1998, provides an overview on delivery mechanisms that municipalities and councillors can consider in an attempt to enhance the delivery of services at the local sphere of government.

**SERVICE DELIVERY CHALLENGES IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT**

The Institute for Democracy in South Africa (IDASA) argues that South Africa has taken a significant and positive stride towards the promise of developmental local government. However, most municipalities are still plagued by significant challenges in terms of service delivery and performance by municipal role-players (IDASA, 2010). McLennan (2007:6) suggests that when delivery fails, as it often does in developing countries, it is assumed that the strategy for improvement requires the manipulation of the existing processes. McLennan (2007) further proposes that a strategy requires improved organisational structures, more efficient management and better use of technology and technical skills.

The enduring facts of poverty, inequality and underdevelopment underscore the need for government to address issues of social and economic development. The imperative for development in local government are articulated in the legislative framework governing local government (IDASA, 2010). Davids, Theron and Maphunuye (2005:137) mention that service delivery in the national, provincial and local sphere is not always appropriate and does not always reach the intended beneficiaries effectively. This is attributed to a number of factors, namely, a lack of skills at the local sphere of government; weak interpretation and co-ordination by the national, provincial and local spheres; an inadequate dissemination of information by all spheres; human resources and management problems; and a lack of an organised voice for the poor between elections.

The Bill of Rights as enshrined in the 1996 Constitution, provides communities with fundamental rights to access social services. In the same token the Millenium
Developmental Goals (MDGs) are emphatic that local government should work towards the realisation of basic socio-economic rights that contribute to human development. The argument advanced is that the contemporary focus on attainment of the MDG’s constitutes a major shift in development thinking because it places improvement of the human condition at the centre of world progress (IDASA, 2010). Local government has an obligation to work towards the realisation of the above-mentioned goals and councillors have an important role to play by adopting relevant resolutions.

**WARD COMMITTEES AND SERVICE DELIVERY**

Shaidi (2006) asserts that in many instances local communities perceive ward committees to be structures owned by ward councillors and not by respective communities. In terms of the new system of developmental local government the legal definition of a municipality is that it comprises not only of the councillors and the bureaucracy, but also of the local community. It can be argued that a defining feature of the new mandate is the opportunity it affords ordinary citizens to become actively involved in the local government matters for their area (Shaidi, 2006).

A further challenge facing many municipalities is that ward committees are not fully operational, resulting in poor service delivery and a lack of communication with communities. Ward committees have been the focus of considerable attention by government as well as civil society, with substantial investment already made in an attempt to ensure that these structures have the necessary capacity and resources required for them to fulfill their envisaged roles as the voices of communities (Gqamane, 2012:45). At the same time, questions that are often asked include the following: how effective are these institutions?; whether they are useful conduits for community involvement in local governance?; whether, as created space for public participation, they are inherently capable of playing the critical role expected of them?; and whether they create opportunities for real power-sharing between municipalities and the citizens? (IDASA, 2010).

The mention of ward committees typically solicits some negative views. Communities appear to be critical of ward committees, arguing that they are not functioning as intended. Moreover, ward committees are usually viewed as highly partisan structures aligned to party political agendas (IDASA, 2010). Ideally ward committee structures should serve as the “link” between communities and their ward councillors. They should also play a positive role in terms of promoting service delivery by working closely with their respective ward councillors. However, it appears that ward committees face many challenges throughout the country in terms of playing a more meaningful role in local government matters. According to Shaidi (2006) a low percentage of the national population participates in public consultation processes including the Integrated Development Plan (IDP). In terms of the Municipal Finance Management Act 56 of 2003, municipalities are required to take reasonable steps to ensure that the resources of the municipality are used effectively, efficiently and economically.
Sound financial management is the key to local service delivery and ideally councillors should be equipped with the relevant financial skills. It is of concern to note that certain municipalities are associated with under-performing in their financial management controls. Financial mismanagement and non-compliance with financial legislation are common in many municipalities. Consequently, this results in poor performance and the delivery of social service is compromised (IDASA, 2010). Another factor that undermines the performance of municipalities is the availability and shortage of required skills. This applies to both the appointed officials as well as the elected councillors. The State of Local Government in South Africa Report, 2009, points out that skills deficit within municipalities remains a major challenge. A significant number of municipalities do not have the managerial, administrative, financial and institutional capacity to meet the rising needs of local people. This situation is exacerbated by the decline of municipal professional and poor linkages between local government and tertiary education sector. As a result these municipalities cannot meet their required performance standards hence impacting adversely on the delivery of services (IDASA, 2010).

In the section that follows an overview is provided on, *inter alia*, the methodology and sample population selected for purposes of a recent empirical survey conducted at a local municipality in the Province of the Eastern Cape to specifically assess the needs of councillors.

**RESEARCH DESIGN**

David and Sutton (2004:159) state that an advantage of using survey design is that there are no interviewer effects, the responses by the interviewee can be affected by the presence of the interviewer. Rossi (1983:2) proposes that surveys are conducted for the purpose of collecting data from individuals about themselves, about their households or about other larger social units. Sapsford (1999:2) suggests that a survey describes a population, it counts and describes ‘what is out there’. Furthermore, a survey is a detailed and quantified description, a precise map or a precise measurement of potential, or both.

A recent empirical survey of a quantitative nature was carried out at a selected municipality in the Province of the Eastern Cape to establish, *inter alia*, the capacity-development needs of councillors. It should be noted that the findings pertain to the selected municipality and should not be interpreted to apply to all municipalities. The questionnaire consisted of thirty-five questions, ten of which were questions requiring biographical data and twenty-five questions were legend designed ranking from 1 to 5 using the Likert Rating Scale. For purposes of this article the authors have focused on specific questions only.

The sample comprises of both ward and the proportional representative councillors from the selected municipality. The total number of participants was 57. The interpretation and analysis of data was performed under the guidance of a qualified statistician.
DATA PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

This section considers the following issues, response rate and opinion responses as discussed below:

**Response rate**

Out of 57 questionnaires distributed, 43 completed questionnaires were returned. A participation rate of 75 per cent was achieved, which is regarded as most satisfactory for a survey. Babbie & Mouton (2001:261) state that some rules of thumb concerning return/response rates is that a response rate of 50 per cent is adequate for analysis and reporting, 60 per cent is good and 70 per cent is very good.

**Opinion responses**

The following statements formed part of the quantitative survey. Responses of ‘strongly agree’ and ‘agree’ have been combined and the same rule has been applied to responses for ‘strongly disagree’ and ‘disagree’. Selected statements from the survey follow below:

**Statement 1: Councillors understand the English language used during council meetings**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>34.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>58.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>69.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

35 per cent of the participants disagreed with the statement, 23 per cent remained neutral while 42 per cent agreed with the statement. It appears that a high percentage of councillors often do not make a meaningful contribution in council meetings as required in terms of legislative prescriptions. It is proposed that a possible reason for this could be that council meetings are conducted in English which appears to present challenges for certain councillors. The above result appears to support this assumption.

**Statement 2: Councillors are aware of the additional developmental responsibilities imposed on local government in terms of the new mandate**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>65.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the above analysis it can be construed that the vast majority of respondents being 74 per cent are aware of the additional developmental responsibilities imposed on local government in terms of the new mandate while 5 per cent disagreed with the statement and 21 per cent returned a neutral response.

**Statement 3: The relationship between councillors and senior officials is based on mutual trust**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>51.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>76.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As reflected in the above table the majority of respondents being 51 per cent disagreed with the statement while 23 per cent agreed and 26 per cent remained neutral. It is interesting to note from the survey results that there appears to be limited mutual trust between councillors and senior officials from the selected municipality.

**Statement 4: Most councillors are often not familiar with council’s rules of procedure**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>34.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of respondents, 44 per cent agreed with the statement while 35 per cent disagreed and 21 per cent returned a neutral response. In terms of a variety of legislative prescriptions councillors are required to be conversant with Council’s Rules of Procedure.
Statement 5: Councillors are provided with sufficient information by the officials in their reports to council and its committees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>67.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen above, 49 per cent of the respondents indicated that they are not provided with sufficient information by the officials in their reports to council. On the other hand 33 per cent agreed with the statement and 19 per cent were neutral on the question. The response results can be interpreted to imply that there is a significant lack of information provided to councillors.

Statement 6: Party politics in local government should be kept to a minimum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>55.8</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>76.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>23.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>97.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing System</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above analysis 79 per cent of the respondents agreed that party politics should be kept to a minimum in the political environment. Only 9 per cent of the respondents disagreed with the statement, 9 per cent were undecided and 2 per cent did not respond.

Statement 7: Councillors have been capacitated in order to better understand municipal processes and their roles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>27.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>76.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above results the majority of respondents 72 per cent agreed with
the statement. 21 per cent of the respondents were neutral while 7 per cent of the respondents disagreed with the statement, implying that certain training interventions have been provided by the municipality to its councillors.

**Statement 8: Councillor training should be conducted by outside agencies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>27.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of respondents being 88 per cent agreed that training for councillors should be conducted by outside agencies. Only 7 per cent disagreed with the statement and 5 per cent remained neutral on the question.

**Statement 9: The new developmental environment in which councillors must function necessitates that “on-going” training should be compulsory for all councillors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>32.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most of the respondents, 96 per cent, agreed that the new developmental environment in which councillors must function necessitates that “on-going” training should be compulsory for all councillors. Only 2 per cent disagreed with the statement while 2 per cent were neutral on the question.

**Statement 10: The content of current capacity building programmes is relevant for the needs of councillors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>26.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>59.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>40.5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>97.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above analysis 72 per cent of the respondents agreed with the
statement. 9 per cent disagreed and 16 per cent indicated a neutral response. 2 per cent of the respondents did not respond. From the above responses it appears that the current content of training programmes is relevant.

**Statement 11: Training programmes for councillors should focus on local government law.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>24.3</td>
<td>27.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>62.8</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>86.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing System</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An analysis of the above responses indicated that 84 per cent of the respondents agreed that training programmes of councillors should also focus on local government law. 2 per cent disagreed with the statement while 14 per cent did not respond to the question. This result clearly indicates the need for local government law modules.

**Statement 12: Training programmes for councillors should focus on local government financial procedures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>62.8</td>
<td>75.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>83.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing System</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above analysis 81 per cent of the respondents agreed that councillor training programmes should also focus on local government financial procedures. Only 2 per cent of the respondents were neutral on the question and 16 per cent of the respondents did not respond. This result clearly conveys the need for further capacity development programmes on local government financial matters.
Statement 13: Training programmes for councillors should focus on conflict resolution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>28.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>62.8</td>
<td>71.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above table it can be seen that 86 per cent of the respondents agreed that training programmes for councillors should also focus on conflict resolution, while 2 per cent of the respondents disagreed with the statement and 12 per cent did not respond. The response results indicate a need for conflict management and resolution capacity building training initiatives for councillors.

Statement 14: Training programmes for local government councillors should focus on the Code of Conduct for Councillors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>65.1</td>
<td>77.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>83.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of respondents being 81 per cent agreed that training programmes for councillors should also include reference to the code of conduct for councillors. Only 2 per cent of the respondents were neutral on the matter and 16 per cent did not respond.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are based on the above capacity-building needs of councillors, which emerged from the empirical survey:

Recommendation One: The majority of participants responded that they find it difficult to raise their community needs at council meetings because of the language used (English) during council meetings. It is recommended that municipal councils should give particular attention to this challenge, especially in light of South Africa’s language rights dispensation.

Recommendation Two: All councillors from the selected municipality should be encouraged to raise and discuss community-related issues during council meetings. In an effort to encourage councillors to be more participative, it is
further recommended that capacity-building programmes should be undertaken on meeting procedures, protocols and public speaking.

**Recommendation Three:** Councillors should be acutely aware that the need for public consultation and participation is entrenched in the 1996 Constitution. Communities should be consulted on all important matters affecting their areas and failure to do so could result in violent service delivery protest action. Imbizo programmes are aimed at strengthening democracy through the involvement of communities in service delivery. This programme is designed to bring government closer to the people, with the aim of mobilising them through their involvement to help tackle service delivery issues. The government believes that an imbizo is an appropriate forum for engaging with the people and allowing them to raise their concerns with regard to service rendering, while the government listens with the idea of addressing those concerns.

**Recommendation Four:** The majority of respondents appear to understand the implications of the new developmental local government mandate. However, certain councillors felt that not all councillors understand the full implications of the new developmental local government mandate. It is recommended that all councillors should be further capacitated through formal training initiatives to fully understand the various implications of the new developmental local government mandate.

**Recommendation Five:** The empirical survey revealed that there is limited mutual trust between councillors and senior officials. In an effort to remedy this it is recommended that all role-players should strictly adhere to prescribed ethical protocols. Relevant workshops should be held to capacitate both the senior officials and councillors on the need to adhere to all prescribed protocols. Such interventions could be conducted by outside agencies, for example, universities who often have programmes that incorporate conflict resolution and management strategies.

**Recommendation Six:** Certain respondents felt that the reports provided by officials are at times misleading and incorrect. It is recommended that immediate intervention is required to restore trust between all role-players. It is recommended that a “neutral” facilitator, in an appropriate field, should facilitate workshops with both councillors and officials actively participating.

**Recommendation Seven:** The majority of participants indicated that they were not fully conversant with the rules and procedures that govern the municipal council. It is recommended that all councillors should be aware and knowledgeable concerning the rules of procedures of the council. It is proposed that this could be achieved through a series of workshops with a practical component.

**Recommendation Eight:** Both “in-house” and “outside” capacity-building initiatives should be undertaken to capacitate both councillors and the officials. Outside agencies which possess the relevant expertise (such as universities and
SALGA) should be encouraged to also facilitate such capacity building programmes.

**CONCLUSION**

The primary aim of the research for purposes of this article, was to investigate the empowerment needs of councillors from a selected municipality in the Province of the Eastern Cape. The research revealed that capacity development needs in specific areas are urgently needed to enhance basic service delivery. However, based on the empirical survey findings, it can be concluded that the empowerment needs of the councillors at the selected municipality have not received the attention deserved.

**LIST OF REFERENCES**


ABSTRACT

The aim of the study was to look at the relationship between organisational incentive schemes and continuance commitment among final year university students. There were 17 male students and 43 female students. Perceptions of participants regarding organisational incentive schemes and continuance commitment were assessed using the short-term incentive questionnaire, long-term incentive questionnaire, the investment in employee development questionnaire, the employee share incentive questionnaire and the continuance commitment questionnaire. Data were analysed using correlations and multiple regression analysis. The results showed that participants were more interested in organisational incentive schemes that were on a long-term basis and organisational incentive schemes that focused on the career development of employees. Such incentives were associated with good governance necessary for the retention of talent in organisations. There were significant correlations between long-term incentive schemes, investment in employee development schemes and continuance commitment. Multiple regression analysis showed a significant relationship between the predictor variables and continuance commitment.

INTRODUCTION

Incentive schemes have proved to be a key tool in good governance and in ensuring that employees remain loyal to their organisations (Derrick & Bryant, 2013; Morgan, 1997). Good governance is shown in organisations when leaders provide incentive schemes that are associated with employee performance in a transparent manner. The incentive schemes that are commonly provided in South African organisations are: employee stock options, key skills incentive schemes, long service bonuses, profit sharing schemes, productivity bonuses, medical aid schemes, short-term incentive schemes, assisted funeral insurance,
career development programmes, car allowance, cellular phone allowance, travel allowance, housing allowance and other financial-related schemes that are considered to be effective in retaining talent in organisations (Derrick & Bryant, 2013). While organisations may vary in the kind of incentive schemes they offer, their goals in offering the incentive schemes could be similar. That is, they attempt to use the incentives to motivate employees and to retain talent (El-Jardali et al., 2013). Being sensitive to the plight or needs of employees due to the vagaries of the organisational environment prevailing on the local and global labour markets is part of good governance (Bhatnagar, 2007).

The study undertaken for this article sought to assess the perceptions of final year university students about the following organisational incentive schemes: short term incentive schemes, long term incentive schemes, career development programmes and profit sharing incentive schemes. While it is clear that these incentive schemes do not represent the full array of incentive schemes offered by many organisations in South Africa, they could serve as indicators of potential employee preferences or graduate student preferences when they join organisations. An analysis of the responses of students on their perceptions of incentive schemes could reveal a substantial amount of invaluable information on what organisations could do to attract talent from universities. It is for this reason that this study was carried out, to assess final year students’ perceptions of some of the incentive schemes offered by organisations in South Africa.

The rationale for carrying out this study was to establish the effectiveness of incentive schemes that are used in organisations to keep employees with the required skills. Many organisations in South Africa invest heavily in employee attraction and retention schemes (Kock & Burke, 2008). This is done to try and ensure that the competitiveness of the organisation remains as high as possible. However, the problem with some of these investments could be that some organisations do not conduct impact assessment research to establish the usefulness of the incentive schemes in attracting and retaining skilled employees (Hadlock & Lumer, 1997; Jensen & Murphy, 1990; Kock & Burke, 2008). This could be problematic and may well mean that important information regarding the efficacy of the incentive schemes used could remain unknown. This might not be good for both the potential employees and the employer because the employer might not know which incentives work better and employees might not know or like what the employer could give them in return for their good performance (Kostoff, 1995). It should be noted that incentive schemes are offered in the private sector, public sector and in the not-for-profit organisations.

**INCENTIVE SCHEMES**

Incentive schemes are commonly understood to be tools used to arouse employee motivation, enthusiasm and productivity (Kocabiyikoglu & Popescu, 2007; Kraizberg, Tziner & Weisberg, 2002; Milne, 2007). Different incentive
schemes are found across organisations and this might be so because organisations differ in terms of the nature of business, service offered, structure, or size (Milne, 2007). All these factors could therefore influence, to a considerable extent, the kind of incentive scheme structure that could be offered by an organisation. Whatever the reason might be in employing a certain incentive scheme, the intention behind their implementation is, as stated earlier, to boost employee morale and to retain employees with essential skills (Bhatnagar, 2007). Therefore, incentive schemes could be effective in employee retention.

It could be contended that the importance of incentive schemes in organisations is, amongst other things, to attract and retain employees (Gberevbie, 2008). This implies that incentive schemes could be important in influencing prospective employees to join and commit themselves to the prospective employing organisation for a sustained period of time (Cacioppe 1999; Robbins et al., 2003). Another function of incentive schemes could be that of enhancing an organisation’s reputation as a distinguished and desirable place to work for (Romzek, 1990). This could be another aspect of the ability of an organisation to attract and retain prospective employees as influenced by the availability of incentive schemes (Romzek, 1990). Perhaps in the present institutional context of the public and private sectors in South Africa, where there seems to be a critical shortage of capable leaders and where there is endless talk of scarce skills and talent shortages, incentive schemes and other reward mechanisms could provide the much needed competitive edge (George & Sims, 2007; Glen, 2006; Rappaport, Bancroft, & Okum, 2003).

The framework for the incentive schemes in the study was informed by the need to bridge the gap between final year students’ expectations of what they might get in organisations when they complete their studies and what organisations are prepared to offer new graduate employees. Information on organisational incentive schemes is usually displayed on the intranet and it could be found in an organisation’s remuneration policy. It could be argued that the different incentive schemes offered by organisations could be perceived differently by each employee. What could be perceived as a motivator by one employee may be treated differently by another. In view of the above argument it was expected that final year university students could have differing expectations of incentive schemes.

**SHORT-TERM INCENTIVE SCHEMES**

Short-term incentive schemes aim to serve the short-term needs of employees. They are designed for a specific purpose; to meet immediate employee needs. They could be in the form of cash or immediate non-monetary benefits that could be considered essential to employee needs (Condly, Clark & Stolovitch, 2003). If the short-term incentive scheme provides cash, the amount given could be based on the achievement of certain pre-determined corporate, divisional or individual targets (Condly et al., 2003). When the benefits are not financially related, employees could be given restaurant coupons or vacation vouchers (Barker,
Jensen & Murphy, 1988). These short-term incentive schemes, monetary or non-monetary, seek to appeal to the short-term needs of employees and hence they could potentially motivate them to do their jobs with enthusiasm. These short-term incentives could thus promote a high performance culture within organisations and in so doing, make the organisation more competitive in what could be seen as a highly competitive global business environment (Condly et al., 2003). Short-term incentive schemes are found in all sectors of employment and organisations tend to give more incentives to middle management and executives (Grigoriadis & Bussin, 2007).

In an attempt to increase performance and attain higher levels of competitiveness, organisations might make use of short-term incentive schemes (Bhatnagar, 2007). These short-term incentive schemes might have the added advantage of attracting and retaining employees (Bhatnagar, 2007). The short-term benefits might motivate employees in a way that may make them work hard. In as much as short-term incentive schemes could serve as a motivational tool for high performers, the short-term incentive schemes could demoralise poor performers (Barker, Jensen & Murphy, 1988). In view of this argument, organisations may not deny employees short-term incentives basing their decisions on some of the perceptions of employees who do not perform to the required level. In fact, some of the poor performers might improve their performance in order to get the short-term incentive schemes (Barker, Jensen & Murphy, 1988).

In the study undertaken for this article, it was expected that final year university students would consider short-term incentives as important in their career plans. In times of economic difficulties graduate employees might expect to get short-term incentives that could cushion them against economic hardships. These short-term incentive schemes might curtail graduate employee turnover in their first year of employment as is the case in many organisations on the global job market (Bhatnagar, 2008).

**LONG-TERM INCENTIVE SCHEMES**

Long-term incentive schemes are designed to address the long-term needs of both the institution and the employee. These schemes generally employ a monetary or stock-based reward payout (Buck et al., 2003). Long-term incentive schemes are designed to be enjoyed by those employees who remain with an organisation over a long period of time (Condly et al., 2003). Such employees will enjoy the benefits of long service after achieving the goals set by their organisations (Condly et al., 2003). Long-term incentives can run for as long as seven years with most being structured as five-year plans (Buck et al., 2003). In order to receive these incentives employees are usually expected to perform their work in a manner aligned with shareholders’ interests over the stipulated time-frame (Buck et al., 2003; Rich & Larson, 1984). It is usually the shareholders who, in consultation with senior management, determine the length of service and value of awards (Buck et al., 2003).
Organisations could be seen as employing these long-term incentives to try and keep valued employees for a sustained period of time (Kaplan & Norton, 1996). Organisations might believe that some of the employees are essential in the achievement of the set outcomes and might thus provide those identified employees, usually senior management, with long-term incentives that may keep them loyal to the organisation (Westphal & Zajac, 1994). Long-term incentives could, in this light, be viewed as a retention strategy used to keep key employees (Bhatnagar, 2008). The longer an organisation can keep its most productive employees the better its chances of remaining competitive (David, Kochhar & Levitas, 1998).

Indeed, long-term incentive scheme payouts are often quite generous as organisations are keen on maintaining their competitiveness through holding on to essential skills (David, Kochhar & Levitas, 1998). These incentives are packaged in either monetary or stock-based forms that employees receive as they sign employment contracts or when their performance is reviewed (Condly et al.; Westphal & Zajac, 1994). Employee profit-sharing schemes and share option schemes are common in most the blue chip companies in South Africa (Scholtz & Smit, 2012). The stock-based option could be the most popular option because it carries the promise of making employees shareholders while also allowing them to enjoy monetary rewards through dividends earned at the end of each fiscal year (Westphal & Zajac, 1994). Long-term incentives are also usually undesirable for employees who have a habit of changing jobs often without honouring the contractual obligations. They might be required to pay back or forfeit the rewards that they received if they did not meet their targets (Larson & Rich, 1984). Depending on the perception the employee has about their ability, the fact that there might be generous rewards if they comply with the provisions of the contract or that there could be a loss of rewards if they fail to comply, might be appealing to an employee who believes that they would meet the targets but the same conditions might not be attractive to an employee who does not believe in their capabilities (Larson & Rich, 1984).

These long-term incentives aim to provide both the company and its employees with a sense of stability and competitive long-term rewards. It was assumed in the study that final year university students would perceive long-term incentives positively.

**CAREER DEVELOPMENT INCENTIVE SCHEMES**

Career development is recognised as one of the most important strategies of keeping employees committed to an organisation (Lee & Bruvold 2003; Maurer, 2002; Schreuder & Theron, 1997). Investing in employees’ educational or career development is a sign of good governance that could result in the development of leadership qualities among employees. Organisations need leaders with skills and this can be achieved through assisted further studies (such as providing bursaries or study loans) in organisations. Organisations demonstrate good governance by investing in employees through skills development, paying for the employees’
formal education and providing career advancement opportunities for personal and professional growth and development (Lee & Bruvold, 2003). Opportunities for promotion are usually part of the organisation’s career development programme (Lee & Bruvold, 2003). It is those employees who obtain higher qualifications that would be assured of promotion (Holzhausen, 2000). Some organisations provide internal staff development training programmes and organisational-based qualifications (Garet et al., 2001). The fact that organisations spend money on the education of employees could be appreciated by employees and that could result in employees choosing to stay longer with the organisation (Fulmer & Conger, 2004).

Career development is essential for both the individual and the organisation. Internally driven succession management strategies rely on the effective development of junior employees who would in turn be the future leaders when senior managers retire (Fulmer & Conger, 2004). It is pointed out by Jacobs and Washington (2003) that succession planning can be more effective when the organisation has a large pool of junior employees with the relevant qualifications. It was found that career development of employees was associated with organisational growth (Elsdon & Iyer, 1999). In this context, it was argued that organisations that improved the skills base of their employees also realised organisational growth in terms of profitability and economies of scale (Black, Noel & Wang, 1999). The organisation could then be able to attract and retain high calibre employees and it might have the capacity to invest in employee development and growth (London, 1993; Maurer, Pierce & Shore, 2002; Tannenbaum & Mathieu, 1991).

In the study, final year university students were expected to show an interest in further educational opportunities offered by their prospective employers. Some organisations could provide learnership programmes for graduates and that could be more appealing to most of the students in their final year of study. It is not uncommon in South Africa for young graduates to be sent overseas for further training and these might be the kind of opportunities young people may aspire to have.

EMPLOYEE SHARE INCENTIVE SCHEMES

Employee share incentive schemes aim to distribute the profits made by the organisation to the employees who contributed to its success. Employee empowerment can be realised through participation in profit sharing and share ownership schemes. Financial empowerment allows employees to make a contribution to the decision-making processes of the organisations as shareholders. This economic participation could allow greater equality and transparency in the distribution of the income and wealth of the organisation (Kozlowski, 2013). The economic involvement of employees could be perceived by the employees positively as a gesture meant to improve human relations in the organisation (Kozlowski, 2013). The profits are distributed in a manner agreed to by employees and the organisation (Cahuc & Dormont, 1997). These employee share schemes are
seen as rewarding employees who achieve the desired organisational performance targets through the distribution of those profits made as a result of the achievement of the set goals (Cahuc & Dormont, 1997). In short, in working to ensure the profitability of the organisation, employees are made aware that their actions also mean financial gains for them (Harrison & John, 1996). In this sense, employee share schemes could be seen as the most traditional and sensible incentive schemes in terms of their simplicity, clarity and basic motivational models (Estrin, Grout & Wadhwani, 1987). The logic is not hard for employees to comprehend because money can have transactions that can immediately be enjoyed. The employee share incentive schemes may be realised in the form of money given to employees directly (Estrin et al., 1987). If the payout is monetary in nature then an extra cheque is given to those employees who have assisted the organisation in reaching its goals (Cahuc & Dormont, 1997). The precise method of profit redistribution in the organisation varies according to the environmental circumstances in which the organisation is operating. The fact that the payment of the incentive schemes would be in accordance with the terms initially agreed to by both the employer and employee could make the incentive schemes more favourable to the employees and management (Estrin et al., 1987; Kozlowski, 2013; Robbins et al., 2003).

The ability of the organisation to meet its immediate financial obligations in compensating employees could be viewed as a good reason why employees might consider continuing to work for the same organisation for a long time (Cacioppe, 1999; Saleem, 2011). Studies that assess the impact of financial incentives on employee performance mostly show that employees tend to show more organisational commitment (Saleem, 2011). Employee share incentive schemes could serve as a morale booster in organisations. The financial incentives might be construed by employees as not only showing employees how important they are to the organisation because of the income they bring to the organisation by availing their labour, but a reward that stimulates the motivation to work harder and perhaps continue working for the organisation in anticipation of further rewards in the future (Misra, Jain & Sood, 2013; Wilson & Peel, 1991). However, the financial incentives might also prove to be unpopular in some organisations in the public service, parastatals and local government where employees receive bonuses by default at the end of the year without performance management (Hondegem, 2013). Some employees resent financial incentives that are tied to performance and the introduction of performance management systems as part of public service reform or institutional reengineering (Larson & Rich, 1984; Wilson & Peel, 1991).

It would be expected that final year university students would show excitement about the size of the financial benefits offered by the organisations dream of joining. In the South African context, employee share schemes might be viewed as unsatisfactory as they might not be realised when organisations promise financial rewards that sometimes would not materialise due to the unforeseen labour unrest and company closures and the disbandment of certain government departments due
to poor performance. It is common in South Africa for some private organisations that fail consistently to meet their financial obligations to employees to accuse employees of sabotage, laziness or they could claim to be facing viability problems. In such cases employees could be threatened with dismissal if they continued to lay claim to the promised financial benefits or a large number of employees could face trumped-up charges and be laid off or forced to resign in way that could be interpreted as constructive dismissal or unfair dismissal (Vettori, 2012).

CONTINUANCE COMMITMENT

Researchers on continuance commitment suggest that it is a distinct and discernible aspect of the three-component model of organisational commitment developed by Meyer and Allen (1990). It is commonly held that the continuance commitment construct was derived from the “Side-bet theory” proposed by Becker (1960). Becker (1960) argued that the commitment people show is a result of a number of side bets that they make. The side bets are those made in addition to a main bet that employees make regarding certain reward outcomes (Powell & Meyer, 2004). This in essence means that employees could be with one organisation for an extended period of time more than expected not solely because of the monetary rewards, but the perceived side benefits of working for the same organisation.

Continuance commitment essentially presupposes the idea that employees’ allegiance to an organisation is based on the perceptions they have of the incentives they receive from the organisation (Morrow, 1993). Put differently, employees remain with the same organisation because of a perceived need to do so to fulfil certain ambitions that might not be central to the employment contact (Morrow, 1993; Robbins et al, 2003). This perception of incentives by employees is based on their assessment of the costs, anticipated personal satisfaction, financial gain or social benefits associated with the rewards (Allen & Meyer, 1990). Also, the employee will weigh the costs of leaving employment and the consequences of relocating (Morrow, 1993). In this context, it would seem that employees are hence enticed to stay with organisations that provide incentive schemes (Allen & Meyer, 1990; Allen & Meyer, 1993; Morrow, 1993; Ogba, 2008; Reichers, 1985).

Also, Allen and Meyer (1990) highlight how continuance commitment often relates to affect commitment although the similarity between the two constructs is more apparent than real (Allen & Meyer, 1990). That is, studies generally seem to find that the longer employees stay with an organisation, the less important the financial aspects become in influencing organisational commitment. This implies that organisational commitment could be independent of the financial gains. However, incentive schemes might prove to be effective in promoting employee continuance commitment although they too can be weakened by the employee’s value system in the organisation. Continuance commitment has a sound theoretical basis and there have been a number of studies which have shown how it is related to organisational monetary incentive schemes (Becker, 1960; Cohen,
1999; Döckel, Basson, Coetzee, 2006; Ghadamasi, Ndaba, Oni, 2005; Ogba, 2008). An observation made by Glen (2006) highlighting the large sums of money organisations spend in their attempts to attract key employees is important. The investigation of this relationship in the context of talent management is worthwhile and probably essential, given the current interest shown by organisations and professionals in this area (Lewis & Heckman, 2006).

The study conducted was prompted by the fact that incentives could play an important role in the continuance commitment of an employee. Organisations could use incentive schemes as they recruit final year university students in South Africa. Through the isolation and analysis of the incentive schemes that could be used in organisations to attract university graduates, the study sought to further understand the relationship between incentive schemes and organisational continuance.

**TALENT MANAGEMENT**

Talent management broadly refers to the attraction, retention, deployment, assessment and compensation of potential and current employees (Bhatnagar, 2007). Today workplaces are changing rapidly in structure and in character. Employees with scare skills are now more flexible than before to leave at will and join competing organisations without remorse. The change in work practices is gradually eroding the notion of a lifetime employment (Lewis & Heckman, 2006). The change in the global job market is affecting the development of continuance commitment in employees but it is posing a challenge to employees and employers to hone their skills in order to remain relevant in the modern day world (Lewis & Heckman, 2006). The complex, challenging environments that organisations find themselves in largely determine the shift in work design and employee motivation schemes. Bhatnagar (2007) identified some of the aspects of talent management that organisations pursue such as talent attraction, retention and career planning. Mentoring, leadership development, recognition, rewards and compensation are among the other aspects of talent management as delineated by Bhatnagar (2007).

The connections between the different aspects of talent management and organisational development and survival are inextricably tied to one another. The recruitment of talent in universities comes with offer of incentives that can at times raise unrealistic expectations among final year students. Most importantly, however, is the fact that all costs incurred by the organisation in talent management are expected to be recovered when the trained graduate employee would begin to add value when they profitably manage the organisation (Glen, 2006). Universities are considered a reservoir of talent by most of the organisations in both the private and public sectors. It is argued that incentive schemes are built into the talent management strategy of organisations to reward and retain high performers (Bhatnagar, 2008).
There is a perceived conflict and scramble for scarce skills in the business sector in South Africa, considering that there was an exodus of people with skills soon after the end of Apartheid (Robbins et al., 2003). This study was primarily interested in the attraction and retention strategies that would translate into the keeping and promotion of scarce human resources (Kraak, 2005; McGee, 2004). It is contended that organisations which fail to provide incentives could experience a high turnover of qualified employees. Organisations that fail to develop their human capital through talent management and the use of incentives are usually embroiled in controversy when they compete for the rare skills on the job market. Aggressive recruitment drives for employees with scarce skills could result in organisational rivalry and business undercutting. In this context, it could be argued that organisational effectiveness could be a function of the effectiveness of the organisational incentive schemes in retaining talent (Bhatnagar, 2008; Dulebohn, Molloy, Pichler & Murray, 2009; Laff, 2007).

Put differently and perhaps more appropriately, this study investigated the perceptions final year university students had about incentive schemes as part of organisational talent management and how they perceived themselves continuing to work for organisations given the contemplated or anticipated incentives. It is important to clarify that continuance commitment is not considered to be equivalent to talent management. It is however substantially similar to a critical aspect of talent management, namely, retention.

**AIM OF THE STUDY**

The study aimed to assess the relationship between organisational incentive schemes and continuance commitment among final year university students within the context of talent management.

**Hypotheses**

- There is a relationship between students’ perceptions of short-term incentive schemes and organisational continuance.
- There is a relationship between students’ perceptions of long-term incentive schemes and organisational continuance.
- There is a relationship between students’ perceptions of career development schemes and organisational continuance.
- There is a relationship between students’ perceptions of employee share schemes and organisational continuance.

**METHODOLOGY**

The detailed research methodology used for the study is described below.

**RESEARCH DESIGN**

The research design was cross-sectional, non-experimental and correlational.
The study sought to investigate the relationship between incentive schemes and organisational continuance commitment. No cause and effect inferences could be drawn from the results obtained as no variables could be manipulated (Whitley, 2002). The research was cross-sectional as measurements were taken only once. That is, no further measurements followed as would be the case in a longitudinal study where repeated measures are done (Whitley, 2002).

As this study was non-experimental, there was no control group, no manipulation of the independent variables and there was no random assignment of participants (Rosnow & Rosenthal 1999). The study took place in a natural setting where most of the shortcomings associated with research that takes place under experimental conditions were avoided. The research aimed to establish the strength of the relationships between the incentive schemes and continuance commitment. As such, it was a correlational study (Whitley, 2002).

**SAMPLE**

The sample consisted of 60 final year students at a university in South Africa. There were 17 males, (N =17), this was 28% of the study sample and 43 females, (N = 43) which was 72% of the study sample.

A non-probability sampling strategy was used and participation was on a voluntary basis. Participants in the study were students’ who were in their final years of study and these were third students who would graduate with a general degree and fourth year students who would graduate with a specialised degree. The study targeted final year students because they were most likely to be looking for work, registered with the university graduate recruitment and training programme as job seekers. Most of them could have been sponsored by various organisations to complete their studies and therefore it was expected that most of them were looking forward to securing employment with their bursary sponsors. These students were likely to be thinking about possible work opportunities and the aspects of organisational life, monetary perks and social status that might appeal to them. The study sample was part of the larger group of final year students who were targeted by large private organisations, public enterprises, government departments, non-governmental organisations, international recruiters and campus recruiters. Employment agents would visit the university on career exhibition days and they would put recruitment posters all over the university to attract and hire final year students and to provide scholarships to high performing students. In light of this, the final year university students were an ideal group to assess the efficacy of the selected incentive schemes offered by organisations in talent retention. The emphasis of talent attraction and retention in organisations is on targeting young people and this makes the chosen sample especially useful in assessing the perceptions of young people’s interests in incentive schemes offered by organisations.
PILOT STUDY

Prior to the commencement of the study a sample of thirty-five, mostly third and fourth year students were invited to participate in a pilot study that was conducted to determine a tentative Cronbach alpha coefficient of the questionnaires constructed by the researcher. There were three questionnaires, each consisting of 10 items. The participants were told that participation was voluntary and that confidentiality and anonymity were guaranteed as only the researcher would have access to the questionnaires and no personal information would be asked for. Also, participants were told that they would not be advantaged or disadvantaged if they chose to participate or not. Of the 35 participants, 30 fully completed the questionnaires. The results of the pilot study were that the Short-term Incentive Scheme Questionnaire had a Cronbach alpha level of .79 and the Long-term Incentive Scheme Questionnaire had a Cronbach alpha level of .91. The Employee Share Incentive Scheme Questionnaire had a Cronbach alpha level of .91. The Investment in Employee Development Questionnaire had a Cronbach alpha of .92. Huck (2004) explains that an alpha level of .70 and above is significant. It implies that the reliability coefficients determined above were significant and that made the instruments suitable for use in this study.

MEASURING INSTRUMENTS

The measuring instruments used in this research are discussed below.

The biographical questionnaire

The biographical questionnaire was developed to obtain demographic information. The questionnaire asked participants for their age, race, gender and year of study. The data obtained were used for descriptive statistical analysis.

The short-term incentive questionnaire

The questionnaire was developed for this study by the researcher to measure students’ perceptions of short-term incentive schemes offered to employees in organisations in talent management. The questionnaire had 10 items and a pilot study conducted prior to the commencement of the study showed that the questionnaire was suitable for the study. The questionnaire was put on a five point Likert-type scale “with strongly disagree” being coded as 1 and “strongly agree” coded as 5.

The long-term incentive questionnaire

The questionnaire was developed by the researcher to measure the perceptions of students about the effectiveness of the long-term incentive schemes offered to employees in talent management. The questionnaire had 10 items and it was validated through a pilot study. The questionnaire was put on a five point Likert-type scale with “strongly disagree” coded as 1 and “strongly agree” coded as 5.
The investment in employee development questionnaire

The questionnaire was developed by Lee and Bruvold (2003). It was used to assess students’ perceptions of organisational investment in employee career development. The scale has 9 items. It was found suitable for use in this study.

The employee share incentive questionnaire

The questionnaire was developed by the researcher and measured the perceptions of students’ about the effectiveness of the profit sharing scheme offered to employees in talent management. The questionnaire had 10 items. A pilot study validated the instrument for use in this study. The questionnaire was put on a five-point Likert-type scale with “strongly disagree” coded as 1 and “strongly agree” coded as 5.

The continuance commitment questionnaire

This instrument was used to measure students’ perception of continuance commitment in relation to incentives offered in organisations as a talent management strategy. The instrument assessed work aspects that were perceived by students as capable of influencing them to keep on working for an organisation. The questionnaire has 5 items put on Likert-type questionnaire with “strongly disagree” coded as 1 and “strongly agree” coded as 5. A high score indicates high continuance commitment. This test has been widely used in South Africa (Lumley et al., 2011).

PROCEDURE

The study got ethics clearance and got permission from a university to be carried out. Final year university students were invited to participate. All the participants were briefed on the requirements of the study. They were told that anonymity was also guaranteed. The incentive schemes were explained. Continuance commitment was also explained. Upon getting informed consent from the participants, primarily through their indication of a willingness to complete the questionnaires, they were given the questionnaires to complete.

DATA ANALYSIS

Descriptive statistics were obtained using the SAS statistical package. As the study was correlational in nature Pearson’s correlation coefficient was used to analyse the data. The linear regression model was used for further analysis (Huck, 2004). The linear regression analysis had four predictor variables which were: short-term incentive scheme, long-term incentive scheme, employee share incentive scheme and the career development incentive scheme. Continuance commitment was the criterion variable as represented in figure 1 below. The decision to use parametric tests was reached after the data met all the assumptions of a parametric test. These were normal distribution, equality of variance and random independent sampling.
**DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS**

Biographical data were analysed by noting the frequencies of the year of study, age, gender and race of all participants. The biographical data provided a description of the characteristics of the study sample.

**CORRELATIONAL ANALYSIS**

A correlational study examines whether or not there is a relationship between two variables. A correlation was used to determine the kind of relationship that exists between the different incentive schemes and continuance commitment. The range for determining both the correlational strength and direction that exists between two variables is -1.00 to +1.00. A perfect positive correlation (+1.00) indicates that as one variable increases, so does the other. A perfect negative correlation (-1.00) indicates that as one variable decreases the other increases. If no relationship exists between the two variables, the correlation coefficient is 0.00. This technique is parametric in nature. It was used because the data met all of the parametric assumptions. That is, random independent sampling, at least interval data, homogeneity of variance and normal distribution were all established (Meyers, Gamst & Guarino, 2006).

**LINEAR REGRESSION ANALYSIS**

A linear regression analysis was employed to determine which of the incentive schemes best predicted continuance commitment. That is, organisational continuance commitment, the dependent variable, was viewed as the criterion variable. This allowed the researcher to compare the respective relationships of the incentive schemes with continuance commitment and determine which, if any, best predicted continuance commitment (Meyers et al, 2006).

*Figure 1: Predicting continuance commitment*

- Short-term incentive scheme
- Long-term incentive scheme
- Career development scheme
- Employee share incentive scheme
- Continuance commitment
ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Participation in this study was voluntary and participants were free to withdraw their participation at any given point of contact. The study observed ethical issues of informed consent, anonymity and confidentiality.

FINDINGS

The findings are provided below based on the following: descriptive statistics, inferential statistics, correlation and linear regression analysis.

Descriptive statistics

The demographic characteristics of participants relating to gender, year of study and race as captured from the biographical questionnaire are presented in Tables 1, 2 and 3.

Table 1: Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Year of Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of study</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 indicates that third year students made up a large number of the participants. This is mainly due to the large class sizes at undergraduate levels.

Table 3: Race

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>African</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows that all racial groupings in South Africa were represented in this study sample.

Inferential statistics

SAS Enterprise Guide 4 computer software was used to analyse the data. Pearson’s correlations and regression analysis were used to analyse the data. The results showed correlations between incentive schemes and continuance commitment. The regression analysis showed the relationship between the predictor variables, that is, the incentive schemes and the criterion variable, which continuance
commitment. A backward elimination technique was carried out to deal with the possibility of multicollinearity among variables with similar characteristics (Meyers et al., 2006).

**Correlations**

**Table 4: Pearson’s correlation coefficients for incentive schemes and continuance commitment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisational incentive schemes</th>
<th>continuance commitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long-term incentive scheme</td>
<td>r = 0.27 p = 0.05*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short term incentive</td>
<td>r = 0.18 NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee share incentive scheme</td>
<td>r = 0.16 NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee career development scheme</td>
<td>r = 0.25 p = 0.05*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < .05

Table 4 shows that long-term incentive schemes had a significant positive correlation with continuance commitment (r (60) = 0.27, p < 0.05). The correlation between the short term incentive scheme and continuance commitment was not statistically significant (r (60) = 0.18, NS). Also, there was no significant relationship between the employee share scheme and continuance commitment (r (60) = 0.16, NS). However, there was a significant relationship between the employee development scheme and continuance commitment (r (60) = 0.25, p < 0.05).

**Linear regression analysis**

The overall effect of the predictor variables, that is, the organisational incentive schemes, had a statistically significant effect on continuance commitment, the criterion variable (F 4, 55 = 2.70, p < .05). The results showed that the incentive schemes had a statistically significant association with continuance commitment although cause and effect inferences cannot be made since this was a cross-sectional and correlational design.

A further analysis of the relationship between incentive schemes and continuance commitment was done using linear backward elimination. The results revealed that both the employee career development incentives schemes and long-term incentive schemes showed statistically significant relationships with continuance commitment at 5% significance level. Backward elimination showed that both the short-term incentive schemes and the employee share incentive schemes did not show a statistically significant relationship with continuance commitment. The results still confirmed the Pearson correlative analysis which found no statistically significant relationships between continuance commitment and short-term incentive schemes and employee share incentive schemes.
ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

The descriptive statistics provided a succinct summation of the demographic characteristics of the sample. The gender, race and year of study of each participant provided a demographic picture of the study sample. The relationships between the short-term incentive schemes and employee share incentive schemes and continuance commitment were not significant hence the discussion focuses on the relationships between long-term incentive schemes, employee career development schemes and continuance commitment. The results of this study contradict the opinion given by previous studies that short-term incentive schemes contribute significantly to continuance commitment (Bhatnagar, 2007; Conedly et al., 2003). However, the findings of this study are in agreement with other views which do not find a strong relationship between short-term incentive schemes and continuance commitment (Barker et al., 1988; Bebchuck & Stole, 1993). Since this was a student population, their perceptions of the benefits could have relied more on vicarious experience and sometimes unrealistic fantasies that might not be experienced in real work situations unless they attended job previews (Schultz & Schultz, 2006).

The long-term incentive schemes in this study had a significant influence on participants’ continuance commitment. The results confirmed previous studies that long-term incentive schemes can retain employees at work (David et al., 1998; Dockel, Basson & Coetzee, 2006; Kaplan & Norton, 1996). Participants in this study perceived long-term incentive schemes as essential in continuance commitment. They perceived the long-term incentive schemes are capable of influencing their allegiance to the organisation (Morrow, 1993). Participants were more interested in engaging the organisation for longer periods of employment even if research on continuance commitment shows that in postmodern times employees tend to be more interested in changing jobs and redesigning their careers to fit in with the unpredictable global job market (Fulmer & Conger, 2004; Savickas, et al., 2009).

The participants expected their prospective employers to offer them long-term incentive schemes in order to commit themselves to their jobs. They showed awareness that most of the large corporations, international non-governmental organisations and the public service in South Africa offered such benefits to senior and executive employees (Grigoriadis & Bussin, 2007). It was the perception of the participants that incentive schemes in the workplace were part of talent management in which employers sought to offer long-term incentive schemes to new graduate employees as a way of attracting and retaining them (Becker, 1960; Bhatnagar, 2008; Cohen, 1999). The long-term incentive schemes were perceived in this study as an organisation’s long-term talent management strategy that they considered to sustain continuance commitment.

The career development incentive scheme showed a significant correlation with continuance commitment. The results confirm previous findings that career development incentives motivate employees to stay longer in organisations (Elsdon
& Iyer, 1999; Fulmer & Conger, 2004; Garet et al., 2001; Lee & Bruvold, 2003). The students’ perceptions of career development schemes were positive and they looked forward to receiving educational advancements sponsored by their prospective employers. The perception of the participants was that employers should provide educational advancement prospects for career development. Their motive for joining an attractive organisation could be that of self-development so that in turn, the employees become attractive as well to the competitor organisations (Lee & Bruvold, 2003).

Participants in this study could have perceived the career development incentive schemes positively as they might have felt that career development carries with it the promise of greater promotional opportunities and better financial rewards in organisations (Holzhausen, 2000). Also, as the participants were in an academic environment, they perhaps had positive perceptions of the importance of education and the attainment of higher qualifications as an essential attribute of employee professional growth and development (Holton, 2004; Sturges, Guest, Conway & Davey, 2002).

**LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY**

The study had limitations pertaining to the difference between lived work-related experiences and fantasised experiences of what employment entails. The research was conducted among final year university students who did not have the work experience to appreciate the utility of organisational incentive schemes in the context of continuance commitment. The nature of some of the incentives schemes might not have been understood fully in terms of how they helped employees in the workplace. The study was correlational in nature and thus meant no cause and effect relationships among the variables. Given both the nature of the sample and the absence of any sort of participant manipulation, there might have been extraneous variables that could have influenced the results of the study as the conditions to hold them constant were not present.

**IMPLICATIONS FOR GOVERNANCE AND LEADERSHIP**

Organisational human resource needs forecasting can only be successfully achieved when the leaders are clear about the enticement necessary for the retention of talent in organisations. The perceptions of the participants in this study were that organisations that are futuristic in orientation would seek to provide long-term incentives to employees. Ploughing back part of the organisation’s profits or resources into employee long-term incentives and career development was perceived as good corporate practice or good organisational citizenship behaviour essential for organisational sustainability. Good governance comes with long-term planning for employee retention and the nurturing of talent required to lead organisations into the future with confidence. It was the perception of participants in this study that a well-laid out and transparent career trajectory for employees in
organisations could motivate prospective employees to join the organisation and existing employees to stay longer in organisation.

**CONCLUSION**

The findings of this study indicated that the provision of some of the incentive schemes is related to continuance commitment. However, not all incentives are appealing to every group of participants. It was shown in this study that final year university students were more interested in organisational incentive schemes that appealed to their long-term needs and career development. Directions for future research could focus on best practices in the offer of the broad spectrum of incentive schemes locally and internationally in order to have a sense of what could be more useful and effective in South Africa.

**REFERENCES**


Cahuc, P., & Dormont, B. 1997. Profit-sharing: Does it increase productivity


San Francisco. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.


Kozlowski, M. 2013. Employee participation in profit and ownership – Impact


SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT: ASSESSING THE NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

E. Draai
O. Oshoniyi

Department of Political and Governmental Studies, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

ABSTRACT

The level of citizen confidence held in the managerial and political commitment of local government to meet basic needs is low. This lack of confidence also manifests clearly from recurring service delivery protests. This article postulates that the availability of requisite skills at local government, technical as well as administrative, will lead to improved performance in meeting defined developmental goals which would improve citizen confidence held in government. This article will explore the conceptualisation of scarce skills in respect of macro-policy frameworks that seek to improve the availability of skills in South Africa. Secondly, reference will be made to skill acquisition frameworks for local government aimed at skill development. The article will draw on findings from a study conducted that assessed perceptions of skills development held by project managers and artisans in the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering at the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality during 2012. The main finding of this study as reported in this article is that a shortage of critical skills hampers effective strategic leadership for efficient service delivery. Finally, reference will be made to lessons learnt and recommendations are suggested for the acquisition of requisite skills that will lead to improved service delivery.

INTRODUCTION

The mandate of local government includes providing democratic and accountable governance within defined geographic areas. Local government in terms of Section 152 of the Constitution of South Africa of 1996, is a sphere of government that is tasked with the delivery of basic but essential services to communities for the maintenance of sustainable livelihoods. Schedule 4 of the Constitution, stipulates the concurrent functional areas of national and provincial government. Part B stipulates the functional areas of local government as set out in section 155(3). The provision of basic services includes, inter alia, the provision of water and sanitation services as well as electricity and gas reticulation. Schedule 5 Part A sets out functional areas as they pertain to provincial government, inter alia, the management of provincial road, traffic and ambulance services while Part B
sets out the functions of local government which pertain, *inter alia*, to the provision of street lighting, refuse removal, dumping and waste disposal. Local government is furthermore tasked with providing social and economic development within local areas with the assistance of periodically elected politicians and skilled officials whom are permanently appointed in terms of the merit-based bureaucratic criteria.

The availability of competent local government officials who are able to demonstrate performance and managerial leadership and accountability in terms of the mandate of local government is critical to the realisation of strategic local government objectives aligned to the National Outcomes Approach 2009-2014. This approach holds nine outcomes that define performance in particular to the various national government departments. The specific outcome for local government states that the vision for this sphere of government is to achieve responsive, accountable, effective and efficient service delivery and governance.

Competence refers to the inter-relationship between the individual and public institution to meet optimal and measurable performance that leads to service output and outcome. Individual competence is based on characteristics and traits which include skills, knowledge and attitude that will lend to conformance to and compliance with strategies implemented to meet local development. Organisational competence is the integration of individual competence with respect to requisite skills, compliance with the organisational values, emphasis on human resource development, as well as an organisational culture that leads to teamwork that fosters performance by providing strategic managerial leadership. Organisational competence is, however, guided and directed by executive senior management to ensure output and output of services. The implication is that they hold specific competence which enables them the autonomy to control and steer service delivery. Competence is therefore also defined in respect of continuous skill enhancement in terms of training that takes cognisance of change and innovative practices which gives recognition to the evolving needs of society (Le Deist & Winterton, 2005:33).

The article postulates that the availability of requisite skills, both technical as well as administrative, will lead to improved performance in meeting developmental goals which would consequently improve citizen confidence in local government. The theoretical premise of this article is within the ambit of the human resources development and administrative leadership that must be maintained for local government to attract and retain a productive core of scarce skills for the enhancement of a performance-orientated and an accountable local sphere of government.

The article explores a conceptualisation of scarce skills in respect to a number of macro human resource development policies which sets the framework for the improvement of skill availability in South Africa, in particular at local government sphere. The article draws on its empirical findings and lessons learnt from a study
conducted at the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality (hereafter referred to as Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality) during 2012. In this regard, the study assessed the availability of requisite skills in the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering. Finally, recommendations which are derived from the analysis are advanced as an attempt to ensure that the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality is in a position to acquire vital skills that will lend it to improved service delivery.

A BACKGROUND DISCUSSION ON SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS IN SOUTH AFRICA

The South African government is afflicted by a scarcity of skills that impacts negatively on the productivity of the economy as well as on meeting developmental needs. The prevalence of scarce skills can be found at all spheres of government in that positions remain vacant for prolonged periods of time, chiefly because there is a deficit of qualified and experienced talent, either because such individuals are unavailable or do not meet the stipulated employment criteria (Erasmus & Breier, 2009:3). The prevalence of scarce and critical skills is influenced by a number of socio-political issues which include the apartheid history of the country. Msila (2007:146) asserts that the system of education at the time was deficient in promoting equity, participation and accessibility. The prohibition of specific individuals from having access to certain professions, exacerbated by limiting access to education and training, contributed to the lack of highly-skilled, qualified and expert practitioners in many fields. The effects of the apartheid history remain evident.

The level of skill shortage is further compounded by education reforms that have subsequently been implemented and that have not met the intended outcomes. The National Planning Commission’s (NPC) Diagnostic Report (2011) indicated that the poor results in the educational sector are aggravating factors which prohibits the elimination of poverty and subsequently affecting economic growth. The availability of requisite skills has also been affected by socio-economic factors which include emigration of skilled workers due to perceptions of potential marginalisation of particular racial groups on account of the implementation of government policies and statutes such as the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998 (Rasool & Botha, 2011:4).

The Department of Labour has since 2006 annually compiled a National Masters Scarce Skills List which indicates the scarce and critical skills deficit in South Africa. The fundamental importance of this list, which is revised annually, is that it establishes indicators which enable national government to take a focussed approach to skills intervention. It allows the Department of Home Affairs to establish indicators for annual work permits for foreign workers with requisite skills. Furthermore, it allows the monitoring and evaluation of skills intervention programmes (Department of Labour, 2008:9).

The critical skills shortage includes the absence of particular abilities such as...
general management communication and information technology required in the workplace that enable strategic guidance in meeting productivity and service delivery. This means that the type of employees required are highly talented individuals who are able to observe, synthesise and communicate new perspectives and insights, leading to more effective decisions and efficient functional processes and solutions to service delivery. The National Masters Scarce Skills List (2012:3) further differentiates between absolute and relative scarce skills. Absolute scarcity denotes the lack of suitably skilled individuals within a particular occupation. Absolute scarcity takes into account new or emerging occupations where few, if any, individuals have the required skill. The consequence of absolute scarcity is that the private sector as well as government is unable to meet its set performance targets. Relative scarcity, on the other hand, implies that the requisite skills are available: however, challenges inherent in the labour market exist which are compounded by the following:

- Individual choice due to competitive branding as employers of choice and remuneration;
- Socio-geographic location where individuals are unwilling to migrate to areas outside of their own urban boundaries; and Equity consideration: that is few, if any, of the required skills are held by designated groups (National Scarce Skills Masters List, 2012:6).

**MACRO-POLICY FRAMEWORK FOR SKILL ACQUISITION**

National government has developed and implemented a number of macro-policy initiatives and strategies in an effort to improve the quality and levels of skills competence in the technical skills industry in order to facilitate economic growth and development across all sectors of South Africa. These polices include:

- the Joint Initiative on Priority Skills Acquisition (JIPSA),
- the Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa (ASGISA),
- the Human Resources Development Strategy Framework of 2010-30, and
- the National Skills Accord 2011

The Human Resource Strategic Framework Vision 15 is specific to improving performance and service delivery in the public service. It is a strategy which is aligned to the aforementioned macro-policy initiatives. Furthermore, specific to skill enhancement at local government is the Revised National Capacity Building Framework for Local Government 2012-2016.

The Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative of South Africa (ASGISA) was introduced in 2006 in an attempt to enable the government to recognise the factors creating obstacles toward economic progression. Additionally, it is aimed at identifying potential alternative avenues of intervention for increasing the key factor of human capital as a primary driving force in the quest for attaining sustainable economic growth.
The objectives of this policy are to:

• diminish the unemployment rate from 30 per cent to 15 per cent by 2014;
• reduce the level of poverty from one-third to one-sixth of the population by 2014; and
• increase the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) from an average of 3 per cent to 4.5 per cent per annum from 2005 to 2009, and to 6 per cent within the period of 2010 to 2014, thereby generating a 6 per cent growth rate that is annually sustainable (JIPSA, 2008:5).

• The key priority areas within the economy, detected as those which required immediate intervention, for ameliorating the problem of economic growth include education and skills; infrastructure; governance and public administration; sector development strategies; macro-economic issues; and the second economy, along with small, medium, and micro-enterprise (SMME) development. The ASGISA (2008:6) outlined an action plan to address the most significant challenges facing economic growth, which advocated the following:

• The building of strong foundations for scholars within public schooling;
• Placing a greater focus on areas of priority in tertiary education and training;
• Initiating and improving work-based training programmes and scarce skills initiatives; and
• Establishing a joint council within the government to strengthen and co-ordinate activities associated with addressing the skills shortage.

Government developed and implemented the Joint Initiative on Priority Skills initiative (JIPSA) in 2006 to resolve the problem of the skills shortage. It was a short-term intervention initiative to support the ASGISA and to elevate the critical nature of skill shortages to a national debate to allow for the development of appropriate Human Resource Development strategies. Furthermore, it was to concentrate on enhancing the acquisition of priority skills which included engineering and planning skills for industries related to transportation, water and communications. Additionally, it would ensure the availability of skilled artisans for urban development, housing and energy as well as strategic planning and management skills for education and public health (JIPSA Annual Report, 2008:7). The implementation of JIPSA saw an increase in the availability of professional engineers from 2006 to 2008 (JIPSA Annual Report, 2008:13).

HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY FOR SOUTH AFRICA

Human Resource Development is a process by which government invests in the development of requisite skills that will lead to improved performance and economic growth by the initiation of various national strategies. In the South African context the objective of these strategies is to give prominence to and seek compliance by industry and the education sector to capacity building in terms of
skills acquisition and relevant skills renewal in respect of change and innovation. It is incumbent upon government departments to facilitate skills acquisition and renewal via a process of training to meet strategic objectives, change and innovation that will lead to team work by self-reliant knowledgeable employees (Nel, Werner, Poisat, Sono, Du Plessis & Ngalo, 2011:370).

Government developed the National Human Resource Development Strategy (HRDSA 2010 -2030) which subsumed the fundamentals of the JIPSA. The primary aim of this national strategy is to address the availability of skills to meet the socio-economic needs of South African citizens. The specific objectives of this strategy are to:

- reduce the impact of poverty and unemployment in South Africa by skills facilitation;
- promote justice and social cohesion through improved equity in the provision and outcomes of education and skills development programmes; and
- improve national economic growth and development through the improved competitiveness of the South African economy (HRD-SA, 2010: 23).

The National Skills Accord 2011 is a partnership commitment to enhancing skills between business, labour and education to increase in particular the number of artisans required by industry as well as other technical skills. The National Skills Accord (2011:16) to which it is aligned, has eight commitments to improve the availability of skills. The commitments relevant to this discussion are as follows:

- To expand training using existing facilities more fully;
- To make internship and placement opportunities available within workplaces; and
- To set guidelines of ratios of trainees: artisans as well as across the technical vocations, in order to improve the level of training.

Furthermore, the Human Resource Strategic Framework Vision 15 was launched in 2008 and specifically targets improving competence in the public service for improved performance. The strategic framework seeks to:

- promote and support the national skills development agenda;
- ensure a continuous supply of specialist skills and promote their absorption into the public service;
- Address the national skills challenges at all public service delivery points; and
- enable an adequate level of human capital performance in public service organisations that ensures effective service delivery in meeting development imperatives for which the public service bears responsibility (DPSA, 2008:16).

This strategic vision is defined by four pillars with particular outcomes as well as specific outcomes that focus on capacity building that leads to skill acquisition as well as skills renewal. These pillars and specific outcomes are:
• Capacity development initiatives for performance;
• Organisational support initiatives;
• Governance and institutional development initiatives; and
• Economic growth and development (DPSA, 2008).

**THE NATURE AND SCOPE OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT**

Local government is the sphere of government which collectively encompasses a number of municipalities of varying types, strengths and challenges. It is the sphere of government which is the most accessible to communities to respond to local needs within a defined geographical area. The Municipal Systems Act (32 of 2000) section 51 as relevant to this discussion states that a municipality must establish and organise its administration in a manner that would enable the municipality to:-

- be responsive to the needs of the local community;
- facilitate a culture of public service and accountability amongst its staff;
- be performance-orientated and focussed on the objectives of local government set out in section 152 of the Constitution and its developmental duties as required by section 153 its political structures, political office bearers and administration in a flexible way in order to respond to changing priorities and circumstances;
- perform its functions through operationally effective and appropriate administrative units mechanisms, including departments and other functional or business units, and, when necessary, on a decentralised basis;
- assign clear responsibilities for the management and co-ordination of these administrative units and mechanisms; and
- hold the municipal manager accountable for the overall performance of the administration.

The Municipal Systems Act (32 of 2000) further makes provision for the development of an Integrated Development Plan (IDP) which stipulates the objectives to be achieved by a particular municipality for a period of five years. This plan captures the vision of the National Outcome Approach for this sphere of government. The IDP is therefore a strategic developmental plan aimed at integrating and coordinating service delivery at local government. The developmental objectives are defined in terms of programmes and projects that require the availability of a cohort of skilled technical and administrative officials who understand and are able to comply with the functional systems of the municipality to meet intended outputs and outcomes. This plan is revised annually, taking into account progress made or challenges realised via constant monitoring and evaluation. The intention of this plan cannot be realised if a competent cohort of officials is not available (Nzimakwe, 2012:140).
THE IMPACT OF SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS AT LOCAL GOVERNMENT

Local government has been plagued by a number of problems tantamount to poor performance. The *State of Local Government Report* (2009:4) assessed the performance of local government in the nine provinces in respect of its outputs and outcomes. The report (2009:14) indicates that some municipalities have had success in service delivery while the vast majority of municipalities across the country have been plagued with impoverished leadership and management. The impact of ineffective managerial leadership has led to low levels of performance and dysfunctional management of service delivery evidenced by the number of recurring service delivery protests (*State of Local Government Report*, 2009:16).

The problems encountered at local government stem from insufficient capacity due to a lack of scarce skills and persistent high vacancy rates as well as from poor performance management and inadequate training. The high vacancy rates persist because local government is characterised by weak human resource management systems and has ineffective performance management systems. The human resource systems are also said to exercise poor recruitment practices, especially in cases where political deployment system is concerned. In addition, municipalities have deficient abilities to attract and retain technical skilled talent. Ajam (2012:6) recognises the conundrum created by scarce and critical skills, particularly with respect to the availability of technical competence evident at municipal level, especially at district level. However, Ajam (2012:6) questions the relationship between purported vacancy rates and scares skills in respect of funded positions on approved organisational structures. It is argued that the high vacancy rates are not aligned to funded positions particularly at district and local municipalities, consequently these positions are non-existent, a practice which alludes to non-compliance. Ajam (20012:9) indicates that poor performance at municipal level can be attributed to a lack of skills. However, it can also be attributed to a lack of managerial accountability or political dysfunction, or both. Political interference in the appointment and dismissal of employees has become part of an acceptable practice. It is critical at this level that officials and municipal managers are politically aware in that they understand the political context of taking development decisions. However, this political awareness should be differentiated from political commitment to effect administrative obligations that lead to service delivery (Mafunisa, 2001:330). It is critical that factionalism and party political intervention in the appointment of senior officials should be minimised to fast-track appointment in scares and critical skills areas.

THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TURNAROUND STRATEGY

The Local Government Turnaround Strategy (LGTS) was introduced in 2009 as a consequence of the challenges identified in the *State of Local Government Report*. This strategy was introduced to improve the performance of municipalities
and the standard of living for citizens in order to meet their social, economic and material needs, thereby restoring community confidence and trust in government (LGTS, 2009:25). Van Niekerk (2012:58) indicates that this strategy has five core objectives, which include the following:

- Ensure municipalities meet the basic service needs of their communities;
- Build a clean, effective, efficient, responsive and accountable system of local government;
- Improve performance and professionalism within municipalities;
- Improve national and provincial policy, oversight and support; and
- Strengthen partnerships between communities, civil society and local government.

In order for municipalities to realise the intended change envisaged by the LGTS, institutional transformation related to institutional capacity is required for a functional and effective local government sphere. According to Deloitte and Touche (2011:3), the implementation process of fulfilling the objectives of the LGTS has been slow owing to factors which include, the availability of competent technical and managerial capacity within municipalities. Furthermore, insufficient dedicated funding to meet the envisaged transformational interventions. In addition, there is insufficient coordination and support by national and provincial government. Finally, there is transformation scepticism from officials and fatigue as the LGTS is one of a number of transformation and change strategies that have been implemented to remedy the problem issues experienced at local government.

**SCARCE AND CRITICAL SKILLS: NELSON MANDELA BAY MUNICIPALITY**

The institutional capacity and availability of a cohort of competently skilled individuals that are able to display cognitive insight and analysis of specific cases as well as the technical expertise at local government has been cited as having a direct impact provision of basic services (Koma, 2010:114). The National Capacity Building Framework for local government (NCBF) stipulates that capacity at an institutional level is the potential and competency, or lack thereof, within organisations. Organisational capacity is also interchangeably referred to as competence in respect of requisite skills of available human resources who can provide strategic leadership, organisational purpose, hold institutional memory, bring about internal confidence, develop appropriate partnerships, engaged in intergovernmental relations and functions, as well as provide sound financial expertise (NCBF, 2012:4-5). The purpose of the aforementioned framework is to enhance and build the capacity of talent within the local government. It seeks to strengthen municipalities in South Africa in order to deliver on developmental goals (NCBF, 2012:3).

The Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality is located in the province of the Eastern Cape and is a Category A municipality in respect of the prescriptions
of the Constitution of 1996. The category A municipalities are responsible for executing all local government functions within their cities. The Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality Turnaround Strategy (2010:13) identifies a number of institutional challenges relating to governance that impact on service delivery. These challenges include the following:

- The absence of an organisational culture that promotes good governance, operational efficiency and performance excellence;
- Human resources constraints which include the absence of an integrated Human Resources Plan to include competency-based Human Resource Development, manpower forecasting and career planning;
- A cumbersome and protracted recruitment processes;
- Strategic posts at Executive Director levels that remain vacant over extended periods;
- The absence of plans and strategies for the retention of staff;
- A shortage of scarce and technical skills;
- The indiscriminate firing and suspension of officials, especially on a senior level; and

Leadership challenges due to the absence of a full-time municipal manager, resulting in a lack of forward planning and the long-term stability provided by a full-time incumbent.

A study was conducted during 2012 in the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering at Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality. The purpose of this study was to assess the perception of scarce and critical skills held by engineers, project managers and artisans on the level of service delivery relative to requisite availability of skills (Oshoniyi 2012:54). The Department of Infrastructure and Engineering at Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality has five units which are responsible for providing specific services, which include special assignments and strategic operations related to coordination of the IDP as well as municipal infrastructure grants. This Department further renders services such as the provision of water, roads and sanitation to the communities. The study assessed the following aspects:

The commitment of the municipality and the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering to promote skills enhancement in terms of further training as well as empowering new graduates who have joined;
- Contributing factors to scarce and critical skills shortages in the Department;
- The effect of skills shortage on the Department; and
- The availability of a retention programme.

The study assumed research triangulation as a means of data collection. The data collection instruments included both qualitative and quantitative tools. In respect of the qualitative approach, semi-structured face-to-face interviews were conducted with 6 participants who voluntarily engaged in the researcher. These participants included unit heads and managers to gather in-depth insight into perceptions held
among technical staff (Oshoniyi, 2012:60). Qualitative data analysis with the aid of Nvivo 10 software led to the identification of recurring themes. The themes as relevant to this discussion included the following:

- Lack of commitment to appropriate training;
- Lack of commitment to staff retention;
- Lack of mentorship programmes; and
- Poor strategic leadership.

Quantitative data was collected with the aid of a self-administered structured questionnaire on a five-point Lickert scale where the evaluative categories were ‘strongly agree’ to ‘strongly disagree’. The questionnaire assessed workers’ perceptions of training and development as well as the strategic management of the municipality. A total of 45 respondents completed the questionnaire. The respondents were all technically skilled staff, at senior, middle and lower levels of the Department, encompassing engineers, technicians, technologists, process controllers, and motor mechanics. The sample group was significant as they represent many of the scarce and critical skills lacking within the Department. Furthermore, they could provide direct insight in relation to the extent and impact of skills shortage in relation to service delivery.

**DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION**

A number of national policies and strategies have been implemented, including the Local Government Capacity Building Framework 2012-2016, in the light of institutional and governance challenges that are experienced by a number of municipalities. However, the findings indicated the benefits intended by these policies and strategies are not being realised at metropolitan municipal level for a number of reasons. An analysis of the findings indicate that the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality at the time of the study experienced high levels of vacancies at senior management level which have a direct impact on service delivery and developing a conducive organisation culture that is committed to effective and efficient service delivery.

Furthermore, that high vacancy rate of qualified and competent technical talent such as engineers remains evident. The findings indicated that 72.5 per cent of the respondents strongly agreed that there is a shortage of scarce and critical skills within the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering. This shortage of skills includes the absence technical skills such as process control and project management. In addition, the findings indicated a shortage in management and leader skills as well as supervisory skills.

Of the sample group, 18 per cent were female, while 82 per cent were male. The age of respondents was between 35 to 55 years. 33 per cent of the respondents had been in the employ of the municipality for the longest period of time of about 15 years. On the other hand, 42 per cent of the respondents had been employed
by the municipality for fewer than five years. The implication is that staff attrition is limited within the aforementioned group; however, staff acquisition of required skills remains a challenge. Furthermore, the group of respondents employed for fewer than five years do not hold relevant institutional knowledge: this has an impact on the effective and efficient provision of service delivery. Institutional knowledge is critical in ensuring effective and efficient service delivery that leads to compliance with intra-institutional policies and procedures. A perception amongst respondents was that younger technically skilled staffs were generally seeking employment elsewhere than within local government. New recruits were utilising the opportunity to secure the necessary work experience at the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality as a progression potentially to other positions where more lucrative options existed owing to competitive remuneration and perceived institutional instability.

The respondents represented the demographic scenario of the Eastern Cape Province. The significance of the demographics relates to an increase in the availability of technical skills from the black section of the population in respect to the successes that the JIPSA programme recorded from 2008 (JIPSA 2008:10). Table 1 represents the highest qualifications of the respondents from the study:

**Table 1 Highest educational qualification obtained**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National diploma</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate degree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honours degree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters degree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>32.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Oshoniyi 2012*

Respondents were not clear whether the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality has an active retention strategy: only 17.5 per cent indicated awareness of a retention strategy. However, 40.5 per cent of the respondents deemed a skill retention strategy as critical to the sustainability of institutional competence.

Respondents had the perception that factors attributed to the prevalence of skills include the progression policy within the municipality from the year 2000. An interviewee stated that there was a mass exodus of the already limited scarce and critical skilled technical staff from the municipality. This was due to the salary grading system specified in this policy, which was not favourable to the technically
skilled workers, as compared to their counterparts in the private sector, causing workers to source better opportunities elsewhere.

A further issue was the lack of mentorship programmes. However, an interviewee was of the opinion that mentorship was also performed through the guise of learnerships and apprenticeships. Respondents acknowledged that the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality does commit to training its employees. However, the training provided is not technical in nature, but mostly administrative. An interviewee stated:

“…a lot of our training was done in our Design Division. The Municipality Design Division is where all the plans are drawn up. You get skilled in design and drawing and planning, that division many, many years ago, was a total of 20 to 30 people - that division does not exist, zero. …and it started dwindling from 20 to only one which he eventually retired. There’s just no one to assist the technicians.”

The perception held by respondents was held that continuous training and mentorship, particularly of newly qualified artisans, to meet quality standards were not given priority, chiefly because an appropriate and timely training needs assessment is not carried by the Human Resource Development section.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

Government has developed and implemented a plethora of human resource strategies that should lead to increased skills availability in the public sector as well as the economy at large. These strategies give particular credence to the development of specific human resource strategies at local government, taking into account the specific scenario. Local government, however, continues to be plagued by skills shortages owing to a scarcity that persists at a macro level in terms of the availability. It also persists because of internal institutional instability and dysfunction where posts are not filled timeously on account of either cumbersome recruitment procedures or political interference, or both. Equally, staff retention at senior management level is compounded by political interference. The institutional competence at local government is challenged because this sphere is not perceived to be an attractive employment option by a number of younger skilled employees owing to remuneration packages, lack of growth opportunities and support, dysfunctional management and political interferences.

The findings of the study conducted at the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality are consistent with national studies carried out since 2009 and relevant diagnostics reports on the state of local government. The implication is that the subsequent intervention methods particularly relevant to local government are yielding slow results. The study conducted made particular recommendations to the Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality which can be applicable to any other metropolitan municipality. These recommendations include the following:

The development of an institutional culture that will lead to stable administrative
and managerial leadership that lends itself to political awareness to facilitate effective and efficient service delivery in the interest of the local community;

The employment of foreign nationals where a need for scarce and critical technical skills is evident such as in the Department of Infrastructure and Development as mooted by the National Scarce Skills List to fast track service delivery;

The implementation of scarce and critical skills retention programmes for technical staff that would lead to delivery of the objectives envisioned in the local government turn-around strategy;

The provision of support for newly qualified technical staff in the form of on-the-job mentorship. Respondents particularly recommended the re-establishment of a design and planning unit within the Department of Infrastructure and Engineering, as this is a critical aspect of the engineering profession; and

Timely assessment of technical training needs in conjunction with the identification of administrative training needs.

The critical importance of these recommendations is that the requisite skills are available to improve the performance of local government to restore the confidence citizens hold in the political will and managerial competence in this spheres of government.

REFERENCES


STAFF RETENTION IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS: A CASE OF SELECTED SOUTH AFRICAN UNIVERSITIES

R.S. Masango
M. Mpofu
Department of Political and Governmental Studies
Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

ABSTRACT

This article analyses the need for staff retention in Higher Education Institutions with reference to two selected South African universities. It highlights the pros and cons of high employee turnover in these institutions. A content analysis is used to identify mechanisms for staff retention in the selected universities. Policy documents pertaining to the retention of staff in these universities show that both universities have appropriate policy instruments for staff retention. The article notes that in spite of the availability of such instruments, voluntary staff turnover is continuing. The article recommends that in an attempt to reduce high voluntary turnover, university managements should ensure that regular surveys and exit interviews are conducted in their institutions and the opportunities for development and promotion are provided.

INTRODUCTION

The retention of qualified and productive employees is beneficial to any institution for its survival. A high employee turnover could be costly, as well as detrimental to the survival, growth and prosperity of the public institution. Retention of staff is a critical aspect of human resource management which deserves the attention of the management in an institution. This principle also applies to higher education institutions. Staffing has policy implications and therefore its management and application is the responsibility of the leadership of a public institution. For instance in South Africa, the employment equity legislation requires institutions which have not yet addressed equity requirements to employ employees from designated groups. However, there is also the need to retain, as far as possible, all qualified and productive employees for the sake of institutional survival, growth and prosperity. The staff profile and demographics in the historically white South African universities pose a challenge which the management of these universities should address, since most highly-qualified, productive and experienced employees in these institutions are not from the designated groups. As a result, these institutions have often not yet met equity legislation requirements. Although factors such as
the costs of employee turnover and employment equity legislation also have a
bearing on employee retention, the primary purpose of employee retention in the
workplace is to retain productive employees.

This article analyses the retention of staff in higher education institutions, with
reference to two South African universities. Of the two universities selected, one
is a historically white university (University B) and the other, a historically black
university (University A). The names of the two universities will not be identified
to maintain confidentiality. In this article, particular attention is paid to the
concept of employee retention, the need and value of employee retention, factors
influencing employee retention, research methodology, as well as the findings and
recommendations pertaining to employee retention in these universities.

THE CONCEPT OF STAFF RETENTION

Staff retention is a deliberate action undertaken by an employer to retain current
define staff retention as everything an employer does to encourage qualified and
productive employees to continue working for the institution. It is a systematic
effort by employers to create and foster an environment that encourages current
employees to remain in employment by having in place policies and practices that
address the diverse needs of employees (Employee retention, 2005:1). The main
objective of employee retention is to reduce unwanted voluntary turnover in public
institutions (Guma, 2011:7).

THE NEED FOR STAFF RETENTION

Guma (2011:12) states that staff retention has become a serious and complex
problem for all institutions including in the public higher education sector. Phillips
and Connell (2003:xi in Guma, 2011:12) suggest that managing employee retention
and keeping the turnover rate below target and industry norms is one of the most
challenging issues facing institutions. From an institutional perspective, employee
turnover may lead to the disruption of service to clients. In addition, the extra
time and money spent on recruitment and training of the replacements as well as
the added stress of more workload for the remaining staff during the interim are
a few of the consequences suffered by an institution when turnover occurs. From
a societal perspective, employee turnover can also have a negative impact when
it leads to employees with critical and scarce skills leaving the country to work
abroad.

THE VALUE OF RETAINING THE BEST EMPLOYEES

Schuler and Jackson (2006: 219 in Guma, 2011:7) state that recruiting people
to meet an institution’s human resource needs is only “half the battle in the war of
talent”. However, the other half of the battle considers the retention of employees.
Guma (2011:71) suggests that by keeping their employee turnover rates low, institutions gain an advantage over their competitors by reducing overall labour costs and improving productivity. For Moseley, Jeffers and Paterson (2008:53), staff retention is important to institutions, as increased turnover creates instability and puts additional workload and stress on the remaining staff which contributes to increased job dissatisfaction. This implies that institutions should be cognisant that turnover does not only affect staff members who leave, but also the remaining ones. In other words, it could mean that the remaining staff is in a way encouraged to leave as well to avoid carrying the additional workload. Fields (2001:99) suggests that an employer should be attractive to employees to ensure that they voluntarily choose to work for that employer rather than a competitor.

**FACTORS INFLUENCING EMPLOYEE RETENTION**

Employee retention is influenced by various factors which include costs of employee turnover, job satisfaction, critical and/or scarce skills, employment equity legislation, promotion opportunities and unrealistic expectations.

**Costs of Employee Turnover**

According to Cascio (1998:623), there are three broad categories of costs in the basic turnover costing model, namely, separation costs, replacement costs, and training costs.

**Separation Costs**

Separation costs include at least the following three cost elements:
- Exit interview: including the cost of the interviewer’s time and the cost of the terminating an employee’s time.
- Administrative functions related to termination: for example, removal of the employee from the payroll, termination of benefits, and turn-in of institutions’ equipment.

These three cost elements represent the total separation cost for the institution with the departing employee.

**Replacement Costs**

- The eight cost elements associated with replacing employees who leave include:
  - Communicating job availability;
  - Pre-employment administrative functions, for example, accepting applications and checking references;
  - Entrance interview, or perhaps multiple interviews;
  - Testing and/or other types of assessment procedures;
  - Staff meeting, if applicable, to determine if replacements are needed, to recheck job analyses and job specifications, to pool information on candidates, and to reach final hiring decisions;
• Travel and moving expenses, for example, travel for all applicants and travel plus moving expenses for all new hires;
• Post-employment acquisition and dissemination of information, for example, all the activities associated with in-processing new employees; and
• Medical examinations, if applicable, either performed in-house or contracted out.

These eight cost elements represent the total cost of replacing those who leave (Cascio 1998:623).

**Training Costs**

• Training as the third component of turnover costs includes three elements:
  • Informational literature such as an employee handbook;
  • Instruction in a formal training programme; and
  • Instruction by employee assignment such as on-the-job training (Cascio, 1998:623).

Cascio (1998:625) further suggests that measuring turnover costs contributes towards improving management decision making. Once turnover figures are known, managers have a sound basis for choosing between current turnover costs and instituting some type of turnover-reduction programme. One way to reduce turnover, especially among employees who seek opportunities for personal growth and professional development, is to provide training.

**Job satisfaction**

Job satisfaction has been defined in various ways by different authors. For instance, according to Crisp Publications (1994:3), job satisfaction is the fulfilment and gratification that comes from work; it is not money, benefits or vacations. It is the good feeling employees receive from doing work. Robbins (1986:98) has defined job satisfaction as an employee’s general attitude toward his or her job. Hence an employee with a high level of job satisfaction holds positive attitudes toward the job, while an employee who is dissatisfied with his or her job, holds negative attitudes about the job. Robbins (1986:105-106) further finds that job satisfaction is positively influenced by mentally-challenging work, equitable rewards, supportive working conditions, and supportive colleagues. This indicates that job satisfaction of employees could be enhanced when they are given challenging jobs; flexible work arrangements that will suit them and their families; top performers are not overloaded with secondary tasks, and, finally, being rewarded and/or recognised for performing well.

According to Newstrom and Davis (1997:261), as might be expected, higher job satisfaction is associated with lower employee turnover, since the more-satisfied employees are, the less likely are they to go through a progressive process in which they think about quitting, search for a new job and evaluate their alternatives, or announce their intention to quit.
Critical and/or scarcity of skills

According to Robbins, Odendaal and Roodt (2003:16), all institutions have some staff turnover, and if the “right” people are leaving an institution – the marginal and sub-marginal employees – turnover can be positive (also referred to as functional turnover). It may create an opportunity to replace an under-performing employee with someone who has higher skills or motivation; open up increased opportunities for promotion; and add new and fresh ideas to the institution. But turnover often involves the loss of employees an institution does not want to lose, and this is known as dysfunctional turnover. Therefore, employee turnover can have a negative impact when it leads to the loss of employees with critical and scarce skills. This tends to have negative implications for service delivery owing to loss of those skills and the difficulty of finding suitable replacements.

Employment Equity Legislation

In an attempt to address disparities in employment which flow from apartheid and other discriminatory laws and practices, the Employment Equity Act (Act 55 of 1998) has been promulgated in order to achieve equity in the workplace. In terms of section 2 of this Act, this should be done by:

• Promoting equal opportunities and fair treatment in employment through the elimination of unfair discrimination; and
• Implementing affirmative action measures to redress the disadvantages in employment experienced by designated groups, in order to ensure their equitable representation in all occupational categories and levels in the workforce.

The Employment Equity Act defines designated groups as black people, women and people with disabilities. This legislation applies to all institutions within the Republic of South Africa including higher education Institutions. This practice is also recognised and mentioned in the Employee Retention Policies of University A and B. For example, the Employee Retention Policy of University A specifically notes that employers are required to retain and develop employees from designated groups and, decisions of this nature must be taken with due consideration to the university’s Employment Equity Plan and its Affirmative Action Policy.

Development and promotion opportunities

Many employees would like to make progress and develop in their careers. Hence it is unlikely that employees will be satisfied with remaining at the lower levels of an institution for excessively long periods. For the purposes of career and personal development, employees need access to development and promotion opportunities. Therefore, if the institution is not offering those opportunities while there are available alternatives elsewhere, it is likely that it will lose employees in its lower ranks. These employees are likely to include the young, single and newly-appointed since changing jobs could be easier at this stage owing to, among others, low family responsibilities. Therefore, employers should offer staff training
and development programmes; create an environment which is conducive for development and training as well as develop policies for training and development.

**Unrealistic expectations**

According to the expectancy theory, the strength of a tendency to act in a certain way depends on the strength of an expectation that the act will be followed by a given outcome and on the attractiveness of that outcome to the individual (Robbins, 1986:137). This indicates that the relevance of the job applicant’s expectations when he or she accepts the appointment to his or her decision to remain in the employment of the institution after receiving induction and/or some actual experience in the position. The unrealistic expectations and general lack of knowledge that many job applicants have about the position at the time that they receive an offer could have a bearing on whether or not they decide to stay or resign at a later stage. However, often when unrealistic expectations are not realised, the employee may become disillusioned and decide to resign.

**Research Methodology**

Convenience sampling was used to select the two universities for the study. University A is a historically black institution while University B is historically white. Factors like geographical location of the universities, and the researchers’ location during the data collection period of this study, contributed to accessing the information pertaining to the retention of staff in these two universities.

A qualitative research methodology was used for the as the researchers wanted to determine if there were measures in place for the retention of staff in the selected universities. Literature review and document analysis were used to determine if these measures could assist in reducing unwanted turnover in the selected universities.

The official documents pertaining to the retention of staff and other relevant documents were deemed adequate by the researchers for the purposes of this research. These documents included the institutions’ Employee Retention Policies, Attraction and Retention of Scarce/Critical Skills Policies, Detailed Employment Equity and Affirmative Action Plans, and Equity-Based Staff Attrition Policies. Limitations of the study included expenses in terms of time, effort and money in locating, following-up and interviewing staff members who had already left the university. However, it is important to note that the researchers had observed that a substantial number of staff members had voluntarily left the universities in question in the recent past. For instance according to the Human Resource Division records of University A, during the period of this study (January 2012 to December 2012), eighty nine (89) employees out of one thousand and ninety three (1093) resigned from university A. These staff members included employees from both designated and non-designated groups as well as young black academics.
DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

The study found that both universities had employee retention policies which were intended to retain skilled and productive employees. In their policies, both universities also recognised the need to develop and pursue equity targets in line with the South African equity legislation.

Employee retention policy

The study found that both universities had employee retention policies. This indicated that both institutions recognised the importance of retaining their employees. University B’s employee retention policy placed more emphasis on the retention of scarce and critical skills. Its policy was entitled Retention of Scarce/Critical Skills and the contents of the policy also highlighted this focus. Both policies also intended to contribute towards the attainment of the university’s transformation and equity objectives. Both universities’ policies were clearly intended to prevent the loss of competent staff from the university, which could have had an adverse effect on service delivery.

Retention of productive employees

The retention policy of university B was specifically intended to apply to academic and administrative staff members who had been identified as having skills which were both scarce and critical. On the other hand, the retention policy of University A applied to all of its employees. However, both universities’ policies recognised the importance of retaining skilled and competent staff in order to avoid negative consequences, such as poor service delivery, which might emanate from the loss of such staff.

Initiation and approval of the retention of employees

The implementing of the staff retention policy involved various stakeholders in both universities. In University A, the determination and approval of the retention process was a function of line managers and the manager of the Human Resource Management division, whereas in University B, this was a responsibility of an approval panel comprised of top, senior, and executive management which included the Director of Human Resource division. The retention policy of University A did not specify how the retention process was initiated, and, in University B, this was a responsibility of senior academic members of staff and/or members of executive management within divisions and/or departments.

Acknowledgement of the need to retain skilled and productive employees in conjunction with the need to pursue equity targets

Both universities employee retention policies were intended to retain employees while also pursuing the attainment of transformation and equity objectives. This was presented as the main objective in both policies. In an attempt to pursue this objective, University B had an equity-based staff attrition policy whose purpose was to induce increased staff turnover, specifically in the category of permanent white...
males, in order to create an opportunity to increase the diversity of the Institution’s staff profile, which is in line with the Employment Equity Plan targets. This policy was supposed to apply until the Employment Equity targets reflected the regional and/or national demographics.

**IMPLICATIONS FOR LEADERSHIP**

In any public institution, management has a responsibility to ensure that there is effective and efficient utilisation of resources. This includes the human resource management of an institution whose primary responsibility is to facilitate the process of dealing with employee hiring and retention. One of the functions of management is to lead an institution in pursuing its vision and mission in such a way that the set goals could be achieved. Hence management should exercise leadership responsibilities in an institution.

Further, the aforementioned findings of the study show that these universities have policies intended to ensure that there is staff retention. The managements of these universities have a responsibility of exercising leadership in the implementation of these policies such that the process culminates in the attainment of the initially intended objectives since they could be blamed for ineffective implementation of existing policies.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

In spite of the aforementioned findings, it appears that the trend of employees who are voluntarily leaving the selected universities is continuing. The recommendations include the conducting of regular surveys and exit interviews, provision of opportunities for development and promotion, as well as the development and implementation of mentoring and succession plans.

**Policy implementation and/or revision**

The fact that both institutions had policies on employee retention indicated good intentions of retaining skilled and productive employees. However, the mere existence of policy does not guarantee that the intended objectives will be realised as policies need to be implemented. The implementation of best policy practices should be applied to update and amend the policies so that they remain in line with the vision of the institution. This principle also applies to the employee-retention policies since the objectives of these policies might also change in line with the changing needs and demands of the universities. Furthermore, it is important to ensure that employee retention policies provide sufficient guidelines for their implementation.

**Regular surveys on working conditions**

The needs and demands of employees in an institution change from time to time, which is also a societal phenomenon influenced by the leadership style and the context in which the institution is undertaking its activities. Prior to the introduction
of the democratic dispensation in South Africa, undemocratic styles of leadership and governance often prevailed in the country and in various institutions within the country. The democratic dispensation has brought democratic constitutional reforms with human rights and a bulk of legislation which encourages democratic approaches to leadership and governance. As a result, the universities are also required to operate within the framework of the constitutional framework and legislation. Furthermore, the restructuring of universities has led to the merger of various tertiary institutions which subsequently gave birth to new universities. This implies that the rules, practices and cultures which prevailed prior to the merger had to give way to the post-merger ones. Hence, new institutional cultures could be expected from the universities emanating from the mergers.

It is important to regularly determine the prevailing needs and demands of the staff members in an institution. There are various ways and means by which this can be done including interaction between workers’ representatives and management in an attempt to find the views from union members, and open lines of communication among staff members and management as well as meetings in which various issues are discussed. However, these practices often have shortcomings since it is not always possible to give all staff members equal opportunities for participating and having their voices heard. It is, therefore, recommended that to augment these opportunities, regular surveys on working conditions should be conducted to enable employees to express their views about their working conditions. This would also give management an opportunity to identify critical issues which could contribute towards the retention of staff since they would be able to identify issues that needed their attention before they became unbearable burdens which might lead some staff members to quit or resign. Information obtained in the regular surveys should be used to improve the working conditions in the workplace; otherwise the surveys would be futile exercises. The information gathered should be used to create an environment which could enable employees who were in the process of resigning to change their minds and decide to stay.

Conduct exit interviews

When the number of employees resigning becomes excessively high in an institution, it is necessary to ascertain the reasons for the resignations with a view to taking remedial action (Cloete, 1985:263). Cumming (1989:370) identifies that exit interviews are the most commonly used technique to determine the real cause of an employee leaving as opposed to the stated reason. This is a procedure that requires the most tactful application, for human motives are complicated and it is often very difficult to achieve the desired standard of accuracy. Mathis and Jackson (2003:92 in Mdindela, 2009:25) share the same view that exit interviews are regarded as one of the most widely-used type of interview. In this case, an employee may be asked to provide reasons for leaving the institution so that the information would be used to enhance the institution’s retention strategy. The information could also be used to close the gap created by staff turnover.
According to Cumming (1989:370), exit interviews could be used to persuade an employee to withdraw his/her resignation. The interview must be held in private and the employee interviewed assured that it will be treated confidentially. If it proves impossible to interview an employee who has resigned, a questionnaire may be sent to him/her after he/she has left. This may be useful since quitting employees may not give the actual reasons to the employer. Institutions typically obtain qualitative information on turnover through exit interviews and surveys. However, it is important to appreciate that the reasons employees give for their resignations are frequently untrue or only partially true.

Lunn (1992:169) suggests that one way of better understanding the reasons for employees leaving is to conduct a structured exit interview using a set of predetermined questions. The interview can be conducted on a face-to-face basis or over the telephone, either in the last week of employment or after the employee has left. This exit interview is conducted in an endeavour to minimise costs which are caused by staff turnover. Where possible, counter offers should be made to persuade productive employees not to leave an institution. However, care should be taken to avoid the process of counter offers being abused by employees who do not really want to leave, but want to improve their earnings by pretending that they want to leave.

**Provide opportunities for development and promotion**

Provision of opportunities for development and promotion could contribute towards reducing the rate of turnover in an institution since that could promise employees better prospects in the future. Furthermore, placing conditions on trained employees to remain with the institution for a certain period after training as a payback for the development opportunity offered by the employer could also contribute towards the reduction of turnover.

Luthans (2002:121 in Mdindela, 2010:71) identifies that promotional opportunities seem to have a varying effect on job satisfaction. This is because promotions take a number of different forms and have a variety of accompanying rewards. For example, Luthans (2002:121) finds that employees who are promoted on the basis of seniority often experience job satisfaction but not as much as those who are promoted on the basis of performance. Shield and Ward (2001 in Mdindela, 2010:71) also indicate that dissatisfaction with promotional opportunities has shown to have a stronger relationship with turnover among certain categories of employees than workload or pay.

**Encourage and promote communication and transparency**

Encouraging and promoting communication and transparency with regard to developments in the higher education sector, the direction taken by the university in terms of advancing and developing itself, requirements for promotion and availability of promotion opportunities, and rewarding of good performance and loyalty could have a positive contribution towards the retention of employees.
Regular updates about developments in the field/tertiary sector could assist staff members to see their institution as a player in the sector and how it is affected and/or influenced by the developments in the sector in relation to other institutions within the same sector. For instance, if the university is seen to be at the same or higher level compared to its counterpart in relation to conditions of service, it will reduce the desire of staff members to exchange their current jobs with similar positions or those at lower levels in other institutions within the same sector. The direction which the university is taking in terms of advancing and developing itself is also crucial. For instance, the knowledge that issues of concern to staff members are identified and taken care of in the sense of being addressed could give hope which, in turn, could encourage individual staff members to be patient with the university and subsequently give it a chance to address those issues rather than hastily grasp any opportunity that presents itself from another institution.

Promotion opportunities are one of the critical factors influencing young staff members in deciding whether or not to continue working for the same employer. Communication and clear requirements for promotion are important aspects in relation to retention of employees. If the prospects for promotion are perceived to be limited and/or too high for employees to attain, some employees might be demoralised. As a result, if they think that there are better prospects elsewhere, they are likely to consider and perhaps actually leave the institution for greener pastures. It is essential that good performance and loyalty is rewarded in an open and transparent manner. Knowing that good performance and loyalty are rewarded can contribute to good attitudes and improving performance among staff. The fact that staff members can feel that good performance is valued and appreciated is in itself an incentive which could contribute towards encouraging employees to remain with the same employer.

It is also important to dispel unrealistic and false expectations. Therefore, the required and expected performance levels should be communicated clearly to staff members throughout the duration of their employment. This is a crucial aspect which could contribute towards ensuring that staff members do not have unrealistic expectations and/or harbour expectations so that they are eventually demoralised when those unrealistic expectations are not met.

*Maintain a strategic balance between pursuing equity targets and retention of skilled and productive employees*

The equity plan and pursuit of equity targets should be done taking into account that the heart and soul of the university lies with its ability to perform its core functions. Furthermore, it should be recognised that pursuing equity targets and ensuring that the university remains productive are not mutually exclusive. While retaining highly-skilled and productive employees who are not from designated groups is also crucial for continued development, survival, and prosperity of the institution. Therefore, attempts should be made to develop employees from the
designated groups so that these employees become productive, invoke and enjoy a reasonable degree of confidence from university management. Various ways and means should also be developed in an attempt to pursue this strategic balance, for example, mentoring and succession planning.

**Mentoring and succession planning**

Turnover occurs in any institution, both public and private sectors. It is a process which creates scope for internal and external recruitment in an institution. In some cases, turnover is not always unexpected since it is created by employees who retire and those whose contracts expire. Therefore, through mentoring of selected individuals and succession planning a pool of skilled and experienced employees who could fill the vacancies emanating from some resignations can be created. In this regard, it is important to note that succession planning relies on internal recruitment, hence in its development and implementation the shortcomings of the internal recruitment should always be taken into account. For instance, the internal recruitment may deny an institution the injection of new ideas from outside and promote traditional practices of an institution.

However, succession planning can make a tremendous contribution towards the retention of talent in an institutions and it can also ensure that the institutions has the skills it need for its survival (Hills, 2009:8). Development and implementation of a formal succession plan which should be embedded in the promotions policy and communicated to employees could contribute towards the retention of employees and subsequently reduce employee turnover.

**CONCLUSION**

Employee retention is crucial for the development, survival, and prosperity of institutions. In this regard, special emphasis is placed on the retention of skilled and productive staff. However, it maybe possible to induce turnover in order to meet certain objectives, for instance, when there is a need to reduce the number of a certain category of employees and increase another category. For example, when there is an attempt to attain certain specific ratios of employees from designated and non-designated groups.

Employee turnover in an institution is influenced by factors such as costs of employee turnover, employee productivity, employee morale, employment equity legislation, criticality and scarcity of skills, and availability of development and employment opportunities. The study undertaken for this article has found that the selected universities have measures for retention of employees in place. This is manifested through their respective employee retention policies. Noting that unwanted voluntary turnover is occurring in these universities in spite of the existence of these policies, this article recommends the updating and implementation of such policies, regular surveys on working conditions, conducting of exit interviews, provision of development and promotion opportunities, communication and
transparency, creating and maintaining a strategic balance between employee retention and pursuing equity targets as well as mentoring and succession planning.

LIST OF REFERENCES


Official documents from selected universities

Attraction and Retention of Scarce/Critical Skills Policy. 2012.
Employee Retention Policy. 2009.
Equity-Based Staff Attrition Policy. 2009.
CONTRIBUTIONS

Contributions to the *Journal of Public Administration* are invited from academics, experts and practitioners in the field of Public Administration and Management. Before publication, contributions will be subject to adjudication. Contributions must be accompanied by a certificate that language editing had been done by a suitably qualified person.

The *Journal* is intended to provide the widest possible coverage of the various aspects of the comprehensive field of Public Administration and Management. Public officials of all grades and specialities, academics as well as others are invited to submit articles for publication to the Chief Editor.

A variety of contributions may be made to the *Journal*. These include full articles, review articles, viewpoints and research results. It should be noted, however that these articles are weighed differently for the purposes of publication.

**MANUSCRIPTS MUST BE SUBMITTED TO:**

Professor M.H. Maserumule  
Chief Editor  
Tel: (012) 382 9769  
E-mail Address: SAAPAM@tut.ac.za  
Postal Address: P.O. Box 14257  
Hatfield  
0028

**COMMENTS**

Comments on the *Journal* are invited from readers who may address these to the chief editor or to the office of SAAPAM at the same address.